

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA

From: Alan Danskin, Chair, JSC

Subject: Issues deferred until after the first release of RDA - Review by other interested parties - Germany

These are comments on the issues deferred until after the first release of RDA received from the German National Library, Deutsche Nationalbibliothek.

Office for Library Standards (AfS)

June 30, 2010

According to our opinion most of the issues mentioned in JSC's document need further discussion. For this reason, we assigned a priority to each of the issues raised, and in most cases – especially when we assigned the priority "high", indicated into which direction we would like to see the respective instruction. We would be ready to prepare proposals for instructions if JSC wanted us to do so.

Chapter	Title / Instruction	Current RDA instruction number	Priority	Comments
Chapter 1	Change from single unit to multipart monograph	1.6.1	low	
	Transcription of letters or words intended to be read more than once	1.7.7	medium	
Chapter 2	Transcription	Chapter 2	medium	
	Description of a multipart monograph or serial	Chapter 2	medium	
	Changes over time	Chapter 2	medium	
	Preferred source of information and collective title	2.2.2	medium	
	Use of square brackets	2.2.4	medium	
	Inaccuracies in the title of a serial or integrating resource	2.3.1.4	high	We recommend retaining the exception (important to avoid title splits for serials).
	Names of persons, families, and corporate bodies	2.3.1.5	low	

	Introductory words	2.3.1.6	high	See also German comments on RDA Full draft: The German National Library would appreciate as a key rule that names (including titles) shall not be modified in spelling, punctuation, spacing, completeness (including initial articles), or its natural order, but that the name shall be recorded in the form as given in the respective source of information.
	Use of full form of serial title over an acronym or initialism	2.3.2.5	high	We recommend retaining the exception (important to avoid title splits for serials).
	Other title information for moving image resources	2.3.4.6	low	
	Devised titles for music	2.3.2.11.1 (2.3.11.4 in full draft)	medium	We agree to delete the instructions on devised titles for music; the general instruction is adequate.
	Designation of edition	2.5.2	medium	We agree to merge Designation of edition and Designation of a named revision of an edition.
	Use of "issues or parts of a serial"	2.6.1.1	low	In order to avoid misunderstandings we recommend pointing out in the preface that "parts of a serial" is implicit in "issues of a serial".
	Use of "new series" and "second series"	2.12.10.4	medium	We recommend retaining the current rule: "new series" and "second series" should be recorded in combination with the numbering as it is currently used and intended in RDA. "new series" and "second series" should not be treated as subseries or as numbering of unnumbered subseries.
Chapter 3	Plates	3.4.5.9	low	
	Recording extent of three-dimensional forms	3.4.6.2	low	

	Base material and applied material for sound recordings	3.6 and 3.7	medium	We recommend referring to already registered vocabularies as well. Communities developing and maintaining vocabularies relevant for RDA are, beside others: IASA - International Association of Sound and Audiovisual Archives - Technical Committee The National Recording Preservation Board at the Library of Congress AES - The Audio Engineering Society EBU - European Broadcast Union MPEG - Moving Pictures Experts Group
	Production method for sound recordings	3.9	medium	We recommend referring to already registered vocabularies as well.
	Production method for manuscripts	3.9.2.3	medium	We recommend referring to already registered vocabularies as well.
	Resolution of video images	3.18.1.4 (3.18.1.3 in full draft)	medium	We recommend referring to already registered vocabularies as well.
	Encoding format	3.19.3	medium	We recommend referring to already registered vocabularies as well.
	Zoom factor/Enlargement ratio	Chapter 3	medium	
Chapter 4	Missing elements	Chapter 4	medium	We agree with the proposal to cover also other 'obtaining' metadata at the item level in this chapter, such as call numbers, holdings and location data and phone numbers.
	URLs	4.6	high	See also German comments on RDA Full draft: We suggest adding the possibility of including a note or explanation with the URL, e.g. full text, table of contents, ...

