

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
FROM: John Attig, ALA Representative
SUBJECT: Revision of A.29, Capitalization of Hyphenated Compounds; changes in *Chicago Manual of Style*, 16th edition (2010)

Background

Shortly after the publication in 2010 of the 16th edition of the *Chicago Manual of Style* [abbreviated CMOS in this document], Adam Schiff informed CC:DA that there were some significant changes between the 15th and 16th editions. Because CMOS is referenced by RDA, he suggested that the changes be investigated and appropriate revisions proposed.

CC:DA formed a Task Force to “review the impact of changes in the *Chicago Manual of Style*, 16th edition, on RDA instructions and examples and propose appropriate revisions.” The CMOS is relevant to RDA because the text of RDA is expected to conform to CMOS “for details of style not covered specifically in this guide” [RDA Editor’s Guide, 6JSC/RDA/Editor’s Guide/Rev/1]. Specifically, RDA A.10 states “The guidelines for English-language capitalization basically follow those of the *Chicago Manual of Style*.”

The Task Force examined the changes between the 15th and 16th editions of CMOS, using the following sources to identify those changes:

Significant Rule Changes in the Chicago Manual of Style, 16th edition

[http://www.chicagomanualofstyle.org/about16_rules.html]

Chicago Manual of Style, 16th edition, New and Retired Rules (via the Subversive Copy Editor blog [http://www.subversivecopyeditor.com/my_weblog/cmos-16-sneak-peeks.html])

Chicago Manual of Style, Essentials in the 16th edition by Holly Monty

[<http://www.editing-writing.com/articles/chicago-manual-16th-edition.shtml>]

The preface to CMOS 16

Note that the Task Force did not conduct an exhaustive examination into all areas in which RDA deviates from CMOS. It was felt that, in areas where RDA deviated from CMOS 15, it was by design of the editors.

The Task Force report, accepted by CC:DA, contained the following types of recommendations:

- a) Changes to the RDA Editor’s Guide [these have been communicated to the JSC Secretary for action]
- b) Minor changes to the text and examples in RDA [these have been submitted as Fast Track proposals]
- c) Several cases in which the Task Force recommended against a revision
- d) One potentially significant issue regarding the capitalization of hyphenated compounds (RDA A.29)

For convenience, the revisions in a)–c) are listed in an appendix to the document. The proposed revision to A.29 requires more extensive discussion and is the subject of this proposal.

The final report of the Task Force is available at: <http://alcts.ala.org/ccdablog/wp-content/uploads/2013/05/tf-Chicago4rev-2013-May.pdf>.

Proposed revision of RDA A.29, Hyphenated Compounds

Background

One of the most significant changes in the 16th edition of CMOS deals with the capitalization of hyphenated compounds (A.29).

RDA A.29, based on the 15th edition, reads:

A.29 Hyphenated Compounds

If the guidelines require the capitalization of a hyphenated compound, capitalize the first part. Capitalize the second, etc., part if it is a noun or a proper adjective or if it has the same force as the first part.

EXAMPLE

Twentieth-Century

Basket-Maker

Blue-Black

Secretary-Treasurer

Do not capitalize the second part if it modifies the first part or if the two parts constitute a single word.

EXAMPLE

French-speaking

Twenty-five

Co-ordinate

The revised instruction in CMOS 16 reads:

8.159 Hyphenated compounds in headline-style titles

The following rules apply to hyphenated terms appearing in a title capitalized in headline style. For reasons of consistency and editorial efficiency, Chicago no longer advises making exceptions to these rules for the rare awkward-looking result (though such niceties may occasionally be observed in display settings, as on the cover of a book). For rules of hyphenation, see [7.77–85](#).

