

To: Joint Steering Committee for Revision of AACR
From: Deirdre Kiorgaard, ACOC representative
Subject: AACR3 – Part I – Constituency Review of December 2004 Draft

ACOC is generally supportive of the structure of the December 2004 Draft, although we have offered some suggestions for further change. The consistency work has had a very positive impact on Part I in terms of generalisation, consistency, and non-redundancy, as well as making the rules more explicitly comprehensive. We support the inclusion of general rules for the choice of chief source of information, although we acknowledge that the draft rule needs further work. We have given further suggestions for changes related to consistency, and we trust that the work of the Examples Group will also have an impact in these areas.

We consider the changes to the GMD to be a step in the right direction although further refinement and testing of the proposed GMDs is necessary. We would like changes to the GMDs and SMDs to be considered together.

We consider that the draft could go much further in making the treatment of digital and online resources integral to the code. We suggest that this be done by integrating the rules for digital media into the general rules, by allowing the GMD to indicate that a resource is online, and by revising *A1.7B16 Mode of access* and *A1.8B Standard number* to explicitly mention both URLs and persistent identifiers for online resources. The rules will also benefit from the provision of appropriate examples.

In compiling this response the Australian Committee on Cataloguing sought wider feedback from cataloguing experts and academics in Australia than is usually sought for simple rule revisions, although the response timetable limited how much consultation was possible. ACOC would like JSC to take the need for wide consultation into consideration in relation to drafts of the other Parts of AACR3. It is likely that JSC will need an additional draft of Part I before it can be finalised.

1. Objectives and principles

ACOC considers that this draft on the whole embodies the objectives and principles listed for both the Scope, structure and terminology, and the Functional requirements as listed. Specific areas of concern are referenced below and described in the appropriate sections of this response.

A. Scope, structure, terminology, etc.

Objectives:

Comprehensiveness

ACOC notes that the consistency work has resulted in rules which more explicitly cover a range of resources. We are pleased that assembled collections have been explicitly treated. Please also see our notes on Specificity below.

Consistency

ACOC notes that the consistency work has made good progress with this objective.

Clarity

In general, ACOC considers the draft follows this principle, however please see our comments as follows:

9. *Sources of information.* A1.10A3 Resources with more than one chief source of information

10. *General material designation*

14. *Glossary*

Rationality

In general, ACOC considers the draft follows this principle, however we note that the rationale for the rules is not always explicit. Please also see our comments as follows:

2. *Organisation. Section A.* A1.1F5 More than three

Currency

ACOC notes that AACR2 was based on an assumption that published print resources were primary, and all other resources were treated as supplementary. In AACR3 we would like the general chapter to treat electronic resources as primary, recognising the fact that all types of content can be found in digital form, as can most types of media.

Please also see our specific comments as follows:

2. *Organisation. Section A.* A1.8B Standard number

13. *Note area.* A1.7B16 Mode of access

Compatibility

In general, ACOC considers the draft follows this principle, although it would be useful to specifically state the standards (other than the ISBD) which we are endeavouring to be compatible with. Please see our specific comments as follows:

2. *Organisation. Section A.* A1.8B Standard number (re ISBD(E))

10. *General material designation* re ISBD and MARC

Adaptability

ACOC has no specific comments.

Ease and efficiency of use and format

ACOC considers that the draft will be easier for the novice cataloguer to use. We would like some specific effort to be devoted to making the rules more usable in both electronic and print form.

Principles:**Generalization and non-redundancy**

The consistency work has resulted in a draft goes a long way to meeting these objectives. ACOC notes that further generalisation is possible. Please see our specific comments as follows:

2. *Organisation. Section A* A1.1E, A1.1F1 and A2.7B5.1.

12. *Technical description area* A1.5B1, A1.5B2, A1.5C9.2, A1.5C10, A1.5E4.

13. *Note area* A1.7B15, A1.7B21, A1.7B24.

Specificity

ACOC supports the move towards consistency across types of resources, and the removal of any special rules which modify the general rules without justification. We would like to see references to manuals of interpretation and other specialised content standards added to AACR3.

Terminology

ACOC has no specific comments.

Reference structure

ACOC has no specific comments.

B. Functional Requirements

Objectives:

Responsiveness to user needs

In general, ACOC considers the draft follows this principle. Please see our specific comments as follows:

10. General material designation. Materials for the visually impaired

Cost efficiency

In general, ACOC considers the draft follows this principle. Please see our specific comment as follows:

13 Note area. A1.7B21. Comment 3.

Format independence

ACOC has no specific comments.

