

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA

From: Alan Danskin, BL Representative

Subject: Revision of RDA 2.5.2.1, 2.5.2.2 Designation of Edition, addition in Chapter 2 of a core element for Format of Notated Music Statement, revision of affected chapters in RDA (0.6.2, Core Elements - Section 1: Recording Attributes of Manifestation and Item; 1.3, Core Elements; 1.4, Language and Script; 2.2.4, Other Sources of Information; 2.20 Note on Manifestation or Item; 18.6, Note on Persons, Families, and Corporate Bodies Associated with a Resource; Appendix A; Glossary).

The BL thanks IAML for its thoughtful proposal to provide a new element to explicitly identify the Musical Presentation Statement. We are not convinced that there is a requirement to add a new element to RDA.

IAML proposes the introduction of a new element 2.X Musical Presentation Statement. An analysis of the scope, sources, sub-elements and instructions proposed for the new element exhibits a very high level of commonality with 2.5 Edition Statement, which leads us to question whether a new element is really necessary.

We prefer to focus on the similarities between the “statements” rather than the differences between Editions and Musical Presentation. Musical Presentation is not the same as an Edition, but both statements are intended to tell the prospective user how the resource in hand differs from other manifestations of the same work: for example, this manifestation is the second revised edition of work A, this manifestation is the vocal score of Work X.

We acknowledge that labelling the second of the statements as Edition Statement may be confusing to the end user and one solution to this would be to define a new element as IAML propose. However, we think that it may be more efficient to consider whether the same outcome could be achieved by changing the language of the existing instructions.

At its simplest this could be achieved by renaming the element as Edition and Musical Presentation Statement and changing wording accordingly.