To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA  
From: Dave Reser, LC Representative  
Subject: Revision proposal for RDA 6.28.3, Authorized Access Point Representing a Musical Expression

We greatly appreciate the analysis suggested revisions proposed by the Joint Music Working Group. We agree to most aspects of the proposal, but have one area that we would prefer to see treated differently.

This response consists of:

General Comments
Responses to Specific Instruction Changes
Instruction Changes Not in the Proposal
Appendix I: Alternative Approach to 6.28.3

General Comments

1. The JMWG notes that the current instructions for 6.28.3 contain an unnecessary limitation on identifying expressions when they are arrangements, sketches, vocal scores, and chorus scores:
   a) one limitation is that the instructions do not cover situations where more than one of these types of expressions exist (e.g., an expression that is both an arrangement and a sketch).
      
      LC agrees: this limitation should not be present
   b) a second limitation noted is that an arrangement, sketch, vocal score, etc., could not also use an additional expression attribute such as language of expression, content type, date of expression, or other distinguishing characteristic of the expression when needed or desired.
      
      LC agrees: this limitation should not be present

2. The JMWG noted a problem with Added accompaniments in 6.28.3.3 and proposed deletion of that instruction since they are not considered to be arrangements.
   
   LC agrees: the deletion from 6.28.3.3 is correct, but we believe that any resulting exception belongs at the element level instruction in 6.18.1.4.

3. The JMWG proposed to removal of 6.28.3.6 for “Translations,” with the exception of the paragraph about resources with more than one language expression that would be moved to the general instruction at 6.27.3.
   
   LC agrees: The deletion is fine, and moving the paragraph from the music instruction to the general instruction for language expressions is fine, but we suggest a slight change to the wording below. This solves a problem that often arises in general cataloging (more than one language expression), but we note that a resource can contain different expressions of the same work that are not language expressions (e.g., different editions)—the JSC may want to consider a broadening of this general instruction in the future.
4. The JMWG has aligned the definition of arrangement with the definition in the glossary.
   **LC agrees.**

5. The JMWG has proposed treating arrangements for works in the popular idiom as an exception rather than as a separate instruction.
   **LC agrees.**

6. In the discussion of “Other Alternatives,” the JMWG indicated that they considered whether the instructions at 6.28.3.2-6.28.3.6 could be deleted, and chose not to remove them.

LC agrees with keeping the instructions, but for a different reason. The JMWG proposal seeks ultimate flexibility in making additions to the authorized access points for expressions. For example, it would no longer be necessary to identify an arrangement as an arrangement, it could be identified using another expression attribute, such as date of expression, **instead of** “arranged.” As indicated earlier in our general comments, we support the concept that additional expression attributes should be allowed, but **in addition to** an indication that an expression is an arrangement, not **instead of**. We think it would be more useful to users to identify these special types of expressions (along with other additional attributes when necessary). We are also concerned that managing a large authority file will become more difficult if some consistency in approach is not expected. For example, the authorized access point for the expression “Berlioz, Hector, 1803-1869. Le corsaire (Brand)” established by one cataloger may not be recognized as an arrangement by another cataloger who might establish “Berlioz, Hector, 1803-1869. Le corsaire; arranged” for the same expression. At the very least, cataloging agencies might need to establish local policies to prevent this unintended duplication, but we believe that RDA itself should establish some degree of consistency when possible.

If the JSC and JMWG agree with this approach, we have taken the liberty of drafting a revision to the 6.28.3 instruction that incorporates the flexibility concept sought by the JMWG, but with an exception to always represent an arrangement, sketch, vocal score, or chorus score as such (with additional attributes as needed).

Our alternative proposal for the 6.28.3 instructions are attached to this response as Appendix I.

**Responses to Specific Instruction Changes**

**Change to 6.11.1.3. We agree (with editorial comment)**

The paragraph should not be left with a simple list since there is now only one item in the list. We have proposed a change to the third paragraph to correct the format:

For instructions on recording language of expression as part of authorized access points representing expressions of special types of works, **religious works**, see additional instructions at: 6.30.3.1–6.30.3.3.
expressions of musical works (6.28.3.6)
expressions of religious works (6.30.3.1 – 6.30.3.3).