Principles:

Differentiation and sufficiency

In general, ACOC considers the draft follows these principles. Please see our specific comments as follows:

2. Organisation. Section A. A1.8B Standard number

Relationships

In general, ACOC considers the draft follows this principle. Please see our specific comments as follows:

2. Organisation. Section A. A1.1F5 More than three

13. Note area. A1.7B9 Edition and history

Representation and accuracy

In general, ACOC considers the draft follows these principles. Please see our specific comments as follows:

2. Organisation. Section A. A1.0F8 Inaccuracies

11. Publication, distribution etc area. A1.4C4 Place of publication

13. Note area. A1.7B24 Numbers

Uniformity

ACOC has no specific comments.

Common usage

In general, ACOC considers the draft follows this principle. Please see our specific comments as follows:

10. General material designations

11. Publication, distribution etc area Elimination of “s.l.” and “s.n.”

2. Organization of the rules

Section A – General rules

Scope and organization of chapter A1 – General rules for description

ACOC's comments in Section 2 of this response cover the scope and organisation of the A1 rules, as well as suggestions for improvements and further generalisation of corresponding rules in later sections. ACOC is concerned that the criteria for general versus supplementary rules is not clear.

A1.0D. Levels of detail in the description

ACOC notes that these levels have not been revised from those given in AACR2, despite the considerable theoretical and practical work on identifying core descriptive elements has taken place since AACR2 was first published. We would like JSC to consider revising these levels for AACR3.

A1.0.F Transcription

ACOC's constituencies have expressed support and appreciation of the way these rules have been brought together.

A1.0F8 Inaccuracies

ACOC considers that the practice of supplying [sic] and the practice of supplying missing letter(s) do not strike a good a balance between representation and accuracy. There is also a loss of uniformity due to the existence of two alternatives.

We suggest the following revision:

A1.0F8. Inaccuracies. In an area where transcription is required, transcribe an inaccuracy or a misspelled word as it appears on the source of information. Follow such an inaccuracy ~~either by [sic] or by i.e.~~ and the correction within square brackets. ~~Supply a missing letter or letters in square brackets.~~ **[1.0F1 (2004 amendments)]**

For instructions on transcribing inaccuracies in the title proper for *resources issued in successive parts* and *integrating resources*, see A2.1B1 and A3.1B1.

A1.0G-A1.0L

ACOC considers that the logic behind the grouping of these rules is not readily apparent. Perhaps it would be clearer if they were given a single heading at A.1.0G, and numbered as subrules. We note also that they partially overlap with the concepts described in A1.0A1 *Focus of the description*.

A1.1B11. Supplied or devised title.

ACOC considers that the corresponding rule for *graphics* (B4.1B11) is covered by this new general rule, and so can be deleted.

A1.1E. Other Title information.

ACOC considers that the corresponding rules for *Resources issued in successive parts* (A2.1E1) and *Integrating resources* (A3.1E1) duplicate instructions given in A1.1 rules, i.e.:

A2.1E1 and A3.1E1 are equivalent to A1.1E

a) re acronyms etc is equivalent to A1.1B7

b) re integral statements of responsibility is equivalent to A1.1E4

c) re names of corporate bodies etc is equivalent to A1.1E6

The final provision regarding recording any information that has not been transcribed in a note is covered by the text of A1.1E3.

A1.1E could be expanded to provide for the treatment of other title information relating to currency by adding this paragraph which has general applicability:

Do not transcribe other title information that consists solely of words relating to the currency of the contents or the frequency of updating.

Any examples needed could be added to the general rule, and the supplementary rules could be eliminated.

A1.1E6

ACOC questions the value of adding “[home page]” to titles consisting solely of the names of corporate bodies, conferences etc.

A1.1F1. Statements of responsibility.

ACOC considers that the corresponding rule for *three-dimensional resources* (B5.1F1) is covered sufficiently by the general rule. Any examples needed could be added to the general rule, and the supplementary rule could be eliminated. If it is thought that the phrase ‘Display or selection of the resource’ is required, it could be considered for inclusion in the Glossary definition of the Statement of Responsibility.

A1.1F5. More than three...

ACOC notes that this rule requires revision to remove the arbitrary limit and provide the option of recording all the persons or bodies named in a statement of responsibility (see the *4JSC/ACOC/I* series). Other issues relating to the Rule of Three in Part II are to come under the control of the Editor (see *4JSC/Restricted/Sec/1* and *4JSC/ALA Rep/1/Rev/3*), but this rule also requires resolution.

