TO: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
FROM: John Attig, ALA Representative
SUBJECT: Proposed revision of RDA 2.1.2.2 and 2.1.2.3, Basis for Identification of the Resource

An ALA Task Force has been working to revise the guidelines and instructions for Basis for Identification of the Resource (RDA 2.1) and for Sources of Information (RDA 2.2). The Task Force has confirmed a perception that these guidelines are confusing and difficult to apply. The Task Force continues to work, but has recommended that some issues should be resolved as soon as possible so that the revisions are available when RDA is implemented in 2013. ALA agrees with this recommendation. Although the proposed revision may be imperfect, we feel that it is important for the JSC to consider the issues raised, and hope that collectively the JSC constituencies can agree on revisions that will make immediate improvements to the current guidelines and instructions.

Recommendations

This proposal deals with the guidelines for Basis for Identification of the Resource, and addresses several concerns with the current text of RDA 2.1.2.2 (Resources Issued as a Single Unit) and 2.1.2.3 (Resources Issued in More Than One Part).

Recommendation #1: Collective Titles

ALA recommends that language be added to both 2.1.2.2 and 2.1.2.3 that instructs the cataloger to prefer a collective title when available. This change is justified by the Principle of Representation: “The data describing a resource should reflect the resource’s representation of itself.” In many cases, the data identifying the resource as a whole (i.e., a collective title) appears only on sources that would otherwise not be given preference, such as the container for a sound recording.

Recommendation #2: Predominant Work

ALA recommends that language be added to both 2.1.2.2 and 2.1.2.3 that permits the cataloger to use a source of information for a predominant work to represent the resource as a whole. This change is also justified by the Principle of Representation. It is typical for the sources of information for a videorecording to emphasize the feature film when the recording also contains additional works such as trailers, interviews, etc. We believe that sources of information emphasizing such a predominant work are intended to represent the resource as a whole and should be treated as such.

Recommendation #3: Resources Issued in More Than One Part

ALA believes that the categories in RDA 2.1.2.3 need to be modified for the sake of clarity. Specifically, a distinction needs to be made between resources manifesting a single work and
resources manifesting multiple works. Furthermore, the concept of sequential numbering needs to be clarified. The revisions to the categories in 2.1.2.3 include the following:

- Add a new category covering single works as category a).
- Retain the existing category a), now slightly reworded and renumbered as category c).
- Modify the existing category b), replacing “not sequentially numbered” with “numbering that is not suitable for producing an ordered sequence” and renumbered as category d).
- Separate the existing category c) into two new categories b) and f).
- Remove language in current category d) stating that “the concept of ordered parts is not applicable” and replace it with language stating that “numbering is not considered significant”) [new category b)]
- Separate current category d) into three separate instructions: new categories b), e), and f).

Proposed revisions:

2.1.2.2 Resource Issued as a Single Unit

When preparing a comprehensive description for a resource issued as a single unit (e.g., a textbook in one volume), choose a source of information identifying the resource as a whole. If the resource manifests multiple works (e.g., a compact disc manifesting multiple works), prefer a source that bears a collective title.

If there is no source of information identifying the resource as a whole, but one source bears a title identifying a main or predominant work or content (e.g., a single videodisc containing a feature film along with trailers, outtakes, interviews, or other material related to the feature film), consider that source to identify the resource as a whole.

If there is no source of information identifying the resource as a whole and no source bears a title identifying a main or predominant work or content (e.g., a single videodisc containing multiple feature films but with no source of information identifying the resource as a whole), treat the sources of information identifying its individual contents as a collective source of information for the resource as a whole.

2.1.2.3 Resource Issued in More Than One Part

When preparing a comprehensive description for a resource issued in more than one part (e.g., a series of scientific treatises, a periodical, a compact disc set), choose one of the following, as appropriate, as the basis for identifying the resource as a whole:
a) If the resource manifests a single work (e.g., a compact disc set containing an opera), choose a source of information identifying the resource as a whole.

b) If the issues or parts are sequentially numbered or the resource has sequentially numbered issues or parts, choose a source of information identifying the lowest numbered issue or part available.

c) If the issues or parts are unnumbered or not sequentially numbered, choose a source of information identifying the issue or part with the earliest date of issue.

