

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA

From: Marg Stewart, CCC representative

Subject: **RDA: Resource Description and Access Part A – Constituency Review of March 2007 Draft of Chapter 3**

CCC has reviewed the March 2007 draft of chapter 3 and offers the following comments:

Punctuation within elements:

Category 1

We agree to the addition of a general instruction in chapter 1 that internal punctuation should be used as necessary for clarity.

Category 2

We support treating all these instances as separate sub-elements for the reasons stated in the covering letter.

Category 3

We propose that three different methods be used to convey this type of information: 1) square brackets (for agencies who wish to retain the traditional and most succinct way of conveying such information), 2) descriptive words that may mean a longer description, and/or 3) notes, which could result in a clearer description.

[93] pages

approximately 100 unnumbered pages

1 volume

(unpaged)

Abbreviations

We propose that a general instruction be given to permit the use of abbreviations for all elements that are not to be transcribed, e.g., duration. We would also prefer that an appendix containing a list of abbreviations be included in RDA although we note that some abbreviations have been included in the instructions, e.g., rpm, ips, fps.

Specific Elements

Media type, Carrier type, and Content type

CCC agrees to the use of the term “volume” to replace “book”.

Recording media type (3.2)

CCC agrees that Media type should be an element in RDA.

Changes in carrier characteristics (3.21)

The distinction between a “change in carrier” versus “changes in carrier characteristics” is not clear. The explanation in this paragraph appears to address the former (i.e., a new description is

not required if a resource changes carrier) and the reference to 3.21 in the heading suggests that a change in carrier is to be recorded in a note. It should be made more obvious when a new description is not required even when a resource changes carrier. If this information is given in the introduction, there should be a reference to it at 3.1.6. How does this relate to 3.1.4 (Resources consisting of more than one carrier)? For example, a print serial becoming an online serial would only require one description with the changed carrier characteristics provided in a note. Is that the intention?

Specific questions for Constituencies

3.5.0.4: Both dimensions should be given. For consistency, dimensions of the face of all cartridges, cassettes, and reels should be given.

3.5.1.0 and 3.5.1.1: More than one set of dimensions based on the instructions in 3.5.2.1.3 should be allowed.

3.5.2.0: No comment.

3.5.3.3: No comment.

3.12.0.3.1: No consensus within CCC.

Specific comments:

3.1.4: A “comprehensive description for a resource consisting of more than one carrier” appears to be applicable to a serial issued in print and then changing to an online resource. Is this correct?

The relationship between 3.1.4 and 3.5.0.6 is not clear given that the heading “Resources consisting of more than one carrier” is the same. At 3.5.0.6.6, there is a reference to 3.1.4b for a resource consisting of more than one type of carrier, but only in regard to recording dimensions. See also comments above at **Changes in carrier characteristics (3.21)**.

3.1.5.2: Suggest that “or” be changed to “and” to read as follows:

For an online resource that is complete (and if the total extent is known), record the extent (see 3.4).

3.4.0.3.1d.3: There is inconsistency between 3.4.0.3.1d3 and 3.4.4.18.1 with regard to sheets. 3.4.4.18.1 does not give the option of adding the number of pages, etc., after the number of sheets. Suggest the following rewording:

For a resource consisting of more than one volume, sheet, portfolio, or case, record the number of volumes, etc., followed, by the number of pages, etc., in parentheses, as instructed under 3.4.4.15–3.4.4.19 if the resource consists of volumes, portfolios, or cases.

3.4.0.7: In cases where a carrier type presents content in a format that parallels that of a printed, manuscript or graphic resource, instructions at 3.4.2.0.2, 3.4.3.0.2 and 3.4.4.0.3 allow specifying the number of subunits appropriate to the format it parallels. However, 3.4.0.7 limits this to computer discs, cartridges, etc., and online resources whereas 3.4.2.0.2, 3.4.3.0.2 and 3.4.4.0.3 have no such restrictions. Suggest either adding a single general provision to replace the specific provisions at 3.4.0.7.1a.1 and 3.4.0.7.1e.1 in order to generalize them to all carrier types (not only

to the ones specifically mentioned in rule 3.4.0.7), or adding similar provisions to the other types of units. Suggested revisions follow:

3.4.0.7.1a.1:

1) If a general provision is added, the following changes, including renumbering of the paragraphs, would be necessary:

a) Computer discs, cartridges, etc.

~~If the resource consists of a file(s) in a format that parallels a print or graphic counterpart (e.g., PDF), specify the number of subunits by applying the instructions for extent of cartographic resources (see 3.4.1), notated music (see 3.4.2), still images (see 3.4.3), and/or text (see 3.4.4), as appropriate.~~

~~1 computer disc (184 remote sensing images)~~

~~1 computer disc (xv pages, 150 maps)~~

~~For other types of files (e.g., audio files, video files, data files), specify the number of files using a term(s) listed under 3.20.0.4 to designate the file type.~~

(Remainder unchanged.)