A1.4F9. Other dates.

ACOC would prefer that this rule be expanded to explicitly include the examples given under the corresponding rules for *sound* (B6.4F1) and for *moving images* (B7.4F1), and those rules could be eliminated. For example:

A1.4F9. Record any other useful dates (e.g., dates of collection of data, date of a recording, date of the original production) in a note (see A1.7B9 and A1.7B12).

A1.8

ACOC would like JSC to consider expanding the title of this area to include “Key title” i.e. “STANDARD NUMBER, KEY TITLE AND TERMS OF AVAILABILITY AREA”.

A1.8B. Standard number.

Although it was generally agreed that it was desirable for persistent identifiers for online resources to be included in the rules, previous JSC discussions were inconclusive (see *4JSC/ALA/42* series). The major concern was the overlap between number given in area 8 and other numbers given in area 7 (notes).

ACOC notes that the December 2004 draft of the *ISBD(E)* now includes a reference to persistent identifiers, i.e.

“8.1.1 The international standard number (ISBN, ISSN) or other unique, persistent identifier assigned to a resource from an internationally recognized system is given when known (e.g. URN, DOI).”

For reasons of both compatibility with international standards and currency, ACOC would prefer that the wording of this rule reflected the *ISBD(E)* changes.

Suggested wording of a revised rule based on *4JSC/ALA/42* and *ISBD(E)* is:

A1.8B. Standard number or other unique identifier

A1.8B1. Give the international standard number or other unique, persistent identifier assigned to a resource from an internationally recognized system.

In addition, ACOC would also like examples of a 13 digit ISBN and of an ISMN added to this rule. ACOC suggests that the Examples Group be asked to locate appropriate examples.

Scope and organization of chapter A2 – Resources issued in successive parts

A2.7B5.1. Change in title proper. Both parts of this rule have the same provisions, and so ACOC suggests that they could be combined into a single rule, e.g.:

A2.7B5.1. Change in title proper. Make notes on minor changes in title proper that occur after the first/earliest issue or part (see A2.1B12). If scattered issues or parts have a different title proper, make a general note. **[12.7B4.2a]**

Issues for 1999- have title: Annual report on pipeline safety
(Title proper recorded in title and statement of responsibility area: Annual report of pipeline safety)

Issues for Jan. 1928-July 1952 have title: The magazine antiques; issues for Aug. 1952-Feb. 1971 have title: Antiques; issues for Mar. 1971- have title: The magazine antiques
(Title proper recorded in title and statement of responsibility area: Antiques)

Title varies slightly

Some issues have title: SLIS newsletter

Scope and organization of chapter A3 – Integrating resources

ACOC has no specific comments.

Section B – Supplementary rules applicable to specific content

ACOC has given a number of suggestions for the deletion or modification of Section B rules against the corresponding Section A rule number at two places in this response: in 2.

Organization of the rules and in 13. *Note area*.

Scope and organization of chapter B1 – Text

ACOC notes that the content of this chapter i.e. primarily unpublished resources, is not accurately reflected in the chapter title or scope note.

Scope and organization of chapter B2 – Music

ACOC considers that either the name of this chapter should be changed to Musical notation, or the content should be changed to incorporate the relevant rules now given in chapter B6 – Sound.

Scope and organization of chapter B3 – Cartographic resources

ACOC has no specific comments.

Scope and organization of chapter B4 – Graphics

ACOC notes that if our suggestions for generalisation noted elsewhere in this response were adopted, this chapter would be eliminated from the text.

Scope and organization of chapter B5 – Three-dimensional resources

ACOC notes that if our suggestions for generalisation noted elsewhere in this response were adopted, this chapter would be eliminated from the text.

Scope and organization of chapter B6 – Sound

ACOC notes that there is considerable overlap with chapter B2 – Music. There is also some overlap with chapter B7 – Moving images as they both cover performance.

Scope and organization of chapter B7 – Moving images

As mentioned above ACOC notes that there is some overlap with chapter B6 – Sound as they both cover performance.

Section C – Supplementary rules applicable to specific types of media

Scope and organization of chapter C1 – Print and graphic media

C1.5B1 and C1.5B2.1.8. Updating loose-leaves. These rules are equivalent and so one of them could be deleted.

C1.5B2.1 Pages, leaves, etc. The addition of “etc” after volumes does not seem necessary or helpful, and it could either be deleted or the “volume, etc” replaced by resource.

