

To: Joint Steering Committee for Revision of AACR

From: Canadian Committee on Cataloguing

Subject: **RDA: Resource Description and Access Part I – Constituency Review of January 2006 Draft of Chapter 3**

CCC has reviewed the RDA – Draft for constituency review (January 2006) part I, chapter 3 and offers the following comments.

References have been made to some examples if they relate to clarification of the rules themselves. In those instances when examples are also affected, the comment is followed by *Also Examples Group*.

General comments

Although consistency in wording is desirable, CCC notes that in some cases, such as for sources of information, the result is not logical, e.g., 3.6.2.2, 3.6.6.2.

Several guidelines include examples in parenthetical statements within the text of the instruction that are repeated as “real examples” in exactly the same form. Although these rules also appear in AACR2 this way, the AACR2 examples include other elements of extent to make the examples more meaningful than just the term. However, the structure in RDA does not lend itself to including other elements. Unless an explanatory note is given (e.g., 3.6.5.3, first bullet, exception), should the terms be retained both in parentheses and as real examples? E.g., 3.6.1.3, 3.6.3.3, 3.6.3.4, 3.6.3.5, 3.6.5.7, 3.6.5.9, 3.6.5.9, 3.6.5.10. *Also Examples Group*

Specific comments

3.1.4, final bullet: Should there be a provision to allow for a separate physical description of a part of a resource comprising two or more carriers? Cf. 3.4.0.9. and AACR2 1.10B.

3.4.0.3: There does not appear to be any particular order of the formats here; should it be alphabetical?

3.4.0.3, *Printed resources. Scores, parts, etc.*: Instructions on how to describe scores or parts in more than one volume have not been included (e.g., 1 score (2 v.)).

3.4.0.3, *Projected graphic resources, Stereographs*: It was noted that stereographs are viewed by reflected light and are not always projected and would be better placed under *Graphic resources*.

3.4.0.3: Add a new category for “Dual discs, etc.”—Record the extent of a resource comprising two or more different media in a single carrier as instructed in 3.1.5 [renumber existing 3.1.5 to 3.1.6]. -- *also mentioned in 5JSC/Chair/6/Chair follow-up (GMD/SMD Working Group: proposal for Content and Carrier Terms in RDA)*

3.4.0.5, bullet 5: The last part of the sentence should read: “...followed by the approximate number of subunits in each in the form *ca. 20 overlays each*, etc., in parentheses.”

3.4.0.7: Can *loose-leaf* apply to any other type of unit other than v.? If so, then examples should come up with one. *Also Examples Group*

3.4.1.1: Instructions on how to describe broadsides, sheets and portfolios have been omitted.

3.4.1.2, heading: Columns are mentioned in the rule caption but not in the rule itself even though pages and leaves are mentioned explicitly. Columns should either be deleted from the caption or mentioned in the rule.

3.4.1.5, last bullet: Add as last sentence: Make a note of the imperfection (see 6.2.0).

3.4.1.14 and 3.4.1.15: The use of the semi-colon is not addressed in either rule.

3.4.1.14, option: “page resource” should read: “paged resource”.

3.4.2.1: CCC finds *miniature score* misleading and would prefer to use *study score* instead, as used in ISBD(PM). *Study score* is deemed preferable since it is indicative of the purpose of the resource rather than its actual dimensions.

3.4.5.5: Should a reference also be made to 4.7.0.3 to give playing time in a Contents note?

3.5.0.3 and/or 3.5.0.4: Suggest adding an option to allow the use of metric measurements (cf. AACR2 0.28) as follows:

Optionally, substitute metric measurements for nonmetric measurements when:

either a) in the course of time a metric measurement becomes the normal measurement for the materials in question

or b) the rules are being used in a country where only metric measurement are used.

3.5.0.3, Manuscript resources, scores, parts, & maps: Add a comma between “etc.” and “in.” in both instances.

3.5.0.3, Audio resources: What is considered to be “height” and what is “width”? In AACR2, the “typical” dimensions are not expressed as height x width, only given as standard dimensions with the larger dimension given first.

3.5.0.3: Revise all “millimeter(s)” to “millimetre(s)” to be consistent with the spelling of “centimetre(s)”.

3.5.0.4: See comment at 3.5.0.3.

3.5.0.7a: Delete the last paragraph as 3.5.6.4a is not needed. We cannot come up with a situation where a note is necessary since changes in dimension appear to be covered in the first instruction at 3.5.0.7a.

3.5.6.4a: See comment at 3.5.0.7a. Only 3.5.6.4b is required or is the instruction at 3.5.6.4a given here just to be consistent with other “Change” type instructions? If 3.5.6.4a is necessary, then an example is needed to illustrate a situation when it is “considered to be important”. *Also Examples Group*

3.6.3.3: Since photocopies of manuscripts (3.6.3.5) are an exception to this rule, suggest adding:

Exception:

Record the method of production or reproduction of manuscripts following the instructions in 3.6.3.5.

3.6.4.3, bullet 2: The terms in the e.g., are not in italics. Should this instruction be in the same form as the instructions at 3.6.1.3, 3.6.3.3, 3.6.3.4?

3.6.5.4: To make clear that *analog* and *digital* can only be used for discs and tapes, the following rewording is suggested:

Record the type of recording (i.e., the way in which the sound is encoded).

analog

digital

magnetic

optical

For a disc or tape, record *analog* or *digital*.

3.6.5.9: Should there be full stops after each of the terms in the list (only quad. has a full stop)?

3.6.5.10: Suggest that this be an option.

3.6.6.3: The instructions and presentation of illustrative matter are at odds with the presentation at other elements, e.g., sound characteristics. ***Also Examples Group***

3.6.7.3, first bullet: The first part seems intended to cover both directives to record col. ill. and to record colour printing (such as microform in colour), but the distinction and the various combinations (such as from 11.5C3 for microform) are not all clear. Suggest for greater clarity, to start a new paragraph for the last line: For photographs, slides, This will allow separation of examples into two groups. ***Also Examples Group***

3.6.7.3, bullet 2: The reference should be to 3.6.13.7 (not 3.6.13.3) colour for motion picture. Should there also be an equivalent "colour" for video-recording? Cf. 3.6.13.8.

3.6.13.9: As there is a reference from 3.6.12.4 to 3.6.13.9, there should be a reciprocal reference to 3.6.12.4 from 3.6.13.9.