OR

2) If a generalized statement is not made, suggest changing the instructions as follows:

If the resource consists of a file(s) in a format that parallels a print, manuscript, or graphic counterpart (e.g., PDF), specify the number of subunits by applying the instructions for extent of cartographic resources (see 3.4.1), notated music (see 3.4.2), still images (see 3.4.3), and/or text (see 3.4.4), as appropriate.

(Remainder unchanged.)

3.4.0.7.1d.1:

If generalized statement is not made, suggest adding at 3.4.0.7.1d.1 a provision similar to those at 3.4.0.7.1a.1 and 3.4.0.7.1e.1. 3.4.0.7.1d.1 would then read:

d) Microfiches

If the format of the resource parallels a print, manuscript, or graphic counterpart, specify the number of subunits by applying the instructions for extent of cartographic resources (see 3.4.1), notated music (see 3.4.2), still images (see 3.4.3), and/or text (see 3.4.4), as appropriate.

3 microfiches (1 score (118 pages))

For other resources, specify the number of frames.

(Remainder unchanged.)

3.4.0.7.1e1:

1) If general provision is made, the following changes, including renumbering of the paragraphs, would be necessary:

e) Online resources

~~If the resource consists of a file(s) in a format that parallels a print or graphic counterpart (e.g., PDF), specify the number of subunits by applying the instructions for extent of cartographic resources (see 3.4.1), notated music (see 3.4.2), still images (see 3.4.3), and/or text (see 3.4.4), as appropriate.~~

~~1 online resource (68 pages)~~

~~1 online resource (3 scores)~~

~~1 online resource (36 photographs)~~

~~For other types of files (e.g., audio files, video files, data files), sSpecify the number of files using a term(s) listed under 3.20.0.4 to designate the file type.~~

~~(Remainder of unchanged.)~~

OR

2) If a generalized statement is not made, suggest changing the instructions as follows:

If the resource consists of a file(s) in a format that parallels a print, manuscript, or graphic counterpart (e.g., PDF), specify the number of subunits by applying the instructions for extent of cartographic resources (see 3.4.1), notated music (see 3.4.2), still images (see 3.4.3), and/or text (see 3.4.4), as appropriate.

3.4.0.7.1e1, 2nd example: The example “1 online resource (3 scores)” introduces some confusion. When cataloguing printed scores, “1 score” is used either for scores in more than one volume or for scores in one volume containing more than one work. In the case of notated music in electronic form, would the number be based on the number of files or the number of works? How would this practice be reconciled with that for printed resources?

3.4.0.8: Suggest that the wording parallel 3.4.0.4:

If the exact number of subunits is not readily ascertainable, record an approximate number preceded by *approximately*.

3.4.1.0: Equivalent instructions to 3.4.2.0.2, 3.4.3.0.2, and 3.4.4.0.3 are lacking for cartographic resources even though the provisions at 3.4.0.7.1a and 3.4.0.7.1e indicate that there should be parallel instructions for cartographic resources.

3.4.1.4: It is not clear how one makes the connection to enclose in parentheses the number of volumes and/or pages, etc., when specifying the subunits for an “atlas”. Cf. specific instructions at 3.4.2.1.2.

3.4.2.1.1: Given that the earlier CCC proposal to replace “miniature score” with “study score” was not agreed to, the term “miniature score” should at least be retained. It is important for users to know that the music has been reduced in size and might not be appropriate for performance. Dimensions alone are not adequate since the size of the resource does not always correspond to

the size of the music itself (e.g., when a score is reproduced 4 pages to a page). Additionally, a score of contemporary music reduced in size might be larger than many full scores and in such a situation the dimensions would not indicate the size reduction.

3.4.2.1.2: Suggest adding the following example to parallel the example at 3.4.1.4.1 “1 atlas (1 volume (various pagings))”:

1 score (1 volume (unpaged))

3.4.2.1.2a.1: Suggest that the instructions allow for specifying the number of volumes for parts; revised wording follows:

If the resource contains a set of parts, record the number of parts ~~but omit~~ and the number of volumes but omit the number of volumes and/or pages, leaves, or columns applicable to the parts.

(Remainder unchanged.)

3.4.2.2.1: It is incorrect to give sheet music as an example of “resources other than scores and parts” since some sheet music are indeed scores and can be described as such. Suggest that the term be deleted as follows:

“For resources other than scores and parts (e.g., choir books, table books, ~~sheet music~~), record the extent by giving the number of units and an appropriate specific term.”

(Remainder unchanged.)

3.4.2.2.1, 2nd example: The square brackets should only enclose the number “50”:

1 table book ([50]pages)

not

1 table book ([50 pages])

3.4.4.9.2: The current practice is to describe folded leaves in a score, part, etc., as such. There does not seem to be any justification for this exception; suggest deleting this instruction.

3.4.4.13.2: Instead of “folded sheet”, suggest using “folder” which is more commonly used.

3.4.4.13.2a.1: Notated music is sometimes issued as a folded sheet and should be recorded as such. By not describing these as folded sheets would introduce confusion as to which instructions apply, i.e., the instructions for sheets vs. those for volumes. There does not seem to be any justification for this exception; suggest deleting this instruction.