Scope and organization of chapter C2 – Micrographic media

Scope and organization of chapter C3 – Tactile media

Scope and organization of chapter C4 – Three-dimensional media

Scope and organization of chapter C5 – Audio media

Scope and organization of chapter C6 – Projected graphic, film, and video media

ACOC has no specific comments on these rules.

Scope and organization of chapter C7 – Digital media

As noted above, ACOC would prefer that electronic resources were covered by the general chapter wherever possible in recognition of the fact that all types of content can be found in digital form, as can most types of media.

3. Focus of the description

ACOC has no specific comments.

4. Resources in an unpublished form

A1.4C8. No place of publication for unpublished items.

ACOC notes that, although this rule is logical in that an unpublished item does not have a place of publication, the information on where an unpublished item was produced is useful.

General rules (A1.1B11, A1.2A1, A1.4C8, A1.4D9, A1.4F8, A1.7B12.2, A1.7B14, A1.7B30)

Supplementary rules applicable to text (B1.1B11, B1.1E6, B1.4F8)

Rules on resources in an unpublished form from AACR2 omitted from the draft of AACR3

ACOC has no specific comments on these rules.

5. Resources issued in successive parts

6. Integrating resources

ACOC considers that it may be preferable to combine these chapters to remove redundancy and make the rules easier to use.

7. Assembled collections

ACOC considers that this draft marks a major advance in the treatment of these materials from AACR2.

General rules (A1.4C8, A1.4D9, A1.4F8, A1.5B5, A1.5D3)

Supplementary rules applicable to text (B1.1B11)

Supplementary rules applicable to print and graphic media (C1.5D3)

ACOC has no specific comments on these rules.

8. Early printed resources

ACOC has no specific comments on these rules.

9. Sources of information

ACOC is highly supportive of the inclusion of general rules on the chief source of information.

It would remove ambiguity for the cataloguer if a note regarding the source of the title proper (see A1.7B4) is always given when either :

- there are two or more possible chief sources of information, and so A1.0A2 or A1.0A3 apply, or
- the resource lacks a chief source of information, and A1.0A4 applies, or
- the resource is a remote access digital resource, as per AACR2 9.7B3.

A1.0A2. Choice of chief source of information

ACOC would like to avoid the circular reasoning inherent in choosing the chief source of information based on the presence of a title proper, and taking the title proper from the chief source of information. We would also like it to be clear that the source chosen must have a title, e.g.

A1.0A2. Choice of chief source of information. When choosing a chief source of information, give preference to a prominent source on which data that are to be recorded in the title and statement of responsibility area, the edition area, and the publication, distribution, etc., area of the description are formally presented. If the information in two or more such sources varies in degree of completeness, prefer the source that provides ~~the title proper as well as~~ a title for the resource. If there is still a choice, prefer the source which provides the most complete information relating to the title and statement of responsibility area, the edition area, and the publication, distribution, etc., area....

Alternatively it may be better to present this rule in the form of a list.

A1.0A2. Order of preference

ACOC suggests that (iii) in the order of preference for chief source of information should refer to “Information on the physical carrier” rather than “A label permanently affixed to the physical carrier”, as it may or may not be a label.

A1.10A3. Resources with more than one chief source of information

ACOC considers that, for clarity, the word “possible” should be added before “chief source” or “source” in the heading and throughout this rule. The rule describes how to choose a single chief source from multiple possible chief sources.

10. General material designation

Although ACOC agrees with the use of two terms, one for content and one for medium, the specific terms chosen have received a mixed reception within ACOC and our constituencies.

Compatibility with other standards

We note that JSC should notify the ISBD Review Group of the proposed changes, including the use of a compound term in this area.

At present the GMD is given in the MARC format as a non-repeatable subfield h. However, to enhance the utility of the new GMDs it will be important to have them either in separate instances of a subfield h, or in separately defined subfields. ACOC requests that JSC highlight the intention to change GMDs to the MARC community with the aim of implementing appropriate changes in MARC.

Online

ACOC considers that the medium list should include a term signifying “online”. We consider that “online” fits within the definition of “medium” given in the revised Glossary.

We believe that a revised list of GMDs which does not include a term to indicate that the resource is available online is unlikely to be received well by cataloguers, information services librarians or end-users, and will not meet our objective of currency. Without such a term the GMD will not fulfill its role as an early signalling device to the user.¹

GMD as optional

In order to facilitate the sharing of bibliographic records, ACOC would prefer that the GMD be made compulsory rather than optional.

