To: Joint Steering Committee for development of RDA

From: EURIG

Subject: Language of expression – Revision of RDA 6.11, 6.11.1.3, 6.11.1.4, 7.12.1.3, 26.1.1.3

Background

In accordance with the FRBR and FRAD models, the language of the expression is an attribute of high value relative to identification and selection of an expression. We therefore think that the language of the expression should be a core element in all cases, whenever the language element is applicable to a type of resource, and that it should be specified among the authority data elements.

It serves not only to distinguish between the different expressions of a same work, but also to inform users about the content of a resource and enable them to know if a particular expression is understandable and accessible for them.

For more accuracy and in order to preserve the same level of information available in current MARC records, we wish it were possible to qualify the language of the expression, picking from a list of terms, when the information on the type of the expression with which the language is associated is available (original language, translation, language of the subtitles…). For the same reason, the translation relationship between expressions should provide the means to obtain information about the language from which the translation was made. For instance, users should be enabled to know whether there is a translation from an original version or a translation from an intermediate language.

In our proposal, we have qualified systematically the language in all the examples to illustrate our reasoning, but this way of cataloguing remains optional.

Besides, we suggest modifying the ninth and tenth examples of chapter 7, as they refer to printing or page numbers, some information elements that belong to the manifestation level rather than the expression level.

The Scope of the change would include the following instructions:

6.11 Language of Expression
6.11.1.3 Recording Language of Expression
6.11.1.4 Expressions Involving More Than One Language
7.12.1.3 Recording Language of the Content
26.1.1.3 Referencing Related Expressions
Proposed revisions: marked up version
Change to RDA instruction at 6.11

6.11 Language of Expression
CORE ELEMENT
Language of expression is a core element when needed to differentiate an expression of a work from another expression of the same work if the resource includes some text.

Clean Copy
Change to RDA instruction at 6.11

6.11 Language of Expression
CORE ELEMENT
Language of expression is a core element if the resource includes some text.

Proposed revision: marked up version
Change to RDA instruction and examples at 6.11.1.3

6.11.1.3 Recording Language of Expression

Record the language or languages of the expression using an appropriate term or terms in the language preferred by the agency creating the data. Select terms from a standard list of names of languages, if available.

EXAMPLE

English
Resource described: The Zemganno brothers / by Edmond de Goncourt. An English translation of a French novel

Indonesian
Resource described: Ada apa dengan Cinta? / Miles Productions mempersembahkan ; sebuah film dari Rudi Soedjarwo ; produser, Mira Lesmana, Riri Riza ; skenario, Jujur Prananto. The original motion picture in Indonesian

Spanish
Resource described: Obras completas / W. Somerset Maugham. A Spanish translation of the author’s works

English
Resource described: Colloid journal of the Russian Academy of Sciences. An English translation of a Russian serial

Hebrew
Resource described: Mosheh ye-Aharon : operah be-shalosh ma’arakhot / Arnold Shenberg ; turgem Yiśra’el Eliraz. A Hebrew translation of the libretto to Schoenberg’s opera Moses und Aron

Russian
Resource described: 27 ukradennykh põtseluev. A Georgian motion picture dubbed into Russian


Optional addition:
Qualify the language of the expression, using one or more of the terms listed below:

- original language
- translation
- translation from an intermediate language
- language of subtitles
- language of insert titles
- language of dubbing
- language of captions

EXAMPLE

English (translation)
Resource described: The Zemganno brothers / by Edmond de Goncourt. An English translation of a French novel

Indonesian (original language)
Resource described: Ada apa dengan Cinta? / Miles Productions mempersembahkan ; sebuah film dari Rudi Soedjarwo ; produser, Mira Lesmana, Riri Riza ; skenario, Jujur Prananto. The original motion picture in Indonesian

Russian (language of dubbing)
Resource described: 27 ukradennykh põtseluev. A Georgian motion picture dubbed into Russian

