

TO: Joint Steering Committee for Revision of AACR

FROM: Hugh Taylor, CILIP representative

SUBJECT: **Categorization of content and carrier**

Related document: 5JSC/Chair/6/Chair follow-up

The GMD/SMD working group focused its work on the reasons why this information is required (dealing with issues such as: search parameters, results display citations, full record display). CILIP is broadly supportive of the current proposal, but notes that there are some places where it doesn't seem to work satisfactorily when tested against real items. CILIP has tried matching the examples used by the working group against these proposals, just to see what happens. Some content/carrier combinations are covered better than others. The results are included as an appendix to this response; points of doubt or concern are indicated.

3.2. Assuming an environment in which some, if not all, services are going to want to include "media category" in any output display, and taking into account the potential value of "media category" in filtering searches, CILIP wonders what users would make of the category "unmediated". Is this a helpful term? On the other hand, is any alternative, even if one can be identified, likely to be any better?

3.3. The carrier list for unmediated media does not include any terms for "object" etc. If all such terms were listed, it would be very long as it could potentially contain any type of object potentially. CILIP doesn't feel that the use of "other", as instructed in 3.3.0.2.2, is adequate; it suggests instead that the "unmediated" group includes a note and perhaps a token object type or two (fossil, model, coin) by way of example.

The working group report noted specific issues to do with music notation. The music community needs to be able to differentiate between scores, parts and sheet music. Even at a more basic level, some printed music would fit the definition of a "book" (according to footnote 6); a smaller quantity could be categorised as "sheet". It doesn't look as though the current proposals serve printed music adequately, but this is an area where specialist input would be most welcome to inform JSC thinking.

As a more general point, CILIP suspects that it may be necessary to allow carriers to be specified in greater detail. While a system may be able to pull data in from the carrier element to display along with author, title and content in order to produce results displays, it may be impossible (or much more difficult) if some of the necessary information is held in "production method" or "other technical details" elements or sub-elements.

4.2. CILIP feels that the user needs to be forewarned of the existence of what are essentially “additional instructions” for computer programs, datasets, etc. and cartographic content. Perhaps this could be done in some way at the end of the first sentence of 4.2.0.2.1?

There is no obvious content category for “choreographic notation” used to record dance and action sequences, unless it is intended to be covered by “image”. “Choreographic” was one of the broad content terms in the list prepared by the working group.

Appendix: CILIP attempt to match GMD/SMD examples to categorization in the current proposal.

Prokofiev, S. / Romeo & Juliet. Decca, 1998

Content	Media	Carrier	<i>Extent</i>	
performed music	audio	audio disc	1 audio CD	

Shakespeare, W. / Twelfth night. Macmillan, 1971

Content	Media	Carrier	<i>Extent</i>	
text	unmediated	book	22 p.	

Shakespeare, W. / Twelfth night. Hasselman, 1883

Content	Media	Carrier	<i>Extent</i>	
text	microfilm	microfilm reel	1 reel	

Detailed road map of Guernsey. RNIB, 1999

Content	Media	Carrier	<i>Extent</i>	Other tech details
tactile image (cartographic)	unmediated	sheet	1 sheet	Braille key

Chopin, F. / Nocturne in E flat major, op. no.2. Paxton & Co., 1929

Content	Media	Carrier	<i>Extent</i>	
music notation	unmediated	<i>book</i>	20 p.	

Wikipedia. Wikipedia Foundation, 2001-

Content	Media	Carrier	<i>Extent</i>	
text	digital	online	10,000 p.	

The Canadian Players presenting Shakespeare's As you like it. 1958

Content	Media	Carrier	<i>Extent</i>	
spoken word	audio	audio tape reel	2 reels	

As you like it / designed by Hatch & Co., NY., c1989

Content	Media	Carrier	<i>Extent</i>	Production method
image	unmediated	sheet	1 sheet	lithograph

As you like it / director, producer & editor, Christine Edzard, 1992 [video VHS]

Content	Media	Carrier	<i>Extent</i>	Other technocal details?
moving image	video	video cassette	1 cassette	VHS

Statues of civil rights leaders. 2005

Content	Media	Carrier	<i>Extent</i>	Dimensions
three-dimensional form	unmediated	<i>other???</i>	6 statues	

Relief model of Andes mountains

Content	Media	Carrier	<i>Extent</i>	Dimensions
three-dimensional form (cartographic)	unmediated	<i>other???</i>	1 model	

Choreographic notation for Swan lake, Royal Ballet production 2000 [Labanotation system]

Content	Media	Carrier	<i>Extent</i>	
???	unmediated	sheet	80 sheets	

Rowling, J.K. / Harry Potter and the chamber of secrets. Marlborough: Cover2Cover, 2000. [DAISY digital audio file]

Content	Media	Carrier	<i>Extent</i>	Other tech details
spoken word	audio	audio disc	1 disc	DAISY 2.02 Full audio structured by chapter

Bennett, Arnold. / Letter to Marguerite Soulie. [manuscript letter]

Content	Media	Carrier	<i>Extent</i>	Production method
text	unmediated	sheet	2 sheets	ms