Easily understood scope of terms

If the primary purpose of the GMD is as an early signalling device that assists the user in selecting a resource, the scope of each GMD term needs to be unambiguous. We recognise that this aim is difficult as the GMDs are of necessity artificial devices, but we would prefer where possible to reflect common usage. We would also like the proposed terms to be tested for validity against actual media.

We note that the GMDs are not yet covered by definitions in either the Glossary or scope notes for Section B chapters (see comments at 14. Glossary).

However, although the cataloguer can look at the Glossary definition, the user cannot and so the need for clear scope will remain even if the terms are defined. Terms of particular concern are:

- *Audio and Sound* ACOC is not certain how these terms will be used: for example what GMD would be used for a Digital Audio Tape?
- *Film, Projected and Video*. ACOC is not certain when each of these terms would be used. Is “Projected” intended to be paired only with “graphic”, and “moving image” with either “film” or “video”?

¹ We had hoped that this issue would be highlighted in the introductory document which provided background for the Constituency review (see 4JSC/M/628-652 at 632.16.5).

- *Graphic*. ACOC has assumed that graphic as a content term means something similar to the word “picture”. However, we are uncertain how graphic would be defined as a media, as the terms in the medium list which are applicable to graphic content, i.e. digital, film, micrographic, print, projected seem to cover all the relevant media.
- *Micrographic*. ACOC would prefer that the term used in AACR2, i.e. microform, be retained.
- *Music*. For clarity, if the current scope of this GMD is retained it should be renamed “musical notation”. However, ACOC would prefer that the scope of “music” be broadened to include all music, allowing for GMDs such as [music : print] and [music : audio]. Corresponding changes to the Section B chapters should also be considered.
- *Print*: ACOC is not certain whether the term “print” is intended to cover hand produced resources.
- *Three-dimensional*. Feedback that ACOC has received indicates that cataloguers do not readily accept that three-dimensional is a type of content.
- *Choreography*. Feedback that ACOC has received indicates that cataloguers find it hard to understand the inclusion of this term, both because it has not previously been present, and also because choreography does not exist in the Section B chapters or elsewhere in the rules. Nevertheless ACOC supports its inclusion.

Mutually exclusive lists

ACOC would prefer that the terms in the two lists be mutually exclusive. At present both *graphic* and *three-dimensional* are represented in both lists.

Order of the two terms

ACOC notes that the draft gives the order of the two elements as Content-Medium. ACOC considers that reversing the order to Medium-Content would be more readable, with the Medium element reading as an adjective.

Intrusion in the catalogue record

Some consider the GMD an intrusion in the catalogue record, and note that the use of two terms will make the GMD exceptionally intrusive, e.g. [mixed content : multimedia] is significantly longer than [kit]. However, we note that the way in which the GMD is recorded in the catalogue record need not be the way in which it is displayed to the user.

Materials for the visually impaired

Two changes have been made to the GMDs which affect materials for the visually impaired: the GMD of braille has been omitted, as has AACR2 rule 1.1C1 which allowed for GMDS to be qualified to indicate that they are for the visually impaired. Although provisions remain to describe these materials as part of the technical description (see A1.5C2. Special format characteristics), it may be worthwhile for JSC to seek specific advice on the impact of these changes on the user communities.

11. Publication, distribution, etc. area

A1.4C4. Place of publication

This rule says to complete the Place of publication when it appears in abbreviated form.

ACOC notes that AACR2 rule 4.1F2 allowed for the completion of a name in the Statement of Responsibility area for unpublished materials, but this rule was deleted in the December 2004 draft of Part I as agreed at the October 2004 JSC meeting.

ACOC wonders whether the rules should be more consistent? In both rules the principle of Representation would indicate that the place or name should not be completed. However, completion of the place or name may act as an access point and aid the user in identification and selection of a resource.

A1.4D5. Multiple names. ACOC believes this rule should be updated to include the word “imprint” as this increasingly appears in publications. We offer the following revision which also includes some simplification of the wording of the rule:

A1.4D5. If the resource bears both the name of the publishing company and the name of a subdivision or imprint of that company or a trade ~~name~~ or brand name used by that company, record the that name ~~of the subdivision or the trade name or brand name~~ as the name of the publisher. **[6.4D2]**

[London] : Ace of Diamonds
(*Source of information reads:* Decca Record Company. Ace of Diamonds)

If in doubt as to whether the name is that of a subdivision, etc., record the name of the publishing company as the name of the publisher and record the other name in a note, if considered to be important.

