

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: EURIG
Subject: Representing language of expressions in RDA: Discussion Paper

Related Documents:

6JSC/EURIG/3 Language of expression – Revision of RDA 6.11, 6.11.1.3,
6.11.1.4, 7.12.1.3, 26.1.1.3

<http://www.rda-jsc.org/docs/docs/6JSC-EURIG-3.pdf>

1 Background

This discussion paper is intended to develop the ideas from 6/JSC/EURIG/3. This proposal was withdrawn following discussion at the 2012 JSC meeting in Chicago. The methodology proposed in 6/JSC/EURIG/3 was not accepted by JSC but EURIG believes that the underlying use cases should be addressed by RDA.

1.1 Use cases

6/JSC/EURIG/3 was intended to address the following use cases.

1. **IDENTIFY expressions in the Language in which the work was originally expressed**
To enable users to identify resources that reflect the linguistic content originally intended by creators of works, as opposed to resources that reflect translations
2. **SELECT Direct/indirect translation**
To enable users to identify translations and to distinguish between direct and indirect translations, as indirect translations are more likely to convey alterations to the conceptual content of the work embodied in the resource than direct translations. In the case of an indirect translation it may be useful to know the language of transmission, as it may have an influence on the nature of those alterations
3. **SELECT expressions by language of captions, dubbing, etc.**
To enable the user (including machines) to identify what part of a resource is in the stated language, e.g. the captions in a predominantly graphic work; or the commentary that accompanies an edition of a text, when the edited text and its commentary are not in the same language.

1.2 Support for the use cases in RDA

RDA provides two elements related to language and also has relationship designators, such as translated as/translation of, to express the nature of relationships between resources.

Language of Expression ▼ is a language in which a work is expressed.

Use case 1: IDENTIFY expressions in the Language in which the work was originally expressed

Partial: If the user knows the language in which the work was originally expressed, inclusion of the language of expression limits the search results, for example: Dickens (AU) AND Bleak House (TI) AND English (LNG). However if the user does not know the language of the original, this cannot be inferred from the Language of Expression.

Use case 2: SELECT direct/indirect translation

Not applicable: The type of translation is not an attribute of the Language of Expression.

Use case 3 SELECT expressions by language of captions, dubbing, etc.

Partial solution. Dubbed or subtitled versions of a film are considered to be distinct expressions (FRBR 3.2.1). In RDA they can be identified by language of expression if a separate description is created for each expression. In a composite record it is possible to repeat the Language of Expression for each expression, but it is not possible to specify the expression to which it is related.

Language of the Content ▼ is a language used to express the content of a resource.

Use case 1: IDENTIFY expressions in the Language in which the work was originally expressed

Not applicable: Language of the Content cannot be used to describe content of another expression. The element does not appear to be suitable for machine processing, as there is no controlled vocabulary.

Use case 2: SELECT direct/indirect translation

Partial solution: at best this element could indicate that the resource contains different expressions of the work, “Latin text; parallel English translation” However Language of the Content cannot be used to describe content of another manifestation. The element is unsuitable for machine processing, as there is no controlled vocabulary.

Use case 3 SELECT expressions by language of captions, dubbing, etc.

Partial. The content of the element is essentially a free text note. There is no controlled vocabulary. A user may select based on the information in the record, but a search could not be limited to exclude dubbed films.

translated as/translation of

Library of Congress and others noted that relationships can satisfy the requirements.

Use case 1 IDENTIFY expressions in the Language in which the work was originally expressed

Not supported. This enables users to link between expressions, it does not provide explicit information that the language of expression is the language in which the work was originally expressed.

Use case 2: SELECT direct/indirect translation

Not supported. A relationship cannot be used to record whether the translation is a direct or indirect translation.

Use case 3 SELECT expressions by language of captions, dubbing, etc.

Partial. Relationships are only relevant to this requirement if separate descriptions are created for each expression.