1. Always capitalize the first element.

2. Capitalize any subsequent elements unless they are articles, prepositions, coordinating conjunctions (*and, but, for, or, nor*), or such modifiers as *flat* or *sharp* following musical key symbols.
3. If the first element is merely a prefix or combining form that could not stand by itself as a word (*anti, pre, etc.*), do not capitalize the second element unless it is a proper noun or proper adjective.
4. Capitalize the second element in a hyphenated spelled-out number (*twenty-one* or *twenty-first, etc.*) or hyphenated simple fraction (*two-thirds* in *two-thirds majority*).

This departure from previous Chicago recommendations recognizes the functional equality of the numbers before and after the hyphen.

Provisions #2 and #4 are now in conflict with the instructions in A.29. The Task Force proposed that RDA A.29 be revised to conform to this provision.

Discussion

This recommendation proved controversial when it was presented to CC:DA.

Arguments *against* the proposed revision included:

- The scope of CMOS (hyphenated compounds in headline-style titles) does not appear to be the same as the scope of RDA A.29 (preferred names and proper names recorded in any element). Technically, the concept of headline-style titles would be applicable to the section titles within the text of RDA, and would not affect A.29 (or any data recorded as a result of applying RDA) in any way.
- If A.29 is revised to reflect the new CMOS practice, this change would not only affect the text of RDA, it would affect the preferred names and authorized access points created in applying RDA.
- The impact on existing authority records would be difficult to assess. Gary Strawn did some preliminary checking, but concluded that it would be nearly impossible to isolate only those instances of hyphenated compounds that would need to be changed, and therefore that it would be unlikely that existing data could be safely updated by program.
- Even if all existing records could be updated to conform to the new instruction, the impact would be minimal because NACO authority work relies on matching algorithms based on normalized data that ignores differences in capitalization.
- The statement in RDA A.10 that “The guidelines for English-language capitalization basically follow those of the *Chicago Manual of Style*” do allow for the possibility of deviation. The instructions in RDA A.29 are sufficiently clear to document RDA practice, even if it differs from CMOS.

The arguments *in favor of* the proposed revision included:

- Admittedly, the scope of CMOS 8.159 and RDA A.29 are not the same. There seems to be no explicit instruction on the capitalization of hyphenated compounds in proper names of organizations, places, etc. However, the examples of such names (see, for example,

CMOS 8.55, 8.61, 8.65) consistently follow the practice documented in 8.159. It seems safe to say that the intention of CMOS16 is to apply this practice consistently.

- The statement in RDA A.10 clearly indicates an intention to follow standard usage as documented in successive editions of CMOS. The best practice for RDA would seem to be to comply with current CMOS provisions unless there is a compelling reason to diverge.
- The new practice documented in CMOS 8.159 does seem to correspond to current English-language usage; titles capitalized according to the current RDA practice seem somehow dated.
- As we look increasingly to repurpose data created elsewhere, we are more likely to encounter data that conforms to the new practice; editing that data to conform to a divergent RDA practice seems counter-productive.
- Because capitalization has no effect on normalized headings, there would be no urgent need to update the entire NACO authority file immediately. Instead, the new practice would be followed in all new records, but existing records would continue to function without modification; they would only be updated as encountered or as the records are being revised for other reasons.

Recommendation

CC:DA found the arguments in favor of the revision convincing and voted unanimously to propose the following revision of RDA A.29.

Revision of RDA A.29

A.29 Hyphenated Compounds

If the guidelines require the capitalization of a hyphenated compound, capitalize the first part. Capitalize the second, etc., part if it is a noun or a proper adjective or if it has the same force as the first part unless it is an article, preposition, coordinating conjunction (*and, but, for, or, nor*), or a modifier such as *flat* or *sharp* following musical key symbols.

EXAMPLE

Twentieth-Century

Basket-Maker

Blue-Black

Secretary-Treasurer

French-Speaking

Twenty-Five

~~Do not capitalize the second part if it modifies the first part or if the two parts constitute a single word. If the first element is merely a prefix or combining form~~

that could not stand by itself as a word (e.g., *anti*, *pre*), do not capitalize the second element unless it is a proper noun or proper adjective.