Chapter 5	Other style manuals	Chapter 5	low	
Chapter 6	Initial articles	6.2.1.7	high	<p>See also German comments on RDA Full draft: We think that initial articles should be recorded in any case. For the sorting in an OPAC or a bibliography the initial article can be skipped. The omission of initial articles can often cause grammatical nonsense in inflected languages. For example, in the German language the adjective changes if one omits the article.</p> <p>Example: "Der seidene Faden" would be "Seidener Faden" without the article.</p> <p>The omission of initial articles can also imply a compound where it is not.</p> <p>MARC 21 and other formats provide non-sorting characters to handle display and sorting of the data different.</p>
	Conventional collective titles	6.2.2.10 (6.2.2.11 in full draft)	medium	
	Form of work	6.3.1	high	The German community suggested such a list in their comments on RDA Full draft.
	Place of origin of the work	6.5	No priority assigned	See also German comments on RDA Full draft: The country as the place of origin of the work should be preferred, ideally using a country code following ISO 3166-1.
	Content type	6.9 (6.10 in full draft)	high	See also German comments on RDA Full draft: Unambiguousness is important for data exchange and a definition or even a code might help to bring together different language terms. Local systems should be expected to resolve a code into an intelligible term.

	Musical works	Chapter 6	high	Comments on specific rules see annex 1, p. 15
	"Laws, etc.," "Treaties, etc.," and "Protocols, etc."	6.19 (6.20 in full draft); 6.29.1.33	medium	We agree with the proposal to define the terms.
	Bible	6.23.2.5	medium	We propose retaining the rules in RDA Full Draft. Comments on specific rules concerning „religious works“ (6.23.2.5 etc.) see annex 2, p. 18
	Bible – Apocrypha	6.23.2.6; 6.23.2.9.4	low	The proposal of ALA to differentiate between the different understanding of "Apocrypha" is reasonable.
	Bible – Year	6.24.1.4	low	
	Other distinguishing characteristics of the expression of a religious work	6.25.1.3	low	
	Bible – Version	6.25.1.4	low	
	When Composer and Librettist are the same	6.27	low	
	Use of "Lyrics" and "Texts"	new 6.27.4.2	low	We would prefer the use of "lyrics", because "text" is a broader term, not only used for music.
	Reports of one court	6.29.1.21	medium	
	Date of signing of a treaty	6.29.1.33, 6.29.3.2	medium	It is important to rule the date and the form of the date consistently.
	Expressions of religious works	6.30.3	low	
	Catholic liturgical works	6.30.3.5; 6.23.2.8	No priority assigned	
Chapter 7	Nature of the content	7.2	medium	
	Intended audience	7.7	medium	

	Type of illustrations	7.15	low	
	Illustrative content	7.15	low	
	Additional scale information	7.25.5.3, 2nd paragraph	low	
	Other details of cartographic content	7.27.1.3	low	
Chapter 8	Other style manual	Chapter 8	medium	
	Spacing of initials and acronyms	8.5.6	high	<p>See also German comments on RDA Full draft: The German National Library would appreciate as a key rule that names (including titles) shall not be modified in spelling, punctuation, spacing, completeness (including initial articles), or its natural order, but that the name shall be recorded in the form as given in the respective source of information. Modified forms may be recorded additionally as variant forms of the name, if needed.</p> <p>We agree that layout-based variations should be normalized.</p> <p>The guidelines given in 8.5.6 contradict with the ones given in 1.7.6</p>
Chapter 9	Change of name	9.2.2.7	medium	The intended changes need further consideration with regard to the possibly increasing number of splits.
	First part of the name is the surname	9.2.2.9	high	To remove the instruction on use of a comma for such names would be in accordance to the usage in some countries (e.g. China). To differentiate between the surname and the forename we recommend recording them as different elements i.e. in different subfields.
	Surname as first element	9.2.2.9	medium	