If, however, ~~a trade such a~~ name appears to be the name of a series rather than of a publishing subdivision, record it as a series title (see A1.6). **[6.4D3]**

London : Walt Disney Productions - (Disney
storyteller)
(*Source of information reads:* Disney Storyteller. Walt Disney Productions)

Elimination of the use of “s.l.” and “s.n.” (A1.4C6, A1.4D7)

A1.4C6, A1.4D7. ACOC strongly supports the removal of sine loco & sine nomine as these terms are not helpful to users. However, we also note that this makes material of unknown publication appear to be unpublished. We suggest that a simple English language term such as “unknown” be used instead.

12. Technical description area

ACOC supports the creation of a comprehensive set of general rules for technical description. The inclusion of comprehensive general rules has two important functions: they allow a cataloguer to construct a technical description for resources which have the characteristics of more than one media; and they give the cataloguer guidance in devising a description for any new media which are developed.

The real value in creating comprehensive general rules will become more readily apparent with the addition of appropriate examples to further illustrate the common principles behind the rules.

In recognition of the fact that many digital resources cover several media ACOC would prefer the rules for digital media be incorporated in the general rules.

General rules on extent (A1.5B)

ACOC does not consider that the SMDs can be successfully revised without reference to the GMD revision.

A1.5B1. Number of physical units.

Comment 1

ACOC considers that A1.5B1 could be revised to incorporate the corresponding rule for *digital media* (C7.5B1), for e.g.

A1.5B1. Number of physical units. Record the number of physical units of a physical resource by giving the number in arabic numerals and an appropriate specific material designation taken from Table 1 on page A1-57.

Optionally, record the extent of a **remote access digital resource**, using an appropriate term preferably taken from Table 2 on pages A1-58 and A1.59 *or* a term in common usage. See also C7.5C.

Perhaps some guidance could be given to the effect that the extent should be recorded for remote access digital resources with fixed content (e.g. digital photographs, maps etc.), but only recorded if easily determined for other remote access digital resources.

Comment 2

ACOC considers that the rules for *resources issued in successive parts* (A2.5B1) and *integrating resources* (A3.5B1) could be eliminated and this rule could be expanded to provide for the treatment of resources that are not yet complete, for example:

In describing a resource that is not yet complete, record the specific material designation alone.

Optionally, when the resource is complete, add the number of physical units.

If it appears that publication will not be continued, describe an incomplete set as appropriate. Make a note (see A1.7B13) to the effect that publication has ceased.

A1.5B2. Number of components.

Comment 1

The example for a game uses terms that are not in Table 2. Either the table needs to be revised to include the additional terms, or the wording of the rule changed to allow for the use of other terms. An example of wording based on A1.5B1. para 2 is:

A1.5B2. Number of components. Record the number of components by giving the number in arabic numerals and an appropriate term taken from Table 2 on pages A1-58 and A1-59. If none of the terms listed in Table 2 is appropriate, record the specific name of the unit as concisely as possible.

Comment 2

ACOC considers that the corresponding rule for *micrographic media* (C2.5B2) is covered by the general rule. The rationale for making the recording of components for micrographic resources optional is not clear.

Comment 3

ACOC considers that the corresponding rules for *projected graphic, film and video media* (C6.5B2) and for *digital media* (C7.5B2) are largely covered by the general rule and/or are applicable to a range of resources and so can be generalised.

The final paragraph of A1.5B2 could be revised to allow for the recording of an approximate number as in C6.5B2.1, e.g.

If the number cannot be readily ascertained, record an approximate number. If the components cannot be named concisely ~~or if their number cannot be readily ascertained~~, add (*various pieces*) and *optionally* record the details of the pieces in a note (see A1.7B13). **[10.5B2]**

A paragraph could be added to A1.5B2 to cover parts of a resource with the same number of components, e.g.

If the parts of a resource have the same number of components or approximately the same number of components, add *each* before the specific material designation. Otherwise, record the total number of if they are consecutively numbered or omit the statement of the number of components.

Comment 4

ACOC considers that optional provision of C7.5B2 for *digital media* is covered by the general rule.

A1.5B3. Playing time.

ACOC considers that A1.5B3 encompasses the supplementary rules for *projected graphic, film and video media* C6.5B2.4 and C6.5B3. This could be made clearer by the inclusion of appropriate examples.

General rules on other technical details (A1.5C)

ACOC considers that the rules for digital media do not provide sufficient information on how to record the *Extent* and *Other technical characteristics* of digital resources that parallel print or graphic counterparts, for example :

- a digital text which has pagination, a number of files and a file size
- a digital text which has a file type and illustrations

Either appropriate examples or additional rules (or both) are needed.