French (translation)
Resource described: Les Hauts de Hurlevent / Emily Brontë. A French translation of an English novel

French (translation from an intermediate language)
Resource described: Une saison au paradis / Breyten Breytenbach. A French translation of an English intermediate version of a novel in Afrikaans

French (language of captions)
Resource described: Vue intérieure de Paris représentant le port au blé depuis le marché aux vaux jusque au pont Notre Dame. A drawing of the 18th century with a caption in French, here transcribed in its original spelling

Dutch (language of captions; translation)
Resource described: De Ongelukkige familie van Calas. An engraving by C. F. Fritzsch with captions translated in Dutch

French (language of subtitles; original language)

Resource described: Un printemps à Paris. An original French language version on DVD with subtitles in French for deaf and hard of hearing

If the expression involves more than one language, follow the additional instructions given under 6.11.1.4 RDA.

For guidelines on recording details relating to the language of expression, see the instructions on language of the content given under 7.12 RDA.

Clean Copy
Change to RDA instruction and examples at 6.11.1.3

6.11.1.3 Recording Language of Expression

Record the language or languages of the expression using an appropriate term or terms in the language preferred by the agency creating the data. Select terms from a standard list of names of languages, if available.

EXAMPLE

English

Resource described: The Zemganno brothers / by Edmond de Goncourt. An English translation of a French novel

Indonesian

Resource described: Ada apa dengan Cinta? / Miles Productions mempersembahkan ; sebuah film dari Rudi Soedjarwo ; produser, Mira Lesmana, Riri Riza ; skenario, Jujur Prananto. The original motion picture in Indonesian

Spanish

Resource described: Obras completas / W. Somerset Maugham. A Spanish translation of the author’s works

English

Resource described: Colloid journal of the Russian Academy of Sciences. An English translation of a Russian serial

Hebrew

Resource described: Mosheh ye-Aharon : operah be-shalosh mašarakhot / Arnold Shenberg ; tigrum Yišraʾel Eliraz. A Hebrew translation of the libretto to Schoenberg’s opera Moses und Aron

Russian

Resource described: 27 ukradennykh pōtseluev. A Georgian motion picture dubbed into Russian
Chinese

Optional addition:
Qualify the language of the expression, using one or more of the terms listed below:
- original language
- translation
- translation from an intermediate language
- language of subtitles
- language of insert titles
- language of dubbing
- language of captions

EXAMPLE
English (translation)
Resource described: The Zemganno brothers / by Edmond de Goncourt. An English translation of a French novel

Indonesian (original language)
Resource described: Ada apa dengan Cinta? / Miles Productions mempersembahkan ; sebuah film dari Rudi Soedjarwo ; produser, Mira Lesmana, Riri Riza ; skenario, Jujur Prananto. The original motion picture in Indonesian

Russian (language of dubbing)
Resource described: 27 ukradennykh pòtseluè. A Georgian motion picture dubbed into Russian

French (translation)
Resource described: Les Hauts de Hurlevent / Emily Brontë. A French translation of an English novel

French (translation from an intermediate language)
Resource described: Une saison au paradis / Breyten Breytenbach. A French translation of an English intermediate version of a novel in Afrikaans

French (language of captions)
Resource described: Vue intérieure de Paris représentant le port au blé depuis le marché aux vaux jusque au pont Notre Dame. A drawing of the 18th century with a caption in French, here transcribed in its original spelling

Dutch (language of captions; translation)
Resource described: De Ongelukkige familie van Calas. An engraving by C. F. Fritsch with captions translated in Dutch

French (language of subtitles; original language)
Resource described: Un printemps à Paris. An original French language version on DVD with subtitles in French for deaf and hard of hearing

If the expression involves more than one language, follow the additional instructions given under 6.11.1.4 RDA.
For guidelines on recording details relating to the language of expression, see the instructions on language of the content given under 7.12 RDA.

