To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA  
From: Christine Frodl, DNB Representative  
Subject: Proposed revisions for medium of performance  
(RDA 6.15.1, 6.28.1.9, 6.28.1.10, and Appendix E.1.1)

DNB thanks the RDA Music Joint Working Group. We agree with the proposal and the suggested changes.

However, we do not understand the suggestion, that solo voices in choral works should be data elements (proposal 6.15.1.9), but should be omitted „as part of an authorized access point“ (see proposal 6.28.1.9.1.g). We regard this as not consistent.

We suggest that also voices with their accompanying instruments should be recorded within an authorized access point in the case of Lieder und Songs. The word accompaniment leads to different words or word combinations which are not suitable for an effective retrieval (e. g. mit Begleitung einer Gitarre; mit Begleitung einer Klarinette und einer Viola; mit Begleitung eines Fagotts) when translated into German. Furthermore recording also the voices with their accompaniments (Lieder und Songs) would lead to increased transparency and usability of the authorized access points for this genre. The new proposed rule 6.28.1.9.1. Exception h therefore should be deleted.

We do not agree with rule 6.28.1.9.1 Exception b. This rule tells us, that the number of instruments will not be recorded, if the number of instruments is implicit in the title. The statement, that the number of instruments is apparent through the preferred title has no relevance for machine-readability and data consistency.

We would like to offer a suggestion for the unsolved problem regarding solo voices that can be sung by either a soprano or tenor voice under „future directions“:

Voice ranges regarding voices „as a data element“ according to proposal 6.15.1.9 should be given as they appear on the resource: that means “Sopran” or “Tenor” as well as “für Singstimme hoch”.

Voice ranges „as a part of an authorized access point“ according to proposal 6.28 with an exception (preferably prior to proposal 6.28.1.9.1.g). For example: For the designation of solo voice ranges within the authorized access point use only the designations voice range (high), voice range (medium), voice range (low).

There should be an explanation in the glossary which voice ranges are considered as high, medium and low, but also which ones are not, for example countertenor.

For retrieval purposes it would be better to give the instruments in singular and not in singular and plural forms (proposal 6.15.1.5). We would also prefer a list with German-language controlled vocabulary.