

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Kathy Glennan, ALA Representative
Subject: Discussion paper: Mixture of work level and manifestation level in RDA 2.3.2.6 (Collective Title and Titles of Individual Contents), Optional Additions

ALA thanks DNB for their analysis of the optional additions in RDA 2.3.2.6, *Collective Title and Titles of Individual Contents*. While we concur that the current phrasing presents some conceptual problems, we do not endorse either of the suggested options. We offer the following comments along with a recommendation to revise RDA 2.3.2.6.1 and 2.3.2.6.2 to address DNB's concerns.

RDA 2.3.2.6 contains instructions about when to record the collective title as the title proper, and when to record the title of the content being described as the title proper. The optional additions provide a reference to instructions about how to record the relationship between the resource and its parts. ALA believes that any revisions needed to clarify the issues in the discussion paper should be resolved in the relationship chapters (RDA 24-28), rather than by adding language to Chapter 2.

This situation is similar to the final paragraph added to 2.7.4.3, 2.8.4.3, 2.9.4.3, and 2.10.4.3 as a result of 6JSC/LC/24; these revisions were published as part of the April 2014 RDA Update. For example:

2.8.4.3, *Recording Publishers' Names*

For instructions on recording the relationship to the publisher, see 21.3.

ALA observes that the relationship mentioned in the optional additions in 2.3.2.6 is conceptually not limited to a related work, in spite of the fact that the existing reference is to 25.1, *Basic Instructions on Recording Relationships to Related Works*. Indeed, we believe that it should be possible to use any of the FRBR Group 1 entities, depending on the situation. Changing the reference to an appropriate instruction in Chapter 24 should enable that flexibility.

Keeping these observations in mind, ALA recommends changing the optional additions in 2.3.2.6.1 and 2.3.2.6.2 to "regular" paragraphs in those sub-instructions, following the model in 2.7.4.3 [etc.].

Marked-up copy:

2.3.2.6.1 Comprehensive Description

If:

the type of description chosen for the resource is a comprehensive description (see 1.5.2)

and

the resource has a source of information for the title proper with both a collective title and the titles of individual contents within the resource

then:

record the collective title as the title proper.

[examples unchanged]

~~**Optional Addition**~~

~~Record the titles of the individual contents as titles of related works (see [25.1](#)).~~

~~For instructions on recording the relationship to the individual contents, see [24.4](#).~~

2.3.2.6.2 Analytical Description

If:

the type of description chosen for the resource is an analytical description (see [1.5.3](#))

and

the resource has a source of information for the title proper with both the title of the content being described and a collective title for the larger resource

then:

record the title of the content being described as the title proper.

[examples unchanged]

~~**Optional Addition**~~

~~Record the collective title for the larger resource as the title of a related work (see [25.1](#)).~~

Exception

If the title of the individual content being described is insufficient to identify the manifestation, record the collective title for the larger resource, followed by the title of the content being described (see [2.3.1.7](#))

For instructions on recording the relationship to the larger resource, see [24.4](#).

Clean copy:

2.3.2.6.1 Comprehensive Description

If:

the type of description chosen for the resource is a comprehensive description (see [1.5.2](#))

and

the resource has a source of information for the title proper with both a collective title and the titles of individual contents within the resource

then:

record the collective title as the title proper.

[examples unchanged]

For instructions on recording the relationship to the individual contents, see [24.4](#).

2.3.2.6.2 Analytical Description

If:

the type of description chosen for the resource is an analytical description (see [1.5.3](#))

and

the resource has a source of information for the title proper with both the title of the content being described and a collective title for the larger resource

then:

record the title of the content being described as the title proper.

[examples unchanged]

Exception

If the title of the individual content being described is insufficient to identify the manifestation, record the collective title for the larger resource, followed by the title of the content being described (see [2.3.1.7](#))

For instructions on recording the relationship to the larger resource, see [24.4](#).