3.4.4.7.1b: To address the see also reference from 3.4.4.2.2, suggest adding “or unnumbered” as follows:

record the number of pages, leaves, or columns in the main sequences of the pagination and add the total number, in square brackets, of the remaining variously numbered or unnumbered sequences

3.5.0.4.1b: For consistency, the dimensions of the face of all cartridges should be given. Currently only the dimensions of an audio cartridge are to be given.

3.5.0.4.1b, 3.5.0.4.1c, and 3.5.0.4.1i: Is the term “gauge” (i.e., width) specific to film, filmstrip and videotape cartridges? If not, suggest that this term be used consistently throughout when referring to the width (i.e., gauge) of the film or tape, especially since all the AACR2 chapters (6, 7, 8, 9, and 11) have now been collapsed at 3.5.0.4.

3.5.0.4.1c: For consistency, dimensions of the face of all cassettes should be given. Currently only the dimensions of audiocassettes, computer cassettes, microfiche cassettes are to be given.

3.5.0.4.1i: For consistency, the diameter of all reels should be given.

3.5.0.4.1k.1: In AACR2 a distinction is made between sheets that are designed to be read in pages when folded and other folded sheets. For the former, only the height is recorded as illustrated in the example at rule 3.1.4.1b.1 (p. 3-6):

sheet
1 folded sheet (4 pages)
22 cm

However, this distinction has not been made in RDA; suggest reinstating it by rewording the instruction as follows:

Record the height × width of the sheet, excluding any frame or mount. If applicable, make a note on the size as framed or mounted (see 3.5.3.3). If the sheet is designed to be read in pages when folded, record only the height of the sheet when folded. For other folded sheets, record the height × width when extended followed by the height × width when folded.

(Examples would need to be revised.)

3.5.0.5.1: Suggest that the instructions specify how the dimensions for a container are to be given, i.e., height × width × depth.

3.5.0.6.2: For the sake of simplification, suggest deleting this instruction since the general instructions at 3.5.0.4.1k.1 could be applied to manuscripts as well.

3.5.0.6.6: Given that there is a reference from 3.5.0.8.1a to 3.5.0.6.6, does a print serial that becomes an online journal fall into these instructions? Is such a resource “a resource consisting of more than one type of carrier”? Or does this reference to 3.5.0.6.6 from 3.5.0.8.1a apply only if it involves a change in dimensions for a resource issued in successive parts? See also comments above at **Changes in carrier characteristics (3.21)**.

3.5.2.2.1: To be consistent with cartographic guidelines, suggest that this instruction apply to images that are less than half the size of the sheets on which they are printed (cf. 3.5.1.3.1).

3.9.0.3.1: Suggest adding the term *ozalid* to the list of production methods.

3.17.0.4.1: This element is not about the recording method as its heading indicates (this information is provided in a note per 3.17.1.3) but is about the playback method required to use the resource (e.g. a CD player vs. a turntable). Therefore suggest that this element be merged with the element “Special playback characteristics” (3.17.0.10) and the heading be changed to

“Playback characteristics.” If this suggestion is not accepted, suggest that the heading at 3.17.0.4.1 be changed to “Basic playback characteristics” to clear the confusion that the heading “Type of recording” creates.

For the sake of clarity and ease of use, request that wording be added to explain that, at least for resources consisting primarily of sound, “analog” and “digital” are to be used for discs and tapes and “magnetic” and “optical” for sound track films. Since tapes are magnetic, the current wording could create some confusion.

There is also some concern that the terms listed might be ambiguous when used for resources that do not consist primarily of sound. Suggests that a different list be provided for these resources where the word “sound” would be added to those terms, e.g.:

analog sound
digital sound
magnetic sound
optical sound

3.17.0.5.4: The unit of measurement should be changed to *centimetres per second*. The instructions and examples to read:

Record the playing speed of an analog tape in ~~inches per second (ips)~~ centimetres per second (cm/s).

~~7 1/2 ips~~ 19 cm/s
~~15/16 ips~~ 2.4 cm/s
~~3 3/4 ips~~ 9.5 cm/s

3.20.0.5.1: Suggest that the list of formats presently given under *Image encoding formats* be split as follows:

Image encoding formats: GIF; JPEG; TIFF; and *add* BMP

Spatial data formats: Arc/info; CAD; EOO; MID/MIF; and *add* BSQ; BIL; DEM

GIS should not be in either list as GIS is a Geographic Information System, not a file format.

4.2.0.2.2: For consistency, suggest that there be a separate content type for “three-dimensional still image” for resources such as holograms, architectural 3-d digital images, etc.

4.9.0.3.2: If “plate” is considered a type of illustrative content, (AACR2 definition relates only to pagination), glossary definition would need to address this.

4.12.0.3: Suggest adopting the format using colons for brevity instead of “h.,” “min.” and “s.,” e.g. 40:00, 3:23, etc.

If that is not agreed to, suggest instructions regarding abbreviations for units of time (similar to those at 3.5.0.3.2) be given here, e.g.,

Abbreviate terms for units of time in accordance with the instructions in appendix B, as applicable.