

**To:** Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA  
**From:** Kathy Glennan, ALA Representative  
**Subject:** Revision to instructions for Adaptations and Revisions (6.27.1.5)

ALA thanks LC for this proposal to clarify the instructions for adaptations and revisions in RDA 6.27.1.5. We agree with the analysis of the problem and support clarifying this instruction. We offer the following comments on the proposal and also offer a different approach.

### **Comments on the proposed revision**

ALA can accept the proposed revision, although we have a few editorial suggestions.

#### **6.27.1.5:**

In the 1<sup>st</sup> paragraph, ALA recommends making this a simple sentence, since the “and” clause has been removed:

If an adaptation or revision of a previously existing work substantially changes the nature and content of that work, treat the adaptation or revision as a new work.

In the new if/then paragraph, the Oxford comma needs to be added after “family” in the “and” clause.

#### **6.27.1.5.3:**

In the title of the instruction, “the” should be removed:

Creators Responsible for Adapting Their Own Work

ALA does not agree with adding the final paragraph and example. This repeats the instruction in 6.27.1.1, and we assume it already applies here. If it does not, the same paragraph needs to be added to other 6.27.1 sub-instructions.

### **Alternative approach**

A majority of ALA respondents would prefer to lessen the repetition and not create the new sub-instructions. We offer the following counter-proposal that:

- 1) completely replaces 6.27.1.5
- 2) adds an explicit paragraph at the beginning that addresses a creator revising or adapting his or her original work
- 3) makes references to existing instructions rather than repeating them
- 4) incorporates most of the new examples suggested by LC
- 5) provides an additional example in the final example box to illustrate a new expression with a different title.

*Proposed revision – clean copy only – to replace all of the existing 6.27.1.5*

## 6.27.1.5 Adaptations and Revisions

Apply this instruction to:

- works revised or adapted by the original creator
- works revised or adapted by persons, families, or corporate bodies who are not the original creator.

If an adaptation or revision of a previously existing work substantially changes the nature and content of that work, treat the adaptation or revision as a new work.

If one person, family, or corporate body is responsible for the new work, construct the authorized access point by applying the instructions at [6.27.1.2](#).

### EXAMPLE

Gray, Patsey. J.R.R. Tolkien's *The hobbit*

A dramatization by Gray of Tolkien's novel

Sartain, John, 1808–1897. *Artist's dream*

An engraving by Sartain based on an original painting by George H. Comegys

James, W. Martin. *Historical dictionary of Angola*

A new edition by James based on Susan H. Broadhead's work with the same title

Konrad, der Pfaffe, active 12th century. *Das Rolandslied*

An adaptation of the anonymous work *La chanson de Roland*

Chevat, Richie. *The omnivore's dilemma*

An adaptation for children of the work *The omnivore's dilemma* by Michael Pollan

Varley, John, 1947 August 9- . *Millennium*

A novel adapted from the short story *Air raid* by Varley

Chekhov, Anton Pavlovich, 1860-1904. *Díadía Vaníá*

A play adapted from the play *Leshii* by Chekhov. Chekhov removed over half the characters in *Leshii* and substantially changed the plot

Solo, Hope, 1981- . *Hope Solo*

An adaptation for children of the autobiography *Solo*

Hugo, Victor, 1802-1885. *La Esmeralda*

A libretto adapted from the novel *Notre-Dame de Paris* by Hugo

If more than one person, family, or corporate body is responsible for the new work, construct the authorized access point by applying the instructions at [6.27.1.3](#).

### EXAMPLE

Stern, Stephen L. *Beowulf*

**Resource described:** *Beowulf* : the graphic novel / writer, Stephen L. Stern ; artist, Christopher Steininger. **A graphic novel adaptation of the anonymous epic poem** *Beowulf*

Abrams, Anthony. *Dead man on campus*

**Resource described:** *Dead man on campus* / a novelization by tony Abrams and Adam Broder. **An adaptation of the motion picture** *Dead man on campus*

If the person, family, or corporate body responsible for the new work is unknown or uncertain, construct the authorized access point by applying the instructions at [6.27.1.8](#).

**EXAMPLE**

Engineering response to global climate change

**Resource described:** Engineering response to global climate change / edited by Robert G. Watts

If the work is presented simply as an edition of the previously existing work, treat it as an expression of that work. Use the authorized access point representing the previously existing work. If it is considered important to identify the particular expression, construct an authorized access point representing the expression as instructed at [6.27.3](#).

**EXAMPLE**

Carroll, Bradley W. Introduction to modern astrophysics

**Authorized access point representing the first edition of a work by Bradley W. Carroll and Dale A. Ostlie**

Carroll, Bradley W. Introduction to modern astrophysics

**Authorized access point representing the second edition of the work by the same authors**

Greene, John Robert, 1955- . The presidency of George Bush

**Resource described:** The presidency of George H.W. Bush / John Robert Greene. – Second edition, revised and expanded. **Previous edition published under the title:** The presidency of George Bush

For additional instructions on authorized access points representing adaptations of musical works, see [6.28.1.5–6.28.1.6](#).