Proposed revisions: marked up version
Change to RDA examples at 6.11.1.4

6.11.1.4 Expressions Involving More Than One Language
If a single expression of a work involves more than one language, record each of the languages.

EXAMPLE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>(original language)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>(original language)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russian</td>
<td>(original language)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Resource described: Defiance / Paramount Vantage presents a Grosvenor Park/Bedford Falls production; an Edward Zwick film; executive producer, Marshall Herskovitz; produced by Edward Zwick, Pieter Jan Brugge; director of photography, Eduardo Serra; screenplay by Clayton Frohman & Edward Zwick; directed by Edward Zwick. A motion picture with some dialogue in English, some dialogue in German, and some dialogue in Russian.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>(translation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dutch</td>
<td>(original language)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>French</td>
<td>(translation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>(translation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>(translation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>(translation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portuguese</td>
<td>(translation)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Resource described: Joan Blaeu Atlas maior of 1665 / introduction and texts by Peter van der Krogt; based on the copy in the Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Wien; with a selection of original texts by Joan Blaeu; directed and produced by Benedikt Taschen. An atlas in six volumes; each volume includes text in English and two of the other languages.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>(language of captions)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>French</td>
<td>(language of captions)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>German</td>
<td>(language of captions)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


---

1 This qualification is based on the record of the Library of Congress, http://lccn.loc.gov/2009575647, which specifies: “Text in English, German and French; translated from the Dutch”.


Clean Copy
Change to RDA examples at 6.11.1.4

**6.11.1.4 Expressions Involving More Than One Language**
If a single expression of a work involves more than one language, record each of the languages.

**EXAMPLE**
English (original language)
German (original language)
Russian (original language)
Resource described: Defiance / Paramount Vantage presents a Grosvenor Park/Bedford Falls production; an Edward Zwick film; executive producer, Marshall Herskovitz; produced by Edward Zwick, Pieter Jan Brugge; director of photography, Eduardo Serra; screenplay by Clayton Frohman & Edward Zwick; directed by Edward Zwick. A motion picture with some dialogue in English, some dialogue in German, and some dialogue in Russian.

English (translation)
Dutch (original language)
French (translation)
German (translation)
Italian (translation)
Spanish (translation)
Portuguese (translation)
Resource described: Joan Blaeu Atlas maior of 1665 / introduction and texts by Peter van der Krogt; based on the copy in the Österreichische Nationalbibliothek, Wien; with a selection of original texts by Joan Blaeu; directed and produced by Benedikt Taschen. An atlas in six volumes; each volume includes text in English and two of the other languages.

English (language of captions)
French (language of captions)
German (language of captions)

French (original language)
French (language of subtitles; original language)
Proposed revisions: marked up version
Change to RDA examples at 7.12.1.3

7.12.1.3 Recording Language of the Content

Record details of the language or languages used to express the content of the resource if they are considered to be important for identification or selection.

**EXAMPLE**
Commentary in English

- Italian and English words; includes principal melodies
- Latin text; parallel English translation
- Place names in Italian
- Legend in English and Afrikaans
- Some items in English; some in French
- English with typewritten French translation
- Latin with English marginalia
- Latin words; words of each motet also printed provided as text at the end of each motet
- French words; English translations on pages v–xxii provided
- Sung in French
- French dialogue; English subtitles
- Dubbed into English
- Captions in Spanish
- Audiotape in Spanish and English
- Collection is predominantly in Vietnamese; materials in English are indicated at the file level
- Poems in the dialect of Genoa (Liguria), with Italian version
- Contributions in German, French, English, Spanish, and Italian
- In Polish; tables of contents and summaries in Polish, Russian, and English
Clean Copy
Change to RDA examples at 7.12.1.3

7.12.1.3 Recording Language of the Content

Record details of the language or languages used to express the content of the resource if they are considered to be important for identification or selection.

