

5JSC/RDA/Full draft/Chair follow-up/5
2 February 2009

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA

From: Margaret Stewart, Chair, JSC

Subject: RDA: Resource Description and Access – Full Draft – Review by the ISSN International Centre

These are comments on the full draft of RDA received from the ISSN International Centre.

Comments from the ISSN International Centre on the Full draft of RDA

Françoise Pellé, Director, Alain Roucolle, Head of the Bibliographic Section

February 2, 2009

General comments

The following issues represent our main general comments.

1 - Difficulties in the use of RDA for a specific type of resource like serials or integrating resources.

The cataloguing rules for the treatment of serials are scattered in many different parts and chapters, and have also multiple references (e.g., a: see c; c: see f). Furthermore they are indicated in different parts and levels of entities (sometimes manifestations, sometimes expressions or works).

2 - Better application in the identification of the resources.

Identification of the resources is a legitimate task assigned to RDA. This task would be more accurately performed if the rules on identifiers include recommendations and stipulations to use correctly and in all cases the appropriate identifiers, not only the identifiers present on the resources. For example ISSN are assigned to serials and managed in an authoritative data base, the ISSN Register. If an incorrect ISSN is printed on the publication, a useful recommendation would be to search for the correct ISSN in the ISSN data base so as to be able to record it.

3 - Needs to clarify the use of the entities (work, expression, manifestation) in relation to the type of resources like serials.

In the text it appears that some works are treated as serials with specific rules, the level "expression" is used to establish relationship between different language editions of a resource, while the majority of the serials are catalogued as manifestations. These different levels of entities in the cataloguing of serials are difficult and complicate the application of the rules.

Specific comments

Chapter 1

1.1 Terminology

- Absence of the term “continuing resource” which is a type of resources defined in the Consolidated edition of ISBD, in the ISSN Manual, in the ISO Standard 3297 on ISSN, and in other cataloguing rules. Omission of this term goes against the stated goal of compatibility with international standards and against 0.10 International Content. An explanation of the differences between finite resources and continuing resources could be provided in this section.
- The last paragraph indicates that “guidelines and instructions” are given in chapters 2- about the treatment of “resources that exhibit characteristics of serials, such as successive issues, ..., but whose duration is limited”. It is not completely clear in these chapters that the rules for serials should be applied to these kinds of resources.

1.1.5 Work, Expression, Manifestation, and Item

- These conceptual definitions leave the reader with many questions about how to apply them to resources they are cataloguing. A practical application of these terms, completed with examples, is needed.

1.3 Core Elements

- It is confusing that the elements (Earlier variant title and Later variant title) are listed in the core elements, without precise explanations about their application, for integrating resources and serials.
- The rule about “Publisher’s name” recommends “if more than one, only the first recorded is required”. We suggest to record all publisher’s names which are indicated on the resources.
- The absence of the “place of publication” as core elements is problematic for ISSN, because the place of publication is used to determine the country of publication: the designation of the ISSN Centre, which assigns the ISSN, is based on the country of publication.

1. Changes Requiring a New Description

- Clarification is needed to explain when a serial is catalogued at the level of a work, at the level of an expression and at the level of a manifestation, because different elements are applied at the different levels. Furthermore the rules on the changes are based on these different elements, and so new descriptions would be made in some cases of entities and not in other cases of entities. We remain attached to the application of a main aspect of the harmonization between the cataloguing standards, which is to ensure the one-to-one correspondence of the bibliographic records.

1.6.2.1 Change in Mode of Issuance of a Serial

- The reference 2.14 seems to be wrong, 2.13 seems to be appropriate

1.6.3.1 Change in Mode of Issuance of an Integrating Resource

- The reference 2.14 seems to be wrong, 2.13 seems to be more appropriate.

Chapter 2

2.3.9 Key Title

- It is proposed to use the complete definition of the key title, indicated in the ISO standard and in the ISSN Manual “The unique name for a continuing resource, established by the ISSN Network and inseparably linked with its ISSN”. We suggest also to add the following note “The key title can be the same as the title of the resource (title proper); or, in order to achieve uniqueness, it can be constructed by the addition of qualifying element such as name of issuing body, place of publication, edition statement, etc.”

2.3.9.2 Sources of Information, and, 2.3.9.3 Recording Key Titles

- It is recommended to specify that the main authority data base for the key title is the ISSN Register. It is suggested to indicate that the preferred source for key titles is the ISSN Register.

- In the large majority of the continuing resources, the key titles are not indicated on the resources themselves. The key titles are available in the ISSN Register or directly from the ISSN Centre which has assigned it.

2.3.10 Abbreviated Title

- We suggest including the “abbreviated key title” which is established in the framework of the ISSN Network and based on the abbreviation of the key title.

2.3.10.2 Sources of Information

- We suggest indicating that “abbreviated key titles” are available in the ISSN Register.

2.7.1.5.2 Serials, and, 2.8.1.5.2 Serials, and, 2.8.1.5.3 Integrating resources

- The use of the notes to record the changes of the place of production is problematic in the record (see our comment on 2.20 Notes).

2.15.1.2 Sources of Information

- We suggest adding: If an identifier is registered in an authoritative data base that is readily available, that should be the preferred source for the identifiers.

2.15.1.6 Incorrect Identifiers

- The rule recommends to record incorrect numbers, if they appear on the resources. In addition to the incorrect numbers, with appropriate terms like “incorrect”, we suggest recording also the correct identifier, and in particular when an authoritative data base of identifiers is available to the catalogers.

2.20 Notes

- The large use of notes in specific fields of notes is problematic to update the bibliographic data for the cataloguing of continuing resources. As a rule the elements, which allow to catalogue continuing resources, can change and be updated. Therefore it would be relevant to have the possible updated bibliographic information in the same fields as the basic elements with different subfields.

2.20.4.5 Change in Edition Statement

- This rule seems to indicate that all changes in edition statement are minor. This would be out of harmony with ISSN rules and ISBD rules for major changes since ISSN rules indicate that there is a major change when the edition statement changes in such way as to indicate a significant change in the resource.

Chapter 17

17.4.2.1 Identifier for the Related Work, Expression, Manifestation, or Item

- We suggest adding an example with ISSN- L, which is a new function to collocate and group the different medium editions of the same resource, according to the new ISO Standard 3297. Proposed example :

ISSN-L 0895-6308

ISSN-L is designated for the print and the online editions of the serial “Research technology management”.

17.9.1.3 Recording a Manifestation of an Expression

- We suggest adding an example of manifestations of expressions with two ISSN assigned to an English and French editions of a serial. Proposed example:
ISSN 1563-0439 is assigned to the English edition “Trends in the transport sector”
ISSN 1562-2401 is assigned to the French edition “Evolution des transports”

Chapters 24-28

- We appreciate that these chapters often use ISSN and key title to identify related resources. We suggest adding that the “preferred access point” for serials and ongoing integrating resources is the key title whenever one is available.

Annex

A Capitalization

- **A.4.1 General guidelines** The expression “capitalize the first word” seems to mean “capitalize the first letter of the first word” according to the examples.