A1.5C. Other technical details.

ACOC is pleased to see a more complete general rule as, by highlighting the types of characteristics which it is important to record, the rules will be more adaptable to new media.

A1.5C6. Medium.

ACOC notes that the examples given under this rule, and the examples given at C1.5D1.4. Maps, etc differ in their treatment of manuscript items.

A1.5C9. Illustrative matter. ACOC would prefer that it be made clearer that this rule applies to resources that are not primarily images, in the same way as the rule for sound characteristics has been revised at A1.5C11.

A1.5C9.2.

ACOC considers that this rule may be able to be incorporated into A1.5C10. If retained as a separate rule it would be better placed as the final rule in A1.5C9.

A1.5C10 Colour.

ACOC considers that the general rule might be able to be re-worded to include resources which are primarily images and the corresponding supplementary rules for *print and graphic media* (C1.5C10) and *projected graphic, film and video media* (C6.5C10) could be deleted.

An example of such a re-wording which does not solve all of the issues related to generalisation is:

A1.5C10. Colour. If a resource is primarily illustrative (e.g., graphics, projected graphics, film and video media), give an indication of colour (e.g., *col.*, *b&w*, *sepia*)

If a resource includes coloured or partly coloured illustrative matter, and this matter is considered to be important, indicate this (e.g., *some col.*, *chiefly col.*). Disregard coloured matter outside the illustrations (e.g., the border of a map).

ACOC considers that the rule for *micrographic media* (C2.5C10.1) is contrary to the general rule and should be deleted.

General rules on dimensions (A1.5D)

ACOC has no specific comments on these rules.

General rules on ancillary material (A1.5E)

A1.5E4. Dependant supplements. ACOC considers that this rule could be incorporated into A1.5E1.

Supplementary rules applicable to print and graphic media (C1.5)

Supplementary rules applicable to micrographic media (C2.5)

Supplementary rules applicable to tactile media (C3.5)

Supplementary rules applicable to three-dimensional media (C4.5)

Supplementary rules applicable to audio media (C5.5)

Supplementary rules applicable to projected graphic, film, and video media (C6.5)

ACOC has no specific comments on these rules.

Supplementary rules applicable to digital media (C7.5)

ACOC has incorporated our comments on the supplementary rules against their equivalent section A rule numbers above.

Potential for further generalization of rules on technical description (e.g., X.5C10)

ACOC has incorporated our comments on generalisation with our other comments on specific rules above.

13. Note area

Generalization of rules on notes (e.g., A1.7B15)

ACOC welcomes and values the generalisation of notes, and the inclusion of a general rule wherever possible, particularly for electronic resources.

Potential for further generalization of rules on notes (e.g., X.7B21)

A1.7B9. Edition and History.

ACOC would prefer that this rule be expanded to explicitly cover the provisions currently found in later rules for *sound* (B6.7B9) and *moving images* (B7.7B9), such as the date of original production, country of original release, edition of the work performed, or the history of the recording. Appropriate examples could be included and the supplementary rules could then be eliminated.

However, ACOC notes that this rule is key in fulfilling the principle of Relationships, i.e. “The data included in the description should indicate significant bibliographic relationships between the resource described and other resources.” We expect that this rule may require further revision when the rules for added entries are revised.

A1.7B15. System requirements.

ACOC considers the reference to the later rule for *digital media* (C7.7B15) is unnecessary, and the whole text of C7.7B15 should be given at A1.7B15.

A1.7B16. Mode of access.

One major omission from JSC discussions is whether the information needed to locate and access an online resource (i.e. the URL) belongs in the bibliographic record. We note that the December 2004 draft of the ISBD(E) includes an example of an URL in the Mode of access note. We also note that the MARC format has been revised over recent years to allow the URL to be included in a range of note fields. The title and address of an online resource are common data elements in most if not all metadata schema, and ACOC considers that JSC needs to address this issue for AACR3.

A1.7B21. Contents.

Comment 1

ACOC would prefer that this rule be expanded to explicitly cover the inclusion of statements of responsibility and extent which are mentioned in later rules for *graphics* (B4.7B21) and *sound* (B6.7B21), for example:

Add to each title any statements of responsibility not included in the title and statement of responsibility area, and a statement of extent, when appropriate.

Appropriate examples could be included and the supplementary rules could then be eliminated.

Comment 2

JSC should also consider whether it would be appropriate to also add the following paragraph adapted from the corresponding rules for cartographic resources (B3.7B21), to the general rule, i.e.