**EXAMPLE**

Commentary in English

Italian and English words; includes principal melodies

Latin text; parallel English translation

Place names in Italian

Legend in English and Afrikaans

Some items in English; some in French

English with typewritten French translation

Latin with English marginalia

Latin words; words of each motet also provided as text

French words; English translations provided

Sung in French

French dialogue; English subtitles

Dubbed into English

Captions in Spanish

Audiotape in Spanish and English

Collection is predominantly in Vietnamese; materials in English are indicated at the file level

Poems in the dialect of Genoa (Liguria), with Italian version

Contributions in German, French, English, Spanish, and Italian

In Polish; tables of contents and summaries in Polish, Russian, and English
Proposed revisions: marked up version
Change to RDA example at 26.1.1.3

26.1.1.3 Referencing Related Expressions
Reference a related expression applying the general guidelines on referencing related works, expressions, manifestations, and items given under 24.4 RDA.

EXAMPLE
Identifier for the Related Expression

Translated as: http://bibpurl.oclc.org/web/14222
Resource described: After Amsterdam : sexual orientation and the European Union : a guide / ILGA-Europe. Related expressions represented in the manifestation identified by a resource identifier for French, German, Hungarian, Lithuanian, and Spanish translations

Revised as: Library of Congress control number: no2008127546
Identifier for the 1992 director's cut version of the 1982 motion picture Blade runner

Abridged as: Library of Congress control number: no 91002344
Identifier for the English abridged version of Charles Alexandre de Calonne's Requête au roi

Continued by: Izvestiya. Mathematics = ISSN 1064-5632
Resource described: Mathematics of the USSR. Izvestiya. Related expression represented in the manifestation identified by key title and ISSN

EXAMPLE
Authorized Access Point Representing the Related Expression

Revision of: Roget, Peter Mark, 1779–1869. Thesaurus of English words and phrases
Resource described: Roget's Thesaurus of English words and phrases. – New edition / completely revised and modernized by Robert A. Dutch

Expanded version of: Saw, Swee-Hock, 1931–. Population control for zero growth in Singapore
Resource described: Population policies and programmes in Singapore / Saw Swee-Hock

Resource described: The long exile / Georges Simenon ; translated from the French by Eileen Ellenbogen

Resource described: The threepenny opera / Bertolt Brecht ; translated by Ralph Manheim and John Willett ; with commentary and notes by Non and Nick Worrall
Revised as: Bauer, Michael D. Linux server security

Resource described: Building secure servers with Linux / Michael D. Bauer

Supplement: Adweek agency directory (Midwestern edition)

Resource described: Adweek. – Midwest edition

Continued by: Izvestia Rossiiskoi Akademii nauk. Seroia matematicheskaiia. English

Resource described: Mathematics of the USSR. Izvestia

EXAMPLE

Structured Description of the Related Expression


Abridged as: The concise Oxford companion to Irish literature / edited by Robert Welch

Resource described: The Oxford companion to Irish literature / edited by Robert Welch ; assistant editor, Bruce Stewart

EXAMPLE

Unstructured Description of the Related Expression

Revised and shortened version of the author's thesis (Ph.D.)–Yale University, 1982

Revised edition of Lectures chantées, originally published in 1968

The English edition of a Spanish publication, which is also issued in French, German, and Arabic editions

Recast in bronze from artist's plaster original of 1903

Shorter version of the 1969 motion picture of the same name

Resource described: Walt Whitman's Civil War / Churchill Films ; produced by Magus Films ; produced and directed by Frederic Goodich ; written by Neal Ruben

Issued also in Portuguese as: Air & space power journal em portugues; and in Spanish as: Air & space power journal español

Resource described: Air & space power journal

Also issued in other regional editions: Eastern edition; Midwest edition; New England edition; Southwest edition; and Western edition

Resource described: Adweek. – Southeast edition

Also available in a 45 min. abridged version

Resource described: Inside America's military academies / presented courtesy of the USAA Educational Foundation ; written and directed by Dan Jackson. – Unabridged version
“This concordance is based on Paul de Woestijne’s edition of Priscian’s Periegesis” –Preface

26.1.4.4 Translations

The translation relationship between expressions should enable the user to know from which language the translation was made. When the related expression is recorded by means of an authorized access point or a structured or non-structured description, the information on the language of the related expression is required in the authorized access point or in the description.

