

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: John Attig, ALA Representative
Subject: Major title changes for serials in Chinese, Japanese and Korean ...

ALA thanks the ISSN Network for this discussion of issues relating to title changes for serials in Chinese, Japanese, and Korean. ALA agrees that these issues deserve attention, and encourages the ISSN Network to investigate the issues further and to prepare a revision proposal, if warranted.

ALA does not have a consensus on the form that a revision proposal should take. Several reviewers believe that the “first five words” guideline has served the community well for serials in languages that divide text into words, and would therefore prefer that any revision proposal address only the application to Chinese, Japanese, or Korean. On the other hand, several reviewers (including the Council of East Asian Libraries) have a strong preference for the sort of broader approach outlined in Option 2 of the paper. (The CEAL response is included as an appendix below.)

There was also concern that the terms “content word/element” and “function word/element” would need to be carefully defined if they were to serve in guidelines for determining major changes.

Appendix

Response from Council on East Asian Libraries response

The Committee on Technical Processing (CTP) of the Council on East Asian Libraries (CEAL) discussed the ISSN’s Major title changes for serials in Chinese, Japanese, and Korean (RDA 2.3.2.13.1, ISBD A.2.6.1 and ISSN 2.3.1), discussion paper about the “first five words” rule. The CTP also consulted a few serial catalogers outside the Committee. The majority of us are in favor of the ISSN option 2. We posted draft response to the CEAL community as well as OCLC CJK users community for additional comments.

In general, the CEAL community supports the option 2 in the ISSN discussion paper, the proposal of removing “any reference to counting” so the wording could be:

... The following are to be considered major changes:

(xxx) when the addition, deletion, change or reordering of any content word/content element occurs anywhere in the title proper [and changes the meanings of the title proper or indicates a different subject matter]

if the following conditions are met:

- If its test confirms the change “does not increase the number of occasions where new descriptions are created” and
- If the definition/instruction helps to distinguish between “content” and “function” elements

Comments on additional issues

During the discussion and preparation of CEAL response to 6JSC/ISSN/2, two other issues brought up that are not explicitly listed in the 2011 JSC, ISBD, and ISSN Outcomes (<http://www.rda-jsc.org/JSCISBDISSNOutcomesfinal.pdf>) that the CEAL community suggests the ISSN Network to address:

1. Harmonization of source and choice of titles proper

As long as international harmonization of handling serial changes is one of the goals, other issues, such as the source and choice of titles proper, should also be examined. Beyond the difficulty that this proposal tries to address of comparing two titles chosen out of serial issues, the provision at ISSN, 1.6.2, for instance, is not always in line with that at RDA, 2.2.3.1, a). Thus, recording of completely different titles proper, based on those incompatible provisions, is rather frequent for serials and integrating resources published in East Asia.

A typical example is:

Situation:

Primary language of the text inside: Japanese

Title page: English title only

Cover: English title prominently presented, followed by smaller-font Japanese title

Both the National Diet Library of Japan and the National Institute of Informatics union catalog in Japan took the English title on title page as the title proper. However, in the U.S., following the provision at RDA, 2.2.3.1, a), the Japanese (and not English) title had to be recorded as the title proper.

The CEAL community suggests that the ISSN Network work with the JSC of RDA to harmonize the ISSN Manual and RDA in provision for the source and choice of serial titles proper.

2. Harmonization of word division in Romanization for CJK Languages

In 6JSC/ISSN/2, Françoise Pellé, Director, ISSN International Centre, elaborately described the complicated situations of mechanically-constructed “word” in romanized fields of CJK bibliographic entity. The word division discrepancies in Romanization are among cataloging utilities, ISSN centers, link resolvers, and vendors. (See examples below)

It has resulted in incorrect searches in ISSN or OCLC, misidentification of title changes, creation of duplicate records, and linking problems due to unmatched titles among bib records (ISSN, OCLC, KBs, OPAC, etc.), especially for titles without ISSN or with incorrect ISSN. Note that the ISSN Portal has no non-Roman scripts, which worsens the situation.

Recently ISO called for review and revision for its Chinese and Japanese Romanization standards: ISO 7098 for Chinese Romanization and ISO 3602 for Japanese Romanization.

The CEAL community suggests that:

- a. The ISSN Network consider including all language scripts in the ISSN Portal.
- b. The ISSN Network, ISO, and JSC of RDA meet with applicable international agencies to harmonize word division standards for CJK Romanization.

中国史研究动态 [1002-7971](#)

ISSN	Zhongguoshi yanjiu dongtai
ALA-LC	Zhongguo shi yan jiu dong tai (OCLC# 7427570)
Vendor	Zhongguo Shi Yanjiu Dongtai
SFX	zhong guo shi yan jiu dong tai

中國學志 [0913-3151](#)

ISSN	Chūgokugakushi (Osaka)
ALA-LC	Chūgokugaku shi (OCLC#29306120)
NDL	Chūgoku gakushi ((JTNDL)000000047529)
SFX	Chūgokugaku shi
SFX	Chugokugakushi

韓國 資源 植物 學會 誌 [1225-8989](#)

ISSN	Dong-yang jaweon sigmul hag-hoeji
ALA-LC	Han'guk Chawŏn Singmul Hakhoe chi (OCLC#37567842)
SFX	Han'guk Chawŏn Singmul Hakhoe chi

지질학회지 [0435-4036](#)

ISSN	Jijirhag hoiji
ALA-LC	Chijil Hakhoe chi (OCLC#8605894)
SFX	Chijil Hakhoe chi
SFX	Jijirhag hoiji