	Name that consists of a phrase/Additions to names	9.2.2.9; 9.2.2.22; 9.2.2.23	high	We agree, that the distinction between the different cases is not clear. It would be helpful to treat the cases in a consistent way. We prefer to record the name in direct order. Variants in the form "surname, forename" are possible, when helpful to retrieve the entity.
	Part of the name treated as a surname	9.2.2.9.2	high	We agree, that the distinction between the different cases is not clear. It would be helpful to treat the cases in a consistent way. We prefer to record the name in direct order. Variants in the form "surname, forename" are possible, when helpful to retrieve the entity.
	Persons known by a surname only	9.2.2.9.3	high	We agree, that the distinction between the different cases is not clear. It would be helpful to treat the cases in a consistent way. We prefer to record the name in direct order. Variants in the form "surname, forename" are possible, when helpful to retrieve the entity.
	Word or phrase included in the name	9.2.2.18	high	We agree, that the distinction between the different cases is not clear. It would be helpful to treat the cases in a consistent way. We prefer to record the name in direct order. Variants in the form "surname, forename" are possible, when helpful to retrieve the entity.
	Initial articles in phrases used as the names of persons	9.2.2.25; 9.2.2.26	medium	See similar aspect in chapter 6. MARC 21 and other formats provide non-sorting characters to handle display and sorting of the data different.
	Language and script for Alternative linguistic form of name	9.2.3.9	high	The German community recommends using codes (see also German comments on RDA Full draft).
	Other variant name	9.2.3.10	medium	

	Recording of month and day in date of birth	9.3.2.3	high	We recommend using the ISO standard.
	Other persons of religious vocation/Saints	9.4.1.8, 9.6.1.4	low	
	Field of Activity and Profession/Occupation	9.15 and 9.16	high	We do not agree in LC's proposal to merge the field of activity with Profession/occupation as this is not the same. A person may have a certain profession/occupation and a completely different field of activity.
Chapter 10	Family names not based on surnames	Chapter 10	low	We consider the general instructions on choosing the preferred name as sufficient.
	Estate or house names to distinguish names of families	Chapter 10, Chapter 16	low	The disambiguation should be achieved by other elements. If the family "Smith" just calls itself "Smith" this should be accepted. If the family is known as "The Park Hill Smiths" the general instruction would be adequate for a corresponding name/record. The name should not be created by the cataloguer.
	Controlled list of values for Type of family	10.3	low	Because the "type of family" is a core element, a standardized information (specification / instruction) would be reasonable.

Chapter 11	Separate instructions for government bodies and other corporate bodies	Chapter 11	high	<p>We agree with the ALA proposal to eliminate the distinction and to merge these two groups of instructions.</p> <p>See also German comments on RDA Full draft, p. 43f.: The guidelines in chapter 11 seem to be partly inconsistent with those in chapter 8 (especially concerning language and script) and contradictory.</p> <p>We prefer a clear general rule on how the corporate body should be recorded. We suggest that the many remaining specific case rules and all the remaining rules on punctuation and presentation formatting can be omitted.</p>
	Events	11.0	high	<p>We are not convinced of the approach to regard conferences as corporate bodies. We especially do not think it is justified to treat them as the creators of works. We tend to consider them as events which may have the character of works. We agree that there should be access points for conferences in the resource to which they are related to but would expect the rules for them either in chapter 6 (works) or in chapter 15 (events).</p> <p>The topic should be considered in context with chapter 15 "Identifying Events" (no draft yet).</p>
	Ancient and international bodies	11.2.2.5.4	low	
	Autocephalous Patriarchates, Archdiocese, etc.	11.2.2.5.4	medium	We recommend removing the exception.
	Initial articles	11.2.2.8	high	We recommend abandoning this rule (See also German comments on RDA Full draft). See similar aspect in chapter 6.

	Citations of honours	11.2.2.9	low	We recommend removing this rule.
	Terms indicating incorporation	11.2.2.10	medium	See also German comments on RDA Full draft. We strongly recommend abandoning this rule. The legal form of a company is a very significant name component, too important to be ignored. Changes in the legal form often affect the body's character more than changes in the wording of the name. It should be part of the citation form for the corporate body.
	Transliterated names for corporate bodies	11.2.2.12, 9.2.2.5	medium	See also German comments on RDA Full draft. The instructions in chapter 11.2.2.12 do not correspond to those in 8.4 and those in 11.2.2.5.2. According to 8.4 names should be recorded in the language and script in which they appear on the sources from which they are taken, preferably in the language and script of the content. The form in the language and script preferred by the agency creating the data is an alternative. Instructions on the preferred script for the preferred name should be added in 11.2.2.5.2. Therefore paragraph 11.2.2.12 could be omitted.
	Subordinate bodies	11.2.2.14	high	We would appreciate it not to omit any parts of the name. We would prefer the forms of names the body uses itself against artificially generated authorized heading.
	Joint Committees	11.2.2.16	low	
	Ruling executive bodies	11.2.2	low	
	Heads of state and Heads of government	11.2.2.21	medium	
	Subcommittees of the United States Congress	11.2.2.22.3	low	

