

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Kathy Glennan, ALA Representative to the JSC
Subject: Proposed revisions for medium of performance (RDA 6.15.1, 6.28.1.9, 6.28.1.10, and Appendix E.1.1)

ALA thanks the RDA Music Joint Working Group for preparing this thoughtful and detailed proposal that separates the concept of recording attributes for the medium of performance as data from the use of medium of performance attributes in the creation of authorized access points. We support the proposal but offer the following clarifications and additional comments, developed in consultation with the Music Library Association.

6.15.1.5.1 Number of Hands

ALA would support adding a clarifying statement to the first example in the final example block for 6.15.1.5.1, stating why the number of hands is not recorded for “organs (2)”, if the JSC believes that this would be helpful to non-music specialists.

6.15.1.5.2 Pitch and Range of Instruments

In the optional addition, ALA recommends changing “or” to “and/or” to accommodate situations when both the key and the range is included. If desired, an example to illustrate this situation could be added, such as: “B-flat tenor saxophone”.

Marked-up copy, based on 6JSC/Music/3 clean copy of 6.15.1.5.2:

Optional addition

If considered important for identification and access, record the designation of key in which an instrument is pitched and/or terms indicating the range of an instrument.

[Examples unchanged]

6.15.1.5.3 Alternative and Doubling Instruments

ALA recommends splitting this instruction into its component parts for greater clarity, since the difference between an alternative and a doubling instrument is significant. We also believe that piano should only be recorded once in the alternative instrument example. We propose the following:

Marked-up copy, based on 6JSC/Music/3 clean copy of 6.15.1.5.3:

6.15.1.5.3 Alternative ~~and Doubling~~ Instruments

Record the names of alternative ~~and doubling~~ instruments.

EXAMPLE

clarinet

piano

viola

piano

Resource described: Sonata for clarinet (or viola) and piano, e flat major, op. 120, no. 2 / Johannes Brahms

flute

piccolo

piano

Resource described: Nataraja : for flute (doubling piccolo) and piano / Jonathan Harvey

Optional omission

Omit doubling instruments.

EXAMPLE

flute

oboe

clarinet

horn

bassoon

Resource described: Quintet for flute, oboe (doubling English horn), clarinet, French horn & bassoon, op. 43 / Carl Nielsen

6.15.1.5.4 Doubling Instruments

Record the names of doubling instruments.

EXAMPLE

flute

piccolo

piano

Resource described: Nataraja : for flute (doubling piccolo) and piano / Jonathan Harvey

Optional omission

Omit doubling instruments.

EXAMPLE

flute

oboe

clarinet

horn

bassoon

Resource described: Quintet for flute, oboe (doubling English horn), clarinet, French horn & bassoon, op. 43 / Carl Nielsen

Clean copy:

6.15.1.5.3 Alternative Instruments

Record the names of alternative instruments.

EXAMPLE

clarinet

viola

piano

Resource described: Sonata for clarinet (or viola) and piano, e flat major, op. 120, no. 2 / Johannes Brahms

6.15.1.5.4 Doubling Instruments

Record the names of doubling instruments.

EXAMPLE

flute

piccolo

piano

Resource described: Nataraja : for flute (doubling piccolo) and piano / Jonathan Harvey

Optional omission

Omit doubling instruments.

EXAMPLE

flute

oboe

clarinet

horn

bassoon

Resource described: Quintet for flute, oboe (doubling English horn), clarinet, French horn & bassoon, op. 43 / Carl Nielsen

6.15.1.6 Accompanying Ensembles with One Performer to a Part

ALA has concerns about the Alternative, which allows for the recording of the individual instruments in the accompanying ensemble being recorded “instead of or in addition to” the name of the ensemble. We recommend removing the option to record the individual accompanying instruments in addition to the ensemble, since it could be difficult to identify the solo vs. accompanying instruments if the ensemble is also recorded. To avoid this ambiguity, the alternative should only present one choice: “instead of”.

Marked-up copy, based on 6JSC/Music/3 clean copy of 6.15.1.6:

Alternative

For an accompanying ensemble with one performer to a part, record the appropriate term for each instrument of the accompanying ensemble instead of ~~or in addition to~~ the name of the ensemble.

[Examples unchanged]

6.15.1.8 One or More Solo Instruments and Accompanying Ensemble

ALA suggests the following rewording to clarify that there could be more than one term used in naming an accompanying ensemble, not multiple ensembles. We also believe it would be useful to reference the earlier instructions.

Marked-up copy, based on 6JSC/Music/3 clean copy of 6.15.1.8:

6.15.1.8 One or More Solo Instruments and Accompanying Ensemble

For a work for one or more solo instruments and accompanying ensemble, record ~~one or more the term or terms~~ for the solo instrument or instruments by applying the instructions at 6.15.1.5, and ~~one or more the term or terms~~ for the accompanying ensemble by applying the instructions at 6.15.1.6.

[Remainder of instruction and examples unchanged]

Clean copy:

6.15.1.8 One or More Solo Instruments and Accompanying Ensemble

For a work for one or more solo instruments and accompanying ensemble, record the term or terms for the solo instrument or instruments by applying the instructions at 6.15.1.5, and the term or terms for the accompanying ensemble by applying the instructions at 6.15.1.6.

[Remainder of instruction and examples unchanged]

6.15.1.11.4 Medium Unspecified

ALA recommends the following rewording of the exception.

Marked-up copy, based on 6JSC/Music/3 clean copy of 6.15.1.11.4:

6.15.1.8 One or More Solo Instruments and Accompanying Ensemble

If no medium of performance is specified by the composer, and none can be ascertained from any other source, record *unspecified*.

Exception

If: there are two or more such works by the same composer,

~~no medium of performance is specified by the composer and none can be ascertained from any other source~~

and

~~there are two or more such works by the same composer that have the same preferred title~~

then:

record the number of parts or voices.

Use *voices* to indicate both vocal and instrumental parts.

[examples unchanged]

Clean copy:

6.15.1.8 One or More Solo Instruments and Accompanying Ensemble

If no medium of performance is specified by the composer, and none can be ascertained from any other source, record *unspecified*.

Exception

If there are two or more such works by the same composer, record the number of parts or voices. Use *voices* to indicate both vocal and instrumental parts.

[examples unchanged]

Area for Future Work

In the course of reviewing this proposal, ALA identified an existing instruction that could benefit from rewording. We recommend that the RDA Music Joint Working Group work to clarify the first exception regarding percussion under 6.15.1.4 (Instrumental Music Intended for One Performer to a Part). We are uncertain why the instruction refers to instruments not specified “in the original title” when determining whether or not the term *percussion* should be used.