EXAMPLE

French-speaking

Twenty-five

Co-ordinate

Anti-inflation

but

Pre-Raphaelite

Clean copy

A.29 Hyphenated Compounds

If the guidelines require the capitalization of a hyphenated compound, capitalize the first part. Capitalize the second, etc., part unless it is an article, preposition, coordinating conjunction (*and*, *but*, *for*, *or*, *nor*), or a modifier such as *flat* or *sharp* following musical key symbols.

EXAMPLE

Twentieth-Century

Basket-Maker

Blue-Black

Secretary-Treasurer

French-Speaking

Twenty-Five

If the first element is merely a prefix or combining form that could not stand by itself as a word (e.g., *anti*, *pre*), do not capitalize the second element unless it is a proper noun or proper adjective.

EXAMPLE

Co-ordinate

Anti-inflation

but

Pre-Raphaelite

Revision of Other RDA Instructions and Examples

Based on the revision of A.29, the following RDA instructions and examples would need to be revised:

1. **RDA 6.29.1.18, explanation of first example, and 19.2.1.3, explanation of ninth example, seventeenth group (Treaties)**

Authorized access points representing the signatories to an agreement for: Memorandum of agreement between the government of the province of Ontario and the government of Canada pursuant to section 4(3) of the ~~Anti-Inflation~~ Anti-inflation Act

Rationale: CMOS 8.159, exception for prefixes.

2. **RDA 9.2.2.25, third example (first group)**

A Teacher of ~~Book-keeping~~ Book-Keeping
Statement of responsibility: by a Teacher of ~~Book-keeping~~ Book-Keeping

Rationale: CMOS 8.159 extrapolated to personal names.

3. **RDA 11.2.2.11, last example**

San Francisco Art Association. Annual Drawing and Print Exhibition
not San Francisco Art Association. ~~Twenty-second~~ Twenty-Second Annual Drawing and Print Exhibition

Rationale: CMOS 8.159, extrapolated to corporate names.

4. **RDA 11.2.2.24.2, first example**

Massachusetts. Militia. ~~Court-martial~~ Court-Martial (Watson : 1810)

Rationale: CMOS 8.159, extrapolated to corporate names.

5. **RDA 11.2.3.6, third example (fifth group)**

Group of ~~Seventy-seven~~ Seventy-Seven

Rationale: CMOS 8.159, extrapolated to corporate names.

6. **RDA 11.2.3.7, caption for fifth group of examples**

Name as Direct Subdivision of Authorized Access Point for a ~~Higher-level~~ Higher-Level Body

Rationale: CMOS 8.159 [this one is actually a headline-style title].

7. RDA 11.2.3.7, tenth example (seventh group)

International Conference on ~~Low-cost~~ Low-Cost Planetary Missions, IAA
Conference on ~~Low-cost~~ Low-Cost Planetary Missions, IAA International
Uninverted form recorded as preferred name: IAA International Conference
on ~~Low-cost~~ Low-Cost Planetary Missions

Rationale: CMOS 8.159, extrapolated to corporate names.

8. RDA A.11.4, example

John the ~~Twenty-third~~ Twenty-Third

Rationale: CMOS 8.159.

9. RDA A.14, example

~~Forty-second~~ Forty-Second Street

Rationale: CMOS 8.159; see also example “Ninety-Fifth Street” at CMOS 9.52.

10. RDA A.16.2, example

~~Twenty-first~~ Twenty-First Regiment of U.S. Infantry

Rationale: CMOS 8.159 and 8.111.

11. RDA A.16.2, example

Congress; the ~~Ninety-fifth~~ Ninety-Fifth Congress (*but* congressional)

Rationale: CMOS 8.159; see also example “the Ninety-Seventh Congress” at CMOS 8.61.

12. RDA A.16.5, example

~~Fifty-second~~ Fifty-Second Annual Meeting of the American Historical Association

Rationale: CMOS 8.159; see also example “Fifty-Seventh Annual Meeting of the American Historical Association” at CMOS 8.69.