d) If the concept of sequential issuing in parts is not applicable (e.g., a kit), choose a source of information identifying the resource as a whole; otherwise, treat the sources identifying the individual parts as a collective source of information for the resource as a whole. [split into b) and f)]

e) If the resource is one to which the concept of ordered parts is not applicable, and there is no source of information identifying the resource as a whole (e.g., a set of locally produced videodiscs with no source of information identifying the set as a whole), choose a source of information identifying the main part, if there is one part that can be considered the main part of the resource. Otherwise, treat the sources identifying the individual parts as a collective source of information for the resource as a whole. [split into b), e), and f)]

b) If the resource is issued as a set and the component pieces are either unnumbered or their numbering is not considered significant, choose a source of information identifying the resource as a whole, preferring a source that bears a collective title.

e) If there is no source of information identifying the resource as a whole, but one source bears a title identifying a main or predominant work or content, consider that source to identify the resource as a whole.

f) If there is no source of information identifying the resource as a whole and no source bears a title identifying a main or predominant work or content (e.g., a videodisc set containing multiple feature films but with no source of information identifying the resource as a whole), treat the sources identifying the individual parts as a collective source of information for the resource as a whole.

If the identification of a resource with ordered parts is not based on the first issue or part, make a note identifying the issue or part used as the basis for identification of the resource (see 2.20.13.3).
For sources of information for numbering identifying the last issue or part of a serial (or the first or last issue in a separate sequence of numbering), see 2.6.1.2.

For sources of information for date of production, publication, distribution, and/or manufacture of the last issue or part of a multipart monograph or serial, see 2.7.6.2, 2.8.6.2, 2.9.6.2, and 2.10.6.2, respectively.

Clean copy:

2.1.2.2 Resource Issued as a Single Unit

When preparing a comprehensive description for a resource issued as a single unit (e.g., a textbook in one volume), choose a source of information identifying the resource as a whole. If the resource manifests multiple works (e.g., a compact disc manifesting multiple works), prefer a source that bears a collective title.

If there is no source of information identifying the resource as a whole, but one source bears a title identifying a main or predominant work or content (e.g., a single videodisc containing a feature film along with trailers, outtakes, interviews, or other material related to the feature film), consider that source to identify the resource as a whole.

If there is no source of information identifying the resource as a whole and no source bears a title identifying a main or predominant work or content (e.g., a single videodisc containing multiple feature films but with no source of information identifying the resource as a whole), treat the sources of information identifying its individual contents as a collective source of information for the resource as a whole.

2.1.2.3 Resource Issued in More Than One Part

When preparing a comprehensive description for a resource issued in more than one part (e.g., a series of scientific treatises, a periodical, a compact disc set), choose one of the following, as appropriate, as the basis for identifying the resource as a whole:

a) If the resource manifests a single work (e.g., a compact disc set containing an opera), choose a source of information identifying the resource as a whole.

b) If the resource is issued as a set and the component pieces are either unnumbered or their numbering is not considered significant, choose a source of information identifying the resource as a whole, preferring a source that bears a collective title.

c) If the resource has sequentially numbered issues or parts, choose a source of information identifying the lowest numbered issue or part available.
d) If the resource has unnumbered issues or parts, or if it has numbering that is not suitable for producing an ordered sequence, choose a source of information identifying the issue or part with the earliest date of issue.

e) If there is no source of information identifying the resource as a whole, but one source bears a title identifying a main or predominant work or content, consider that source to identify the resource as a whole.

f) If there is no source of information identifying the resource as a whole and no source bears a title identifying a main or predominant work or content (e.g., a videodisc set containing multiple feature films but with no source of information identifying the resource as a whole), treat the sources identifying the individual parts as a collective source of information for the resource as a whole.

If the identification of a resource with ordered parts is not based on the first issue or part, make a note identifying the issue or part used as the basis for identification of the resource (see 2.20.13.3).

For sources of information for numbering identifying the last issue or part of a serial (or the first or last issue in a separate sequence of numbering), see 2.6.1.2.

For sources of information for date of production, publication, distribution, and/or manufacture of the last issue or part of a multipart monograph or serial, see 2.7.6.2, 2.8.6.2, 2.9.6.2, and 2.10.6.2, respectively.