Changes to 6.18.1.4:

1) Rephrase categories in ordered list at 6.18.1.4: **We agree (with comment)**

   We agree to replace “simplified versions” with “simplifications or modifications” in b). But, we think the phrase “that do not result in new works” in a) and b) is not necessary. The concept that an expression is not a new work is inherent in the definition of expression and is explained in RDA.

2) Rephrase second paragraph at 6.18.1.4. **We agree**

3) Rephrase the exception at 6.18.1.4. **We agree (with editorial comment for JSC Secretary)**

   We noticed that this instruction contains an ordered list with “either/or” operators. This instruction and 6.28.3.2.2 are the only instructions in RDA that illustrate this construction. For ease of maintenance, we wonder if this can be a simple or list that is not ordered? We defer to the JSC Secretary’s recommendation on this matter.

4) Delete 6.18.1.4.1. **We agree**

Changes to 6.27.3:

1) Add “authorized” to the first sentence in 6.27.3. **We agree**

2) Add instruction for compilations of multiple language expressions of a work. **We agree, but with a slight change in the wording suggested. See also General Comment 3, above.**

   For a compilation of language expressions of the same work, construct authorized access points for each of the expressions using the language of expression for each.

3) Add references for special types of expressions. **We agree (with comment)**

   The instructions for expressions of official communications and legal works just say to use the authorized access point for the work plus and addition from 6.27.3, so the references from 6.27.3 to 6.29.2 and from 6.27.3 to 6.31.2 would
only cause a cyclical loop. We have proposed alternative wording for references to 6.28.3 and 6.30.3, which would be the last 2 paragraphs of 6.27.3:

For additional instructions on constructing authorized access points for expressions of musical works, see 6.28.3.

For additional instructions on constructing authorized access points for expressions of religious works, see 6.30.3.

Changes to 6.28.3.1:

See General Comment 6, and Appendix I for an alternative approach.

Additional Instruction Changes Not in the Proposal

Proposed Revision to 6.18.1.1 and Glossary:

In comparing the definition of the general element Other distinguishing characteristic of the expression (6.12) and the definition of Other distinguishing characteristic of the expression of a musical work (6.18), we think the definition of the latter needs revision. We suggest broadening the definition for the musical element in order to provide the flexibility sought by the JMW in order to clarify that expression attributes other than arrangement, key, vocal score, etc., may be recorded. We also noticed that this element has no definition in the glossary, so we suggest adding one.

6.18.1.1 Scope

Other distinguishing characteristic of the expression of a musical work is a characteristic other than content type, language of expression, or date of expression that serves to differentiate an expression of a musical work from another expression of the same work (e.g., an arrangement, sketches, vocal score).

Glossary

Other distinguishing characteristic of the expression of a musical work is a characteristic other than content type, language of expression, or date of expression. It serves to differentiate an expression of a musical work from another expression of the same work.

Proposed Revision to 6.18.1.3
6.12.1.3 cannot be applied to musical expressions as RDA is currently written, as 6.12.1.1 says, “For additional instructions on other distinguishing characteristics of expressions of musical works, see 6.18.” As the JMWG indicated, 6.18 only allows for terms used in 6.18.1.4-6.18.1.6 to be recorded as Other distinguishing characteristic of the expression of a musical work—it does not refer back to 6.12 for attributes other than those listed at 6.18.1.4-6.18.1.6. Broadening the definition of Other distinguishing characteristic of the expression of a musical work, and providing additional examples, should make the issue clear.

### 6.18.1.3 Recording Other Distinguishing Characteristics of the Expression of a Musical Work

Record the other distinguishing characteristics of the expression of a musical work, by applying the instructions at 6.18.1.4\[RDA\]–6.18.1.6\[RDA\], as applicable.

**EXAMPLE**

**Remix**

**Hendrix**

An expression of The Star-Spangled Banner performed by Jimmy Hendrix

**Houston**

An expression of The Star-Spangled Banner performed by Whitney Houston

**Radio edit**

An expression of the song Heroes by David Bowie and Brian Eno that has been edited for airplay

**Boosey & Hawkes**

An expression of Edward Elgar’s Sea pictures published in 1900 by Boosey & Hawkes

**Intaglio**

An expression of Edward Elgar’s Sea pictures published in 1991 by Intaglio

arranged

**Sketches**

**Vocal score**

Apply the additional instructions at 6.18.1.4–6.18.6, as applicable.