**EXAMPLE**

*Identifier for the Related Expression*

*Translated as:* http://bibpurl.oclc.org/web/14222


*Related expressions represented in the manifestation identified by a resource identifier for French, German, Hungarian, Lithuanian, and Spanish translations*

*Translation of:* http://catalogue.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/cb35047562h/

*Resource described:* Les noces de Cadmos et Harmonie / Roberto Calasso ; traduit de l'italien par Jean-Paul Manganaro.

*Identifier in the National Library of France catalog for the Italian expression of Roberto Calasso’s Le nozze di Cadmo e Armonia, represented in the 1st published manifestation*

**EXAMPLE**

*Authorized Access Point Representing the Related Expression*


*Resource described:* The long exile / Georges Simenon ; translated from the French by Eileen Ellenbogen.

*Translation of:* Breytenbach, Breyten, 1939-..... 'n Seisoen in die paradys. English

*Resource described:* Une Saison au paradis / Breyten Breytenbach ; traduit [de la version anglaise] par Jean Guiloineau.

*Translation of:* Calasso, Roberto, 1941-..... La folie Baudelaire. Italian

*Resource described:* La folie Baudelaire / Roberto Calasso ; traduit de l'italien par Jean-Paul Manganaro.

*The text of the original expression is in Italian although the original title is in French*


*Resource described:* Lolita / Vladimir Nabokov ; nouvelle traduction de l'anglais et préface par Maurice Couturier.
EXAMPLE
Structured Description of the Related Expression


EXAMPLE
Unstructured Description of the Related Expression

The English edition of a Spanish publication, which is also issued in French, German, and Arabic editions
Translated from the English version of an original text in Afrikaans
Resource described: Une Saison au paradis / Breyten Breytenbach ; traduit par Jean Guiloineau
Translation into French from an intermediate language.
Short stories taken from: « Wardat al-sahra’ » and from « Aknusu al-chams ‘an al-sulûh », translated from the Arabic (Lebanon)
Resource described: Le cimetière des rêves: nouvelles / Hanan El-Cheikh ; traduites de l’arabe (Liban) par Yves Gonzalez-Quijano

Clean Copy
Change to RDA examples at 26.1.1.3

26.1.1.3 Referencing Related Expressions
Reference a related expression applying the general guidelines on referencing related works, expressions, manifestations, and items given under 24.4 RDA.

EXAMPLE
Identifier for the Related Expression

Revised as: Library of Congress control number: no2008127546
Identifier for the 1982 director’s cut version of the 1982 motion picture Blade runner
Abridged as: Library of Congress control number: no 91002344
Identifier for the English abridged version of Charles Alexandre de Calonne’s Requête au roi
Continued by: Izvestiya. Mathematics = ISSN 1064-5632
Resource described: Mathematics of the USSR. Izvestija. Related expression represented in the manifestation identified by key title and ISSN
EXAMPLE

**Authorized Access Point Representing the Related Expression**

*Revision of:* Roget, Peter Mark, 1779–1869. Thesaurus of English words and phrases
*Resource described:* Roget's Thesaurus of English words and phrases. – New edition / completely revised and modernized by Robert A. Dutch

*Expanded version of:* Saw, Swee-Hock, 1931–. Population control for zero growth in Singapore
*Resource described:* Population policies and programmes in Singapore / Saw Swee-Hock

*Resource described:* The threepenny opera / Bertolt Brecht ; translated by Ralph Manheim and John Willett ; with commentary and notes by Non and Nick Worrall

*Revised as:* Bauer, Michael D. Linux server security
*Resource described:* Building secure servers with Linux / Michael D. Bauer

