

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Dave Reser, LC Representative
Subject: Revision of A.29, Capitalization of Hyphenated Compounds; changes in *Chicago Manual of Style*, 16th edition (2010)

LC thanks ALA for investigating changes to the *Chicago Manual of Style* (CMOS) and their potential impact on RDA Appendix A. We do not support this proposal because the proposal seeks to take a CMOS instruction specific to headline-style capitalization of titles and apply it generally. ALA's own proposal states this:

“The scope of CMOS (hyphenated compounds in headline-style titles) does not appear to be the same as the scope of RDA A.29 (preferred names and proper names recorded in any element). Technically, the concept of headline-style titles would be applicable to the section titles within the text of RDA, and would not affect A.29 (or any data recorded as a result of applying RDA) in any way.”

Given this difference in scope between CMOS 8.159 (Hyphenated compounds in headline-style titles) and A.29, we prefer to keep the RDA instruction for A.29, which still meets the generalization at RDA A.10: “The guidelines for English-language capitalization basically follow those of the *Chicago Manual of Style*. When guidelines differ, they have been modified to conform to the requirements of bibliographic records and long-standing cataloguing practice.”

Headline Style Capitalization vs. Appendix A Capitalization

We note that in CMOS, the principles of headline style capitalization (8.157) state that all major words in the headlines are capitalized. This is not in keeping with Appendix A instructions on capitalizing titles (A.3-A.4), profession or occupation (A.2.4), field of activity (A.2.4), and other designation associated with a person. The instructions in CMOS for capitalization of hyphenated compounds in titles ensure greater consistency because most of the words are already capitalized. Conversely, introducing this concept to Appendix A would cause less consistency because the instruction in Appendix A for titles says to capitalize the first word in a title and follow A.10-A.55 for other words. Appendix A capitalization for titles is most similar to CMOS *sentence-style capitalization* (8.156) in which only the first word in a title or subtitle, and any proper names are capitalized.

Compare titles capitalized CMOS headline style with those capitalized Appendix A-style and capitalized according to ALA's proposal:

CMOS: Twenty-First Century Blackjack

Appendix A: Twenty-first century blackjack

ALA Proposal: Twenty-First century blackjack

CMOS: French-Speaking Africa Since Independence

Appendix A: French-speaking Africa since independence

ALA Proposal: French-Speaking Africa since independence

Other Appendix A Instructions Covered by A.29

Although ALA's proposal states that the scope of A.29 is "preferred names and proper names recorded in any element", the scope is much greater because several instructions elsewhere in Appendix A indicate that the capitalization guidelines in A.10-A.55 (including A.29) should be followed. These include: A.2.4 (Other Terms Associated with Names of Persons), A.2.6 (Other Terms Associated with Names of Families and Corporate Bodies), and A.3.2 (Other Terms Associated with Titles of Works). Thus, these types of access points (hypothetical examples) would be affected:

Current: Billy (Short-eared owl)

ALA Proposal: Billy (Short-Eared owl)

Current: Celtic Crossing (Cross-stitch guild)

ALA Proposal: Celtic Crossing (Cross-Stitch guild)

Current: By the dawn (One-act play)

ALA Proposal: By the dawn (One-Act play)

In reviewing ALA's proposal, we found ourselves often confused by when A.10-A.30 applied for languages other than English. A.31 states, "For languages other than English, apply the guidelines for the capitalization of English at A.10-A.30 unless a guideline at A.33-A.55 instructs otherwise." Thus, it would seem that if A.29 is changed, A.33-A.55 should also be changed to 1) make both parts of the hyphenated compounds listed capitalized or 2) modify instructions for each language make it explicit that the second part of a hyphenated compound should not be capitalized. These are some of the phrases we noticed:

A.33.3: *Bosansko-podrinjski kanton*

A.33.8: *Isa-begova vakufnama*

A.35.3: *Splitsko-dalmatinska županija; Primorsko-goranska županija*

A.39.1: *Kaappa- ja teollisuusministeriö*

A.50.3: *Zapadno-bački okrug*

Comments on Specific Instructions and Examples:

Our comments below use the item numbers as given in ALA's proposal.

1. This example should not be changed because the Anti-Inflation Act is a legislative act covered by A.18.

6. Because the Editor's Guide says to follow CMOS headline style for chapter and section titles, we think it is reasonable to apply CMOS to the captions for the examples as well. We agree to this change.

14. We agree to the change to "Tonic Sol-fa" as glossary entries should be in headline style. We note that these "see" terms in the glossary were not included in ALA's proposal: **Sexto-decimo**, **Sixty-fourmo**, **Thirty-twomo**, **Twenty-fourmo**, **Trigesimo-secundo**, and **Vigesimo-quarto**. We also noted that the glossary term "**Mock-up**" was not included in the proposal. Were these exclusions intentional or an oversight?

For items 2-5 and 7-13 we do not agree to the changes.