[last paragraph unchanged]
JMWG proposed deletion of the section on “Added Accompaniments, Etc.” at 6.28.3.3; and proposed an exception in the authorized access point instruction in 6.28.3.1. We suggest that the exception should be added instead as a second exception to 6.18.1.4 so that it is at the element level.

**Exception**

For a musical work to which an accompaniment or other parts have been added with no alteration of the original music, do not record *arranged*.

**Proposed Revision to 6.28.1.1., last paragraph:**

Since the JMWG was reinforcing that added accompaniments were not arrangements, we wondered if replacing that category in the “e.g.” statement with “sketches” might assist with this understanding.

For new expressions of an existing work (e.g., musical arrangements, sketches, works with added accompaniment), apply the instructions on constructing authorized access points representing musical expressions at 6.28.3.

**Proposed Revision to Appendix E**

In reviewing the impact of this proposal on Appendix E.1.2.5, we noticed some changes that should be made. For example, the instruction “Precede other identifying elements for music by a comma and a space” should be deleted because it does not actually apply to any element for a musical work or expression, and it would cause confusion about whether the “other distinguishing characteristics of a musical expression should be punctuated like this or enclosed in parentheses. The format of E.1.2.5 has been troublesome to us, because 1) some of the instructions use AACR2 terminology, 2) instructions applicable for all types of works and expressions are mixed with instructions for special types of works and expressions; and 3) the numerous paragraphs of instructions are lengthy and difficult to read even though the paragraphs are short. Therefore we suggest this revision to Appendix E, with new sub-instructions for special types of works and expressions.

**Mark-up Version:**

**E.1.2.5 Access Points Representing Works and Expressions**

Apply the instructions at [E.1.2.2RDA–E.1.2.4RDA](#) for the punctuation of the portion of the access point that represents the person, family, or corporate body, as applicable, when the access point representing a work is constructed by combining (in this order):

a) an access point representing a person, family, or corporate body
b) a preferred or variant title for the work.

For additional instructions on punctuation of access points representing special types of works and expressions, see:
musical works and expressions (E.1.2.5.1)
legal works (E.1.2.5.2)
religious works and expressions (E.1.2.5.3).

Precede a designation and/or title for part of a work by a full stop and a space.

Enclose a word, phrase, date, or other designation used for conflict resolution in parentheses.

Enclose these elements in parentheses:
  - form of work
  - date of work
  - place of origin of the work
  - other distinguishing characteristic of the work
  - date of expression
  - other distinguishing characteristic of the expression.

When multiple elements are enclosed in parentheses, separate them with a space, colon, space.

Separate a word, phrase, date, or other designation used for conflict resolution from another word, phrase, date, or other designation also used for conflict resolution by a space, colon, space.

Precede the name of a language of expression by a full stop and a space.

Precede the content type by a full stop and a space.

Enclose the year of promulgation of a law, etc., in parentheses.

Enclose the date of a treaty in parentheses.

Precede the name of the language of a sacred scripture by a full stop and a space.

Precede the conventional collective title Selections by a full stop and a space.

Precede the name of the version of a sacred scripture by a full stop and a space.

Precede an alternative designation for the version of a sacred scripture by a full stop and a space.

Precede the year of publication of a sacred scripture by a full stop and a space.

Precede medium of performance by a comma and a space.

Enclose the number of parts or players in parentheses.

Precede the number of hands by a comma and a space.

Precede a numeric identifying element for music by a comma and a space.

Precede key for music by a comma and a space.

Precede other identifying elements for music by a comma and a space.

Enclose a descriptive word or phrase for music in parentheses.

Enclose the term Sketches in parentheses.

Precede the term arranged by a semicolon and a space.
Precede the terms Vocal score and Chorus score by a full stop and a space.
Precede the terms Libretto and Text by a full stop and a space.
Precede the name of the language of a vocal musical work by a full stop and a space.

E.1.2.5.1 Access Points Representing Musical Works and Expressions
For instructions on punctuation of work and expression elements not listed here, see E.1.2.5.

Precede medium of performance by a comma and a space.

Enclose the number of parts or players in parentheses.