	Qualifiers for courts	11.2.2.24.1	low	In German authority data files (GKD, SWD) standardized forms for courts do already exist.
	Armed forces	11.2.2.25.1	medium	We agree with the proposal to resolve discrepancies.
	Change of name of jurisdiction	11.3.3.4	low	We would prefer to retain the rules of the RDA Full Draft. The proposed handling as a name change would cause dispensable splits.
Chapter 16	Access points to represent places	Chapter 16	high	Guidelines for the preferred access point for the place are still missing. See also German comments on RDA Full draft concerning "places" (p. 51 f.).
	Additional uses for place names	16.2.2.4, 4th paragraph	low	
	Places in Australia, Canada, Malaysia, the United States, the U.S.S.R., or Yugoslavia	16.2.2.9	high	We do not understand the exceptions for explicitly these states. According to our practice the name of the larger jurisdiction is not part of the name of the smaller one. See also German comments on RDA Full draft concerning "places" (p. 51 f.).
	Identifiers for places	16.3 (16.5 in full draft)	high	We suggest including the authority control number of the particular national authority file as a required element. See also German comments on RDA Full draft concerning "places" (p. 51 f.).
Chapter 19	Corporate bodies as creators	19.2.1.1	high	We recommend using the same instructions for persons, families and corporate bodies. This would lead to less specific rules for corporate bodies and would facilitate the cataloguing process as the creator could be identified based on formal instead of content criteria.
	Jurisdiction governed and Issuing agency	19.3.2.2	low	

Appendices	<p>Appendix A – Capitalization</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Appendix as a whole - Unusual capitalization 	Appendix A	high	<p>See also German comments on RDA Full draft: The German National Library would appreciate as a key rule that names (including titles) shall not be modified in spelling, punctuation, spacing, completeness (including initial articles), or its natural order, but that the name shall be recorded in the form as given in the respective source of information. Modified forms may be recorded additionally as variant forms of the name, if needed. We agree that layout-based variations should be normalized.</p> <p><u>A.39 German</u> The note "Government agencies in Germany are reconsidering aspects of the orthographic reform officially introduced on August 1, 1998." is out-of-date and should be deleted.</p> <p><u>A.39.1 Nouns</u> In A.39.1 and A.39.2 the character "ß" is always represented by "ss". This does not correspond to our orthographic rules. The examples which are cited here only give a small extract of German orthographic conventions. A reference to the most current edition of the "Duden, Die Deutsche Rechtschreibung. Herausgegeben von der Dudenredaktion auf der Grundlage der neuen amtlichen Rechtschreibregeln. Ausgabe 24., völlig neu bearb. und erw. Aufl., 2006" would be more helpful than the small extract which does not cover all important orthographic cases.</p>
------------	--	------------	------	--

	<p>Appendix B – Abbreviations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Language scope - B.11 Names of Certain Countries, States, Provinces, Territories, etc. 	Appendix B	medium	<p>See also German comments on RDA Full draft: <u>B.5.9 Date</u> As other countries use different phrases for the B.C. and A.D. dates we recommend that a sentence regarding the national agency be added.</p> <p><u>B.7 Roman Alphabet Abbreviations</u> We suggest that the use of abbreviations in bibliographic records be omitted, unless they appear in the source of information itself.</p> <p>There are the same abbreviations for different terms, e.g. "bd." for "band" and "bind". The terms "alto", "baritone", "bass", "mezzo-soprano", "soprano", and "tenor" are abbreviations of voices. They should not be abbreviated along the lines of musical instruments.</p>
	<p>Appendix C – Initial articles</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Additions - Dialects 	Appendix C	high	<p>See also German comments on RDA Full draft: The German National Library would appreciate as a key rule that names (including titles) shall not be modified in spelling, punctuation, spacing, completeness (including initial articles), or its natural order, but that the name shall be recorded in the form as given in the respective source of information. Modified forms may be recorded additionally as variant forms of the name, if needed.</p>
	<p>Appendix F – Additional instructions on names of persons</p>	Appendix F	high	<p>See also German comments on RDA Full draft. Finnish and Russian is missing. In general we would like to note that we do have much more detailed guidelines for the names from foreign language areas especially in view of Chinese, Indic, or Thai names. We propose e.g. guidelines for Chinese religious names. The additional instructions in this chapter are too general.</p>