13. RDA A.17.6, example

the ~~Thirty-nine~~ Thirty-Nine Articles

Rationale: CMOS 8.159; see also example “Luther’s Ninety-Five Theses” at CMOS 8.106.

14. RDA Glossary “Tonic Sol-fa”

~~Tonic Sol-fa~~ Tonic Sol-Fa

Rationale: CMOS 8.159; glossary entries are in headline style; elsewhere in RDA, given correctly as “tonic sol-fa”.

Appendix

A. Revision to RDA Editor's Guide

Section 1: Purpose and Scope

For details of style not covered specifically in this guide, RDA follows the ~~15th~~ 16th edition of *The Chicago Manual of Style*.

Discussion: The Task Force considered eliminating the edition statement, and thus the need to update this statement in the future. However, it was felt that a statement here would indicate the currency of the Editor's Guide; when a new edition appears, a revision of this statement would indicate that the Guide (and RDA) had been reviewed and updated.

Section 3.1: Capitalization: Chapter titles

Capitalize chapter titles using headline style (see *The Chicago Manual of Style*, ~~8.167 and 8.170~~ 8.157–8.159).

Section 3.2: Capitalization: Section titles

Capitalize section titles using headline style (see *The Chicago Manual of Style*, ~~8.167 and 8.170~~ 8.157–8.159).

Section 4.2: Lists

... coordinate ~~phases~~ phrases

This is simply a typo, not connected with the CMOS review.

Section 8: Citations

For citations given in footnotes, follow *The Chicago Manual of Style*, chapter ~~17~~ 14.

B. Fast Track proposals

- RDA 0.10 (next to last paragraph):** Change “web site” to “website”.
RDA 1.1.2 (last paragraph): Change “Web site” to “website”.
RDA 1.1.3: Change “Web” to “web” (third paragraph) and “Web site” to “website” (sixth paragraph).
RDA 1.5.2 d): Change “Web site” to “website”.
RDA 1.5.3 d): Change “Web site” to “website”.
RDA 2.1.2.4 (first paragraph): Change “Web site” to “website”.
RDA 2.1.3.4: Change “Web site” to “website”.
RDA 2.3.1.6 (explanation of last example): Change “Web site” to “website”.
RDA 2.13.1.3: Change “Web” to “web” (definition of “single unit”) and “Web site” to “website” (definition of “integrating resource”).
RDA 7.29.2.3.2 (explanation of example): Change “Web site” to “Website”.
RDA 11.13.1.8 (explanation of last example, fourth group): Change “Web site” to “website”.
RDA 18.1.3 (last paragraph): Change “Web site” to “website”.

RDA 19.2.1.3 (explanation of tenth example, first group): Change “Web site” to “website”.

RDA 19.3.1.3 (explanation of fifth example, first group): Change “Web site” to “website”.

RDA 20.2.1.3 (explanation of next to last example, last group): Change “Web site” to “website”.

RDA 21.3.1.3 (explanation of first example, first group): Change “Web site” to “website”.

RDA 25.1.1.3 (explanation of sixteenth example, second group; third example, third group (twice); seventh and eighth examples, fourth group): Change “Web site” to “website”.

RDA 27.1.1.3 (second, ninth, thirteenth examples, third group): Change “Web site” to “website”.

RDA J.4.2 (definition of “mirror site”): Change “Web site” to “website”.

RDA Glossary (definitions of “Integrating Resource” and “Resource”): Change “Web site” to “website”.

Rationale: CMOS 7.76 states “Chicago now considers *web* to be generic [and therefore lowercased] when used alone or in combination with other generic terms.” Chicago Style Q & A prefers “website” as a single word.

2. RDA 2.20.10.3 (first example)

€DROM CD-ROM

Rationale: RDA usually uses the hyphenated form (2.20.2.3, 3.20.1.3, 25.1.1.3, 27.1.1.3, 19.2.1.3, Glossary). CMOS is not explicit, but uses “CD-ROM” itself.