Precede the number of hands by a comma and a space.

Precede a numeric designation for a musical work by a comma and a space.

Precede key for music by a comma and a space.

Precede the term arranged by a semicolon and a space.

Enclose an other distinguishing characteristic of a musical expression (except arranged) in parentheses.

Precede the terms Libretto and Text by a full stop and a space.

E.1.2.5.2. Access Points Representing Legal Works
For instructions on punctuation of work and expression elements not listed here, see E.1.2.5.

Precede the term Protocols, etc. by a full stop and a space.

Enclose the year of promulgation of a law, etc., in parentheses.

Enclose the date of a treaty in parentheses.

E.1.2.5.3 Access Points Representing Religious Works and Expressions
For instructions on punctuation of work and expressions elements not listed here, see E.1.2.5.
Precede the name of the version of a sacred scripture by a full stop and a space.

Precede an alternative designation for the version of a sacred scripture by a full stop and a space.

Precede the year of publication of a sacred scripture by a full stop and a space.

Clean Copy:

E.1.2.5 Access Points Representing Works and Expressions

Apply the instructions at E.1.2.2 RDA–E.1.2.4 RDA for the punctuation of the portion of the access point that represents the person, family, or corporate body, as applicable, when the access point representing a work is constructed by combining (in this order):

a) an access point representing a person, family, or corporate body
b) a preferred or variant title for the work.

For additional instructions on punctuation of access points representing special types of works and expressions, see:

musical works and expressions (E.1.2.5.1)
legal works (E.1.2.5.2)
religious works and expressions (E.1.2.5.3).

Precede a designation and/or title for part of a work by a full stop and a space.

Enclose these elements in parentheses:

form of work
date of work
place of origin of the work
other distinguishing characteristic of the work
date of expression
other distinguishing characteristic of the expression.

When multiple elements are enclosed in parentheses, separate them with a space, colon, space.

Precede the language of expression by a full stop and a space.

Precede the content type by a full stop and a space.
Precede the conventional collective title *Selections* by a full stop and a space.

**E.1.2.5.1 Access Points Representing Musical Works and Expressions**

For instructions on punctuation of work and expression elements not listed here, see E.1.2.5.

Precede medium of performance by a comma and a space.

Enclose the number of parts or players in parentheses.

Precede the number of hands by a comma and a space.

Precede a numeric designation for a musical work by a comma and a space.

Precede key for music by a comma and a space.

Precede the term *arranged* by a semicolon and a space.

Enclose an other distinguishing characteristic of a musical expression (except *arranged*) in parentheses.

Precede the terms *Libretto* and *Text* by a full stop and a space.

**E.1.2.5.2. Access Points Representing Legal Works**

For instructions on punctuation of work and expression elements not listed here, see E.1.2.5.

Precede the term *Protocols, etc.* by a full stop and a space.

Enclose the year of promulgation of a law, etc., in parentheses.

Enclose the date of a treaty in parentheses.

**E.1.2.5.3 Access Points Representing Religious Works and Expressions**

For instructions on punctuation of work and expressions elements not listed here, see E.1.2.5.

Precede the name of the version of a sacred scripture by a full stop and a space.
Precede an alternative designation for the version of a sacred scripture by a full stop and a space.

Precede the year of publication of a sacred scripture by a full stop and a space.
Appendix I: Alternative Approach to 6.28.3

As noted in General Comment 6, we suggested an alternative approach to 6.28.3 that:

- Provides for most of the expanded flexibility sought by JMWG
- Retains the ability to consistently identifying certain types of expressions (arrangements, sketches, vocal scores, chorus scores)
- Relies on an expanded definition of Other distinguishing characteristic of the musical expression (so reference back to 6.12 is not necessary)
- Preserves explicit guidelines on constructing authorized access points in sub-instructions

6.28.3.1 General Guidelines on Constructing Authorized Access Points Representing Musical Expressions

Construct an authorized access point representing a particular expression of a musical work or a part or parts of a musical work by combining (in this order):

a) the authorized access point representing the work (see 6.28.1) or part or parts of the work (see 6.28.2), as applicable
b) one or more terms from the following list:
   
   i) the content type (see 6.9)
   
   ii) the date of expression (see 6.10)
   
   iii) the language of expression (see 6.11)

   and/or

   iv) another distinguishing characteristic of the expression of a musical work (see 6.18).