	Appendix G – Titles of Nobility, terms of rank - Germany - Sweden	Appendix G	high	
	Appendix H – Dates in the Christian calendar	Appendix H	high	
	Appendix J - Relationship designators: Relationships between works, expressions, manifestations, and items	Appendix J	high	
	Appendix K – Relationship designators: Relationships between persons, families, and corporate bodies	Appendix K	high	
RDA Glossary	RDA Glossary	RDA Glossary	high	In our comments to the full draft, we proposed a couple of terms that we think should be included in the Glossary as well.
Multiple instructions	Instructions on sources of information		medium	
	Repetition of text in instructions		medium	
	Repetition of element name		medium	
	Non-Latin Script examples		medium	
	Use of ISO standards		high	We support the request of more use of ISO standards, e.g., for dates, countries, currency, also for the representation of names of languages (ISO 639, incl. all parts), the representation of names of scripts (ISO 15924) and the representation of human sexes (ISO 5218).
	Finding of objects		medium	
	Definition of “expression”		medium	
	Access points for manifestations and items		medium	
	Dates associated with an element		medium	
	Legal works (various chapters)		medium	
	Simplification of special rules in AACR2 chapters 22-26		No priority assigned	
	Gap analysis with encoding standards		high	
	Archival cataloguing and Museum practice		medium	
	Review Chair follow-ups to 5JSC/RDA/Full draft		medium	
	IEEE LOM		low	
	Complete examples		high	

Annex 1: Comments on “Musical works” (Current RDA instruction numbers: Chapter 6)

- **Internationalize the approach to musical works in RDA so as to reduce, if not eliminate, Western bias**
and
- **at the same time - limit the time energy involved to produce data**

0.10.2 Language and Script

Will the JSC advise the national agencies with respect to language and script, and/or will they deliver regular updates of the lists of controlled vocabulary of RDA? Or will the list be an integrating resource?

in combination with:

6.3 Form of Work

We recommend recording the form of a work by using a list of controlled vocabulary. Translations of the terms in different languages should be taken into account. As unambiguity is important for data exchange, a definition or even a code might help to bring together different language terms. A list of controlled vocabulary would help to achieve the RDA goal of interoperability.

in combination with:

6.18 Preferred title for a musical work

6.18.0 Basic instructions on preferred titles for musical works

6.18.0.2 Sources of information

6.18.0.2.2

We suggest adding as a preferred source of information reliable authority files. As it is easy to read over the information that reference sources should be used as the primary source of information we suggest restructuring 6.18.0.2.2 in the following way:

- 6.18.0.2.2 Determine the title to be used as the preferred title for a musical work created before 1501 from modern sources (in this order of preference):
- a) reference sources
 - b) modern editions
 - c) early editions
 - d) manuscript copies

6.18.0.3 Choosing the preferred title

There is an inconsistency between 6.18.0.2.1 and 6.18.0.3.1. The preferred title for a musical work should be taken from resources embodying the work or reference sources according to 6.18.0.2.1. In 6.18.0.3.1 the composer's original title in the language in which it was presented should be taken as the preferred title. Because of the internationality of western classical music and for an international data exchange we ask for an internationally binding dictionary of works. When choosing the preferred title, an authority file or the dictionary of works should be consulted first (in this order of preference). If the title is not included in there, the composer's original title in the language in which it was presented should be chosen.

6.18.1 Preferred title consisting solely of the name of one type of composition

We assume that the name can be recorded in singular when the composer wrote only one work of the type according to 6.18.1.1. We like to note that it can be time consuming, difficult and in some cases not obvious whether a composer wrote only one work of that type. We recommend using the plural in any case.

6.20 Medium of performance

6.20.0 Basic instructions on recording medium of performance

6.20.0.5 Standard combinations of instruments

We cannot comprehend the instrument combinations made in 6.20.0.5.1. We think that it is better to record the instruments for chamber music as these terms for standard combinations are not common to everyone / not internationally used.