If an aggregate resource is described as a unit, make notes on the state of the resource at the time of description and indicate the composition of the complete resource if possible. Record variations between sheets in the resource. Complete this note when the aggregate resource is complete.

Comment 3

ACOC would prefer that the rule on recording titles formally (taken from 4.7B18) be revised. Whether recorded manually by a cataloguer from the item, or using data supplied by a publisher, it is more cost-efficient to take the information from a contents listing. Additional guidance could be provided for cases where the titles differ, for example:

When recording titles formally, take them from a unified source such as a contents list. If the title given on the head of a part differs from that in found in the contents list, and it is considered to be important, record both.

A1.7B24. Numbers associated with the resource (other than those covered in A1.8).

ACOC would prefer that this rule be expanded to explicitly cover the use of an abbreviation etc in association with the number, the case of more than one number, and the case of reprints. These are mentioned in later rules for *music* (B2.7B24) and *sound* (B6.7B24).

For example, text like the following could be inserted between the first and final paragraphs of the rule:

If an abbreviation, word, or phrase designating a publisher is associated with a number, precede the number with that abbreviation, word, or phrase and a colon.

Provide an appropriate word or phrase to indicate the type of number.

If the resource has two or more numbers, record the principal number if one can be ascertained, otherwise record both or all. If one of the numbers applies to the set as a whole, record it first and designate it as such.

The following sentence could be added to the end of the rule:

In describing a reprint, provide the number(s) together with the statement that the resource is a reprint.

Appropriate examples could be included and the supplementary rules could then be eliminated.

Additional general comment on notes

ACOC notes that a number of rules relate to either the item in hand or a particular library's holdings: e.g. A1.7B22, A1.7B28, A1.7B29, A1.7B30. Some general guidance is required on when such notes should be recorded in the shareable part of the bibliographic description (e.g. when the resource is unique, or when the note is required to explain details elsewhere in the description as per C1.5B2.1.15), and when they should not. This guidance could be given either in A1.7 or in the paragraph on notes in the Introduction.

14. Glossary

The following term used in Part I requires a definition: Work.

GMD terms

The definition of General material designation given in the Glossary will need to be changed to indicate that the GMD may be a composite term.

The following GMDs are not defined in the Glossary:

choreography
data
mixed content
moving image
sound
software
three-dimensional

audio
digital
film
micrographic
multimedia (defined as phrase only)
print
projected
three-dimensional
tactile (defined as phrase only)
video (defined as phrase only)

15. Style

Tables of contents for chapters and areas

ACOC would like a contents page for Part I to be included.

Captioning of subrules

ACOC would prefer that rules be given a heading whenever it is reasonable to do so, so that the rule is included in the contents listing. For example A1.5D2 could be captioned **A1.5D2**.

Resources in a container.

References to related and supplementary rules

ACOC has no specific comments.

Clarity of instructions and Terminology

For ease of both comprehension and later translation, ACOC would prefer that any new text in AACR3 use simple English words whenever this would not result in the loss of meaning, e.g.:

- the phrase “pertaining to” which is used in a number of rules could be replaced by the words “for” or “on”.
- the term “comprising” could be replaced by “in” in phrases such as “comprising two or more parts” or “containing” in other phrases.

Changes made to some AACR2 terminology, e.g. “accompanying” to “ancillary” and “microform” to “micrographic” have no apparent benefit.

We would also encourage the use of simple sentence structures, e.g.: “In most instances access points need to be added to the descriptions before they are usable as catalogue entries.” is easier to read than “Those descriptions need, in most instances, access points added to them before they are usable as catalogue entries.”.

Additional comments: Numbering

ACOC notes that the numbering of the sections will be revised and simplified when the content is finalised. ACOC would also like the paragraphs in the introduction to be numbered.

16. Typographical and grammatical errors, etc.

| Page | Rule | Paragraph/ example and comment |
|-------|---------|---|
| A1-54 | A1.5 | Contents. A1.5C5 is in a different font size. |
| A2-7. | A2.4F1. | 2 nd para Example 3. Example gives “Ceased publication in ...” when all other similar notes say “Ceased in ...”. |

Additional comments: Examples

ACOC notes that the AACR3 Examples Group will review examples. ACOC would prefer that the number of examples provided in the text be limited to those required to achieve the objectives noted in the group’s Terms of Reference *5JSC/Chair/1*. Consideration could be given to separately publishing a book of examples for different types of resource.