EXAMPLE

Bizet, Georges, 1838–1875. Carmen. German


Bizet, Georges, 1838–1875. Carmen. Italian

Resource described: Carmen : dramma lirico in quattro atti / Georges Bizet.


Mozart, Wolfgang Amadeus, 1756-1791. Requiem, K. 626, D minor (Erato Disques)


Monnot, Marguerite. Hymne à l’amour. English. Performed music (Lynn)
Authorized access point for a performance by Vera Lynn in an English translation

Monnot, Marguerite. Hymne à l'amour. English. Performed music (Lauper)

Authorized access point for a performance by Cindy Lauper in an English translation

**Exception**

Apply the instructions at 6.28.3.2–6.28.3.6 when constructing the authorized access point for a musical expression that falls into one or more of these categories: representing one of the following types of musical expression:

- arrangements, transcriptions, etc. (see 6.28.3.2)
- added accompaniments, etc. (see 6.28.3.3)
- sketches (see 6.28.3.4)
- vocal and chorus scores (see 6.28.3.5)
- translations (see 6.28.3.6).

### 6.28.3.2 Arrangements, Transcriptions, Etc.

Apply this instruction at 6.28.3.2.1–6.28.3.2.2 apply to an arrangement, transcription, etc., of one or more works of one composer (or of parts of one composer’s works) if the arrangement, transcription, etc., falls into one or more of the following categories:

- arrangements, transcriptions, versions, settings, etc., in which music for one medium of performance has been rewritten for another
- simplified simplifications or modifications versions of previously existing musical works.

Apply this instruction also to a transcription by the original composer.

Construct the authorized access point by combining (in this order):

- the authorized access point representing the original work (see 6.28.1 RDA) or part or parts of the work (see 6.28.2 RDA), as applicable
- the term arranged.

**EXAMPLE**

Berlioz, Hector, 1803–1869. Le corsaire; arranged

Resource described: The corsaire: overture for concert band / transcribed by Gunther Schuller. Transcription of a Berlioz overture composed originally for orchestra

Respighi, Ottorino, 1879–1936. Gli uccelli, arranged
**Resource described:** The birds / Respighi. Arranged for Japanese instruments by H. Okano.

Schubert, Franz, 1797–1828. Octet, clarinet, horn, bassoon, violins, viola, violoncello, double bass, D. 803, F major; arranged

**Resource described:** Grosses Octet für zwei Violinen, Viola, Violoncello, Contrabass, Horn, Fagott und Clarinette, op. 166 / componirt von Franz Schubert; Arrangement für das Pianoforte zu vier Händen bearbeitet von S. Leithner. Arranged for piano, four hands.

Ravel, Maurice, 1875–1937. Pavane pour une infante défunte; arranged

**Resource described:** Pavane pour une infante défunte : pour petit orchestre / Maurice Ravel. Originally for piano; transcription by the composer.

Satie, Erik, 1866–1925. Piano music. Selections; arranged

**Resource described:** Pièces pour guitare / Erik Satie. Selected piano works by Satie. transcribed for guitar.

**Exception**

For an arrangement, transcription etc., of a work or part or parts of a work that belong, broadly speaking, to the category of music in the “popular” idiom (e.g., rock, jazz), add arranged to the authorized access point for the work or part or parts of the work only if the resource being described is:

- an instrumental work arranged for vocal or choral performance
  
  or

- a vocal work arranged for instrumental performance.

**EXAMPLE**

MacDermot, Galt. Hair; arranged


Townshend, Pete. Songs. Selections; arranged

**Resource described:** Who's serious : symphonic music of the Who. Selected rock songs by Townshend arranged for orchestra.

Brubeck, Dave. Blue rondo à la Turk; arranged

**Resource described:** Blue rondo à la Turk : SSAATBB a cappella / music, Dave Brubeck ; arr. Ward Swingle. Originally written for jazz quartet; arranged for unaccompanied mixed chorus.

John, Elton. Candle in the wind; arranged

**Resource described:** Candle in the wind / music by Elton John ; words by Bernie Taupin ; arranged by Michael Sweeney. Song arranged for jazz ensemble.