2 Suggestions for discussion

2.1 *Language in which the Work was Originally Expressed*

As the use cases illustrate, there are circumstances in which it may be necessary to identify all the expressions using the language in which the work was originally expressed. The draft of RDA Part B proposed Original Language of the Work (6.8), but this was rejected on the grounds that language is not an attribute of the Work in FRBR. However an element of this type would meet the need identified in Use Case 1 and partially satisfies Use Case 3.

Language in which the Work was Originally Expressed

Scope

Language in which the work was originally expressed is the language of the first expression of the work.

2.1.1 Questions:

1. Do you agree that this element is an attribute of the work?
2. If so, where should it go in RDA? There appear to be 3 options
 - a. Following 6.5 Place of Origin of the Work, i.e. displacing Other Distinguishing Characteristic of the Work (6.6) and all subsequent elements. This would result in extensive renumbering.
 - b. 6.7 History of the Work. Redefine History of the Work to accommodate “Language in which the Work was Originally Expressed” as a subelement or element subtype.
 - c. At the end of Chapter 6.

2.2 *Language of Expression Statement*

Use Cases 2 and 3 identify specific attributes of expressions which cannot be explicitly recorded in RDA. In order to satisfy Use Case 2, it has to be possible to specify whether a translation is direct or indirect. In order to satisfy Use Case 3 the method by which the language is expressed, e.g. subtitling; dubbing, captioning, must be made explicit. In both

use cases, it is necessary to relate these to the languages, as can currently be done in MARC 21 field 041.

It is proposed to remodel Language of Expression as a sub-element of a broader element, provisionally designated Language of Expression Statement.

6.11 Language of Expression Statement

Language of Expression Statement identifies the language of expression, the translation aspect (direct, indirect...) and the method in which it is expressed.

Scope: Language of Expression is a core element. Other sub-elements of Language of Expression Statement are optional.

6.11.X Language of Expression (Core)

Language of Expression ▼ is a language in which a work is expressed.

6.11.Y Translation aspect is the status of the language of expression with regard to the Language in which the Work was Originally Expressed

direct translation	the language of expression has been translated from the language in which the work was originally expressed
indirect translation	the language of expression has been translated from a language other than the language in which the work was originally expressed
not translated	the language of expression has not been translated
translation	the language of expression has been translated but the source is uncertain

6.11.Z Method of Expression

Method of expression is the means by which the language of expression is articulated:

captioned	the language of expression is articulated through captions
dubbed	the language of expression is articulated by dubbing
subtitled	the language of expression is articulated through subtitles
commented on	the expression is accompanied by a comment in a different language
abstracted	the expression is accompanied by an abstract in a different language

Examples:

Indirect translation of a novel

Creator	Zola, Emile
Preferred Title for Work	Germinal (Novel)
Language in which the work was originally expressed	French
Language of Expression Statement	
Language of Expression	Japanese
Translation aspect	indirect translation
Relationship: translated from	Zola, Emile Germinal (English)

Motion picture with original expression + dubbed and subtitled expressions

Preferred Title for Work	Germinal (Motion Picture)
Language in which the work was originally expressed	French
Language of Expression Statement	
Language of Expression	French
Translation aspect	not translated
Language of Expression Statement	
Language of Expression	French
Translation aspect	not translated
Method of Expression	subtitled
Language of Expression Statement	
Language of Expression	German
Translation aspect	translated
Method of Expression	subtitled
Language of Expression Statement	
Language of Expression	English
Translation aspect	translated
Method of Expression	subtitled
Method of Expression	dubbed

A drawing of the 18th century with a caption in French, here transcribed in its original spelling:

Preferred Title for Work	Vue intérieure de Paris représentant le port au blé depuis le marché aux vaux jusque au pont Notre Dame
Language in which the work was originally expressed	French
Language of Expression Statement	
Language of Expression	French

Translation aspect	not translated
Method of Expression	Captions

2.2.1 Questions:

1. Do you agree with this approach?
2. We have called this umbrella element a “Statement”, but that term has only been used in relation to manifestation elements (it is derived from ISBD). Is it appropriate in this context?
3. Are the proposed terms sufficient to meet known requirements?
4. Are there other sub-elements that should be included?