3. RDA 6.2.2.4 (explanation of first example, second group)

Preferred title for work by William Gaunt later published under the title: The pre-Raphaelite Pre-Raphaelite dream

Rationale: CMOS 8.78 gives “Pre-Raphaelite” as an example. RDA A.19 says to capitalize names of historical and cultural events and periods.

4. RDA 6.7.1.3 (last example); 6.30.5.2 (explanation of the last example)

[Change “BC” to “B.C.”]

Rationale: Although CMOS 9.35 calls for “BC”, ALA is recommending that the practice of using “B.C” with full stops be retained; see RDA H.1 in Section C below. However, these two examples should be corrected for consistency.

5. RDA 6.30.2.2 (explanation of first example, third group)

Resource described: Three Psalms psalms. **Contains the Eighth eighth, Forty-sixth forty-sixth, and One one hundredth Psalm psalm**

Rationale: This is not a headline-case title, but a general characterization of the texts; no special capitalization is necessary.

6. RDA 8.12.1.3 (second example, second group)

Email E-mail from author, 10 July 2002

Rationale: CMOS 7.85. RDA uses “e-mail” elsewhere.

7. RDA 19.2.1.3 (fourth example, sixth group)

Authorized access point representing the creator for: ~~M-Step~~ M-STEP today : interim report of project activities. — Baltimore : Multi-State Teacher Education Project

Rationale: CMOS 10.6. Based on the publisher's name, this is clearly an initialism; it appears in capital letters on the title page.

8. RDA A.10, footnote

Delete the footnote referring to the 15th edition of CMOS.

Rationale: Removing reference to a particular edition (rather than updating it to refer to the 16th edition) eliminates the need to update it in the future.

9. RDA A.10

Capitalize a plural generic term when it precedes or follows the distinctive nouns in two or more proper names. ~~Do not capitalize the generic term when it follows the nouns.~~

Rationale: Examples in CMOS 8.52, 8.55, and 8.112.

10. RDA A.10 (last two examples)

Industry and Trade ~~departments~~ Departments

Authorized and Revised ~~versions~~ Versions

Rationale: Examples in CMOS 8.52, 8.55, and 8.112.

11. RDA A.14

Capitalize the name of a building, monument, or other structure; and the name of a road or street. Do not capitalize words such as avenue, bridge, hotel, and park when they are used alone, but capitalize them when they are used as part of a plural name.

Rationale: CMOS 8.55 [a change from earlier editions]. ALA also suggests adding the following example:

Fifty-Seventh and Fifty-Fifth Streets

C. Recommendations not to revise RDA to conform to CMOS 16

RDA Editor's guide, section 3.2: Capitalization: Section titles

CMOS 8.157 continues to call for capitalizing the first and last words in titles. This was the practice followed by the RDA Editor, and resulted in the capitalization of "Etc." at the end of section titles. Some CMOS users find this provision unsatisfactory, and have proposed various rationales for not applying it. However, ALA recommends that the current RDA practice continue.

RDA 7.17.3.3

CMOS 7.85 says to hyphenate compound colors before a noun but not otherwise; the result would be “black-and-white images” but “images in black and white”. ALA recommends that no change be made to RDA, and that black and white always be given as separate words.

RDA B.11

CMOS 10.4 recommends using two-letter postal codes wherever place names are abbreviated; this would result in many changes to B.11 and would include the use of “US” instead of “U.S.” ALA believes that in this case the explicit instructions in RDA should override CMOS and that no change should be made.

RDA H.1

CMOS 9.35 states: “Era designations, at least in the Western world, are usually expressed in one of two ways: either CE (“of the Common Era”) and BCE (“before the Common Era”), or “AD (*anno domini*, “in the year of the Lord”) and BC (“before Christ”). ALA again believes that there is no purpose served by removing the full stops, that the explicit instructions in RDA should override CMOS, and that no change should be made. We did note above that “BC” without full stops does appear in 6.7.1.3 and 6.30.5.2 and should be changed for consistency.