6.21 Numeric designation

6.21.0 Basic instructions on recording numeric designations

6.21.0.3 Recording numeric designations

We generally want to record the opus number as a required element, as long as it is included in the dictionary of work.

- Clarify the approach to adaptations and arrangements and when modifications to a musical work results in a new work:

6.1.1.2.3 - 6.1.1.2.7.

We wonder whether there are further exceptions besides moving images and serials and whether these exceptions are still justified.

We would like to know if the guidelines given in 6.1.1.2.3 are also valid for musical works (operas, musicals, ballets, concerts, video clips). If so we ask for differentiating between moving images of stage entertainments and movies based on a musical work. Regarding the opera "Carmen" there are DVDs with the original picturized stage entertainment and the movie with J. Migenes and P. Domingo from Francesco Rossi which is something totally different from the original version.

6.17.1.5 Adaptations of musical works

In 6.17.1.5.3 the information is given to follow the instructions under 6.1.1.2 if two or more composers have collaborated in the adaptation. There is no guideline in chapter 6.17 or 6.18 saying what to do if a work is a collaborative work of two or more composers.

- Give a standardized identifier for the work:

6.10 Identifier for the work

We suggest including the authority control number of the particular national authority file as required element. We also suggest including an example for an URI. Regarding musical works we suggest to include the "ISWC – International Standard Work Code"

- Clarify the situations of popular music:

6.17.1 Preferred access point representing a musical work

6.17.1.1 Musical works with lyrics, libretto, text, etc.

We assume that modern popular music is covered in chapter 6.17.1.1. If so it is absolutely necessary to include more examples for modern popular music. We also recognized that the preferred access point representing the work is constructed by combining the composer of the music and the preferred title for the work. Does this also count for musical works of interpreters? In those cases the composer is not necessarily known. In the former Part A, rev. Chapter 6.4 "performers" where mentioned.

Annex 2: Comments on specific instructions for religious works

The issues concerning religious works raised in the document 6JSC/Sec/1 are of low priority for the German/Austrian community whereas the following comments to the instructions given twice before are of great importance for us. We would appreciate JSC to comment on these issues.

6.23.2.8 / 6.30.1.5

We think that constructing the preferred access point representing the work by combining the preferred access point for the church or denominational body and the preferred title as mentioned in 6.30.1.5 is not useful. We suppose that there are many liturgical works where an allocation to a specific corporate body is vague or ambiguous. Instead of that, we suggest that a corporate body should be added only when constructing the variant access point and only if the allocation of the work to a church or denominational body is unambiguous.

Additionally the orientation of the preferred title for the work to a well-established title in that language - if there is one - is different from the otherwise used choosing of the preferred title before choosing the „primary access point“.

6.23.2.8 Exceptions: Early Catholic liturgical works

It seems to be not practicable to use the Tridentine title if a Catholic liturgical work compiled before the Council of Trent (1545-1563) has a close counterpart in a Tridentine work as instructed in 6.23.2.8. We appreciate the part „If such a work has no close counterpart among Tridentine liturgical works, or in case of doubt, use the title by which the work is identified in reference sources“.

The example contradicts the rule. The Tridentine title for „Missale ad usum isignis Ecclesi[a]e Sarum“ is „Missale“ instead of „Missal.“

6.23.2.9.2

We consider recording a part or parts of a sacred scripture as a subdivision of the preferred title for the Bible as a disadvantage as it creates hierarchies. Furthermore, it seems to be an inconsistency that a work which is commonly identified by its own title, viz. single selections in 6.23.2.9.5, is not recorded as a subdivision of the preferred title for the Bible. Therefore, we recommend recording all titles of parts of sacred scriptures just as the “single selections” in 6.23.2.9.5, viz. not as a subdivision of “Bible”.

6.23.2.9.2

In view of the correct automatic sorting, the use of Roman numerals for adding a chapter as instructed in 6.23.2.9 does not seem useful. In accordance to the international customary quotation among theologians we recommend adding the chapter in Arabic numerals as well.

6.25.1.4 The Bible and Parts of the Bible

The guideline to use a short form of the translator’s name as mentioned in 6.25.1.4 seems to be problematic for us. The suggested short forms, e.g. Lamsa is not very widely known in Germany. We would prefer, e.g. Lamsa, Bible.