

TO: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA

FROM: Dave Reser, LC Representative

SUBJECT: Revision to instructions for Adaptations and Revisions (6.27.1.5)

The constituency responses to 6JSC/LC/33 showed agreement on these issues:

- modifying the first paragraph to clarify that adaptations and revisions resulting in new works can be the work of the same creator or a different creator
- removing the Exceptions
- providing instructions on constructing the authorized access point for the new work if it is the result of one creator, multiple creators, or if the creator is unknown or uncertain.

ACOC, CCC, and DNB offered minor suggestions for changes, and ALA offered both minor suggestions and an Alternative approach.

LC is agreeable to accepting our original proposal with all the suggestions listed in the next paragraph and other minor editorial changes (deleting word “the” in the caption title for 6.27.1.5.3 and adding commas). However, LC is also agreeable to a modified version of ALA’s Alternative Approach that creates no new sub-instructions for 6.27.1.5.

We have presented a proposed revision based on ALA’s Alternative Approach that also incorporates the following suggestions from constituents:

- turns the If/then construction to a regular sentence (ALA and CCC)
- removes the paragraph and Williams example referencing 6.27.1.9 because it is covered by 6.27.1.1 (ALA and CCC)
- removes the phrase “is presented as” that is part of the current 6.27.1.5 and was retained in our proposal (CCC)
- removes reference to 6.27.3 because that is already done in 6.27.1.1 (DNB).

We disagreed with the following issues presented in ALA’s Alternative Approach:

- The wording proposed by ALA to refer to 6.27.1.2, 6.27.1.3, and 6.27.1.8 is ambiguous about which authorized access point is being constructed—the one for the new work that is the result of the adaptation, or the original work. This has been one of our problems in understanding the current instructions at 6.27.1.5 (wording is proposed below to alleviate this).
- Moving and modifying the example for *Engineering response to global climate change* to attempt to fit a different situation. We believe ALA misread this example, which showed a title change between the first edition (*Engineering response to global climate change*) and the second edition (*Engineering response to climate change*). This is an example of a different expression of the same work, not an example of a new work that is the work of an unknown creator. The Examples Editor has provided a different example of a title change between

editions that should be more obvious. She has also provided an example of an anonymous new work adapted from another work.

The following minor changes are different from ALA's approach:

- uses singular of "work" in first paragraph, reverses order of "revised" and "adapted" to match caption, and adds "or"
- add run-in subheads to 6.27.1.5 to improve readability of this lengthy instruction and allows the cataloger to find the appropriate section easily
- show 2 captioned example boxes for the works of creator (New Work by the Original Creator and New Work by a Different Creator)
- adds a sentence in each new work situation to clarify that the preferred title of the adaptation or revision is used when constructing its authorized access point
- moves the paragraph about "simply an edition of the existing work" to be the second paragraph because that seems the more common situation than an adaptation resulting in a new work. (Note: if the JSC prefers to retain the paragraph in its current location, we are agreeable to that.)

The following changes are based on comments from JSC constituents. Mark-up is based on the existing RDA text.

Proposed Revision using ALA's Alternative Approach

6.27.1.5 Adaptations and Revisions

Apply this instruction to:

a work adapted or revised by the original creator

or

a work adapted or revised by persons, families, or corporate bodies who are not the original creator.

If the work is presented simply as an edition of the previously existing work, treat it as an expression of that work. Use the authorized access point representing the previously existing work.

EXAMPLE

Carroll, Bradley W. Introduction to modern astrophysics

Authorized access point representing the first edition of a work by Bradley W. Carroll and Dale A. Ostlie

Carroll, Bradley W. Introduction to modern astrophysics

Authorized access point representing the second edition of the work by the same authors

Handbook of crisis and emergency management

Resource described: Crisis and emergency management : theory and practice / edited by Ali Farazmand. — Second edition. **First edition published under the title:** Handbook of crisis and emergency management

If:

~~one person, family, or corporate body is responsible for an adaptation or revision of a previously an adaptation or revision of an existing work, that substantially changes the nature and content of that work~~

and

~~the adaptation or revision is presented as the work of that person, family, or body~~

then:

~~construct the authorized access point representing the new work by combining (in this order):~~

~~a) the authorized access point representing the person (see 9.19.1), family (see 10.11.1), or corporate body (see 11.13.1) responsible for the adaptation or revision, as applicable~~

~~b) the preferred title for the adaptation or revision (see 6.2.2).~~

~~treat the adaptation or revision as a new work.~~

One creator. ~~If one person, family, or corporate body is responsible for the new work, construct the authorized access point representing the new work by applying the instructions at 6.27.1.2. Use the preferred title of the adaptation or revision when constructing the authorized access point.~~

EXAMPLE

New Work by the Original Creator

Varley, John, 1947 August 9– . Millennium

A novel adapted from the short story Air raid by Varley

Chekhov, Anton Pavlovich, 1860–1904. Diadia Vania

A play adapted from the play Leshii by Chekhov. Chekhov removed over half the characters in Leshii and substantially changed the plot

Solo, Hope, 1981– . Hope Solo

An adaptation for children of the autobiography Solo

Hugo, Victor, 1802–1885. La Esmeralda

A libretto adapted from the novel Notre-Dame de Paris by Hugo

EXAMPLE

New Work by a Different Creator

Gray, Patsey. J.R.R. Tolkien's The hobbit

A dramatization by Gray of Tolkien's novel

Vande Velde, Vivian. Tales from the Brothers Grimm and the Sisters Weird

A parody by Vande Velde of some of Grimm's fairy tales

Sartain, John, 1808–1897. Artist's dream

An engraving by Sartain based on an original painting by George H. Comegys

James, W. Martin. Historical dictionary of Angola

~~A new edition~~ revision by James based on Susan H. Broadhead's work with the same title

Konrad, der Pfaffe, active 12th century. Das Rolandslied

An adaptation of the anonymous work La chanson de Roland

Chevat, Richie. The omnivore's dilemma

An adaptation for children of the work The omnivore's dilemma by Michael Pollan

Exceptions

~~**Adaptations and revisions of compilations of works by different persons, families, or corporate bodies.** If the work is an adaptation or revision of a compilation of works by different persons, families, or corporate bodies, apply the instructions at [6.27.1.4](#).~~

EXAMPLE

North American mammals

~~**Resource described:** North American mammals. **A Web adaptation of:** The Smithsonian book of North American mammals / edited by Don E. Wilson and Sue Ruff; **and of:** Mammals of North America / Roland W. Kays and Don E. Wilson~~

~~**Adaptations and revisions of works of uncertain or unknown origin.** If the work is an adaptation or revision of a work of uncertain or unknown origin, apply the instructions at [6.27.1.8](#).~~

~~**More than one creator.** If more than one person, family, or corporate body is responsible for the new work adaptation or revision, construct the authorized access point representing the new work by applying the instructions ~~apply the instructions on collaborative works~~ at [6.27.1.3](#). Use the preferred title of the adaptation or revision when constructing the authorized access point.~~

EXAMPLE

Abrams, Anthony. Dead man on campus

~~**Resource described:** Dead man on campus / a novelization by Tony Abrams and Adam Broder. An adaptation of the motion picture Dead man on campus~~

Stern, Stephen L. Beowulf

~~**Resource described:** Beowulf : the graphic novel / writer, Stephen L. Stern ; artist, Christopher Steininger. A graphic novel adaptation of the anonymous epic poem Beowulf~~

~~**Creator unknown or uncertain.** If the person, family, or corporate body responsible for creating the new work is unknown or uncertain, construct the authorized access point representing the new work by applying the instructions at [6.27.1.8](#). Use the preferred title of the adaptation or revision~~

when constructing the authorized access point.