**but**

Resource described: Hoagy Carmichael: a choral portrait: for S.A.B. voices and piano with optional guitar, bass, drums, and vibraphone / music by Hoagy Carmichael; arranged by Robert Sterling. Selected songs by Carmichael arranged for accompanied choral performance

Brubeck, Dave. Blue rondo à la Turk
Resource described: Blue rondo à la Turk / Dave Brubeck: arranged for string quartet by Jeremy Cohen. Originally written for jazz quartet

Deep river
Authorized access point for: Deep river / transcription by Hugo Frey. An arrangement for voice and piano of the spiritual

Add one or more of the following elements, as appropriate, if needed to distinguish the access point for the expression from one that represents a different expression:

a) the content type (see 6.9)
b) the date of expression (see 6.10)
c) the language of expression (see 6.11)
   and/or
d) another distinguishing characteristic of the musical expression (see 6.18).

EXAMPLE

Berlioz, Hector, 1803-1869. Les nuits d'été: arranged. Vocal score
Resource described: Les nuits d'été: six mélodies avec un petit orchestre / Hector Berlioz; edited by Ian Kemp. — Vocal score / Douglas Woodfull-Harris. Originally for voice and piano, revised and orchestrated by the composer; orchestra accompaniment arranged for piano

Berlioz, Hector, 1803-1869. Les nuits d'été: arranged (Voice and chamber ensemble)
Resource described: Les nuits d'été / Hector Berlioz; edited for voice and chamber ensemble by Philip West.

Beethoven, Ludwig van, 1770-1827. Symphonies, no. 6, op. 68, F major; arranged (Sitt)

Beethoven, Ludwig van, 1770-1827. Symphonies, no. 6, op. 68, F major; arranged (Pauer)
Resource described: Symphony no. 6, op. 68: (Pastorale) / L. van Beethoven: arranged by E. Pauer

6.28.3.43 Sketches

For an expression of a work or part or parts of a work consisting of a composer’s sketches, construct the authorized access point by combining (in this order):

a) the authorized access point representing the completed work
b) the term Sketches.
[examples omitted; note that the examples with “strings” as the medium of performance will be fixed in the October release of the RDA Toolkit]

Add one or more of the following elements, as appropriate, if needed to distinguish the access point for the expression from one that represents a different expression:

a) the content type (see 6.9)
b) the date of expression (see 6.10)
c) the language of expression (see 6.11)
   and/or
d) another distinguishing characteristic of the musical expression (see 6.18).

6.28.3.54 Vocal and Chorus Scores

For a vocal or chorus score, construct the authorized access point by combining (in this order):

a) the authorized access point representing the work (see 6.28.1) or part or parts of the work (see 6.28.2)

b) one of the following terms, as applicable:

   Vocal score
   Vocal scores
   Chorus score
   Chorus scores.

EXAMPLE

Handel, George Frideric, 1685–1759. Messiah. Vocal score
Wagner, Richard, 1813–1883. Operas. Vocal scores

Add one or more of the following elements, as appropriate, if needed to distinguish the access point for the expression from one that represents a different expression:

a) the content type (see 6.9)
b) the date of expression (see 6.10)
c) the language of expression (see 6.11)
   and/or
d) another distinguishing characteristic of the musical expression (see 6.18).

EXAMPLE

Haydn, Joseph, 1732-1809. Die Schöpfung. Vocal score. English
Resource described: The creation : an oratorio / the music by Joseph Haydn. A vocal score translated into English

Haydn, Joseph, 1732-1809. Die Schöpfung. Vocal score. French
Resource described: La création du monde : oratorio / composé par Joseph Haydn. A vocal score translated into English

Resource described: Away with melancholy : a favorite air and duet / composed by W. Mozart. A vocal score translated into English

Mozart, Wolfgang Amadeus, 1756-1791. Die Zauberflöte. Das klinget so herrlich. Vocal score. Italian
Resource described: Oh cara armonia / W.A. Mozart. A vocal score translated into Italian.

LC note: We do not think the initial article "The" is part of the commonly known title for Messiah. We have verified that it is not in several resources embodying the work, reference sources, and the digitized version of Haydn's 1741 manuscript. We agree to add the initial article to The Mikado.