*Supplement:* Adweek agency directory (Midwestern edition)
*Resource described:* Adweek. – Midwest edition

*Continued by:* Izvestiā Rossiĭskoĭ Akademii nauk. Seriĭa matematichesKāia. English
*Resource described:* Mathematics of the USSR. Izvestija

---

EXAMPLE

**Structured Description of the Related Expression**


*Abridged as:* The concise Oxford companion to Irish literature / edited by Robert Welch
*Resource described:* The Oxford companion to Irish literature / edited by Robert Welch ; assistant editor, Bruce Stewart

---

EXAMPLE

**Unstructured Description of the Related Expression**

Revised and shortened version of the author's thesis (Ph.D.)–Yale University, 1982

Revised edition of Lectures chantées, originally published in 1968

Recast in bronze from artist's plaster original of 1903

Shorter version of the 1969 motion picture of the same name
*Resource described:* Walt Whitman's Civil War / Churchill Films ; produced by Magus Films ; produced and directed by Frederic Goodich ; written by Neal Ruben
Issued also in Portuguese as: Air & space power journal em portugues; and in Spanish as: Air & space power journal español

Resource described: Air & space power journal

Also issued in other regional editions: Eastern edition; Midwest edition; New England edition; Southwest edition; and Western edition

Resource described: Adweek. – Southeast edition

Also available in a 45 min. abridged version

Resource described: Inside America's military academies / presented courtesy of the USAA Educational Foundation ; written and directed by Dan Jackson. – Unabridged version

“This concordance is based on Paul de Woestijne’s edition of Priscian's Periegesis” – Preface

26.1.1.4 Translations
The translation relationship between expressions should enable the user to know from which language the translation was made. When the related expression is recorded by means of an authorized access point or a structured or non structured description, the information on the language of the related expression is required in the authorized access point or in the description.

**EXAMPLE**

**Identifier for the Related Expression**

Translated as: http://bibpurl.oclc.org/web/14222

Resource described: After Amsterdam : sexual orientation and the European Union : a guide / ILGA-Europe. Related expressions represented in the manifestation identified by a resource identifier for French, German, Hungarian, Lithuanian, and Spanish translations

Translation of: http://catalogue.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/cb35047562h/

Resource described: Les noces de Cadmos et Harmonie / Roberto Calasso ; traduit de l'italien par Jean-Paul Manganaro.

Identifier in the National Library of France catalog for the Italian expression of Roberto Calasso’s Le nozze di Cadmo e Armonia, represented in the 1st published manifestation

**EXAMPLE**

**Authorized Access Point Representing the Related Expression**


Resource described: The long exile / Georges Simenon ; translated from the French by Eileen Ellenbogen

Translation of: Breytenbach, Breyten, 1939-..... 'n Seisoen in die paradys. English

Translation of: Calasso, Roberto, 1941-..... La folie Baudelaire. Italian
Resource described: La folie Baudelaire / Roberto Calasso ; traduit de l’italien par Jean-Paul Manganaro
The text of the original expression is in Italian although the original title is in French

Resource described: Lolita / Vladimir Nabokov ; nouvelle traduction de l’anglais et préface par Maurice Couturier

EXAMPLE
Structured Description of the Related Expression


EXAMPLE
Unstructured Description of the Related Expression

The English edition of a Spanish publication, which is also issued in French, German, and Arabic editions

Translated from the English version of an original text in Afrikaans
Resource described: Une Saison au paradis / Breyten Breytenbach ; traduit par Jean Guiloineau
Translation into French from an intermediate language.

Short stories taken from: « Wardat al-sahrâ’ » and from « Aknusu al-chams ‘an al-sutûh », translated from the Arabic (Lebanon)
Resource described: Le cimetière des rêves: nouvelles / Hanan El-Cheikh ; traduites de l’arabe (Liban) par Yves Gonzalez-Quijano