EXAMPLE

Guerre comique

Adaptation of the anonymous work Battle of the frogs and mice

~~If the work is presented simply as an edition of the previously existing work, treat it as an expression of that work. Use the authorized access point representing the previously existing work. If it is considered important to identify the particular expression, construct an authorized access point representing the expression as instructed at 6.27.3.~~

EXAMPLE

~~Carroll, Bradley W. Introduction to modern astrophysics~~

~~Authorized access point representing the first edition of a work by Bradley W. Carroll and Dale A. Ostlie~~

~~Carroll, Bradley W. Introduction to modern astrophysics~~

~~Authorized access point representing the second edition of the work by the same authors~~

For additional instructions on authorized access points representing adaptations of musical works, see 6.28.1.5–6.28.1.6.

Clean Copy

6.27.1.5 Adaptations and Revisions

Apply this instruction to:

a work adapted or revised by the original creator

or

a work adapted or revised by persons, families, or corporate bodies who are not the original creator.

If the work is presented simply as an edition of the previously existing work, treat it as an expression of that work. Use the authorized access point representing the previously existing work.

EXAMPLE

Carroll, Bradley W. Introduction to modern astrophysics

Authorized access point representing the first edition of a work by Bradley W. Carroll and Dale A. Ostlie

Carroll, Bradley W. Introduction to modern astrophysics

Authorized access point representing the second edition of the work by the same authors

Handbook of crisis and emergency management

Resource described: Crisis and emergency management : theory and practice / edited by Ali Farazmand. — Second edition. **First edition published under the title:** Handbook of crisis and emergency management

If an adaptation or revision of an existing work substantially changes the nature and content of that work, treat the adaptation or revision as a new work.

One creator. If one person, family, or corporate body is responsible for the new work, construct the authorized access point representing the new work by applying the instructions at 6.27.1.2. Use the preferred title of the adaptation or revision when constructing the authorized access point.

EXAMPLE

New Work by the Original Creator

Varley, John, 1947 August 9– . Millennium

A novel adapted from the short story Air raid **by** Varley

Chekhov, Anton Pavlovich, 1860–1904. Dīādīā Vanīā

A play adapted from the play Leshīī **by** Chekhov. **Chekhov removed over half the characters in Leshīī and substantially changed the plot**

Solo, Hope, 1981– . Hope Solo

An adaptation for children of the autobiography Solo

Hugo, Victor, 1802–1885. La Esmeralda

A libretto adapted from the novel Notre-Dame de Paris **by** Hugo

EXAMPLE

New Work by a Different Creator

Gray, Patsey. J.R.R. Tolkien's The hobbit

A dramatization by Gray **of** Tolkien's novel

Sartain, John, 1808–1897. Artist's dream

An engraving by Sartain **based on an original painting by** George H. Comegys

James, W. Martin. Historical dictionary of Angola

A revision by James **based on** Susan H. Broadhead's work **with the same title**

Konrad, der Pfaffe, active 12th century. Das Rolandslied

An adaptation of the anonymous work La chanson de Roland

Chevat, Richie. The omnivore's dilemma

An adaptation for children of the work The omnivore's dilemma **by** Michael Pollan

More than one creator. If more than one person, family, or corporate body is responsible for the new work, construct the authorized access point representing the new work by applying the instructions at 6.27.1.3. Use the

preferred title of the adaptation or revision when constructing the authorized access point.

EXAMPLE

Abrams, Anthony. Dead man on campus

Resource described: Dead man on campus / a novelization by Tony Abrams and Adam Broder. **An adaptation of the motion picture** Dead man on campus

Stern, Stephen L. Beowulf

Resource described: Beowulf : the graphic novel / writer, Stephen L. Stern ; artist, Christopher Steininger. **A graphic novel adaptation of the anonymous epic poem** Beowulf

Creator unknown or uncertain. If the person, family, or corporate body responsible for creating the new work is unknown or uncertain, construct the authorized access point representing the new work by applying the instructions at 6.27.1.8. Use the preferred title of the adaptation or revision when constructing the authorized access point.

EXAMPLE

Guerre comique

Adaptation of the anonymous work Battle of the frogs and mice

For additional instructions on authorized access points representing adaptations of musical works, see 6.